Gender inclusiveness in student learning materials: Study of elementary school context in Indonesia

Indri Salsabila Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia Email: indrisabil@upi.edu

Anisa Rohmah Hasanah Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia E-mail: anisarohmahhasanah@upi.edu

Hendriyan Ihsan Mutakin Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia Email: hendriyanihsan@upi.edu

Triana Lestari Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia Email: trianalestari@upi.edu

Corresponding Author: anisarohmahhasanah@upi.edu

Abstract

This study intends to evaluate the gender inclusivity in learning and education research field's growth trend from 2013 to 2023. The steps of the research are as follows: (i) assembling the tools and materials; (ii) organizing meetings; (iii) screening; (iv) visualizing; and (v) reviewing the data and outcomes that have been published. There were 988 articles in the keyword search results for "Gender," "Inclusiveness," "Learning materials," "Elementary School," and "Indonesia." A more equal and inclusive learning environment for all students can be achieved by include gender in student learning materials, according to the research findings. Students are more likely to feel appreciated and respected when they recognize themselves in the learning materials. Additionally, it supports and equalizes constructive gender roles and works to dispel harmful gender stereotypes.

Keyword: Gender, Inklusivness, Learning Materials, Elementary School, Indonesia

INTRODUCTION

Gender equity has recently gained attention as a hot topic in Indonesian society and academic circles (Adamson in Mustafa, 2021). Both parties are unaware of the dominance of men over women; instead, injustice is accepted as normal. The interpretation of religious doctrine and gender inequality are used to justify a patriarchal cultural style that is accepted as natural and unquestionable (Adriany, 2019). In actuality, gender is a social construction that results from interactions with other people and is neither neutral nor devoid of values (Adriany, 2019; Osgood & Robinson, 2017; Sallee, 2011; Tosolt, 2009).

The inclusion of gender inclusiveness in educational units, especially at the elementary school level, is one of the most important elements in the effort to eradicate gender inequality and bias in education. Since they are between the ages of 6 and 12, children are mature learners at the elementary school level (Adriany, 2019). In

other words, the cultivation of gender-friendly values needs to be done from an early age. The planting of gender inclusiveness is carried out with the aim of preventing gender bias in the future. Gender inclusiveness in the field of education itself can be done in various ways such as providing equal access to education regardless of gender, gender-friendly curriculum regulations and learning materials based on gender inclusiveness. In Indonesia, the importance of gender inclusion in educational resources for students must be addressed.

Although awareness of gender equality is increasing in a global context, Still pervasive is gender discrimination and the representation of gender reflects this. in written materials, including textbooks used in elementary schools (Fithriani, 2021). This is a significant concern, as textbooks are the main source of instruction in Indonesia (Maesaroh et al., 2022).

There are several studies that show that unequal and stereotypical depictions of male and female gender in textbooks and learning materials are prevalent in Indonesia (Fithriani, 2021). This is problematic because textbooks play an important role in shaping students' perceptions of gender roles and identities. Therefore, it is important to ensure that student learning materials are gender inclusive and bias-free to promote gender equality and inclusiveness in education (Brief, 2013). As indicated in Table 1, there are various prior studies to determine research trends using bibliometric analysis in the field of education, related to gender representation in student learning materials. However, there is still little explanation of gender inclusiveness in primary school student learning materials in Indonesia. In many domains, including those listed in Table 2, bibliometrics has been utilized to understand current research trends. In this study, bibliometric analysis was used to examine how gender inclusivity in student learning resources is developing in Indonesian primary school context studies from 2013 to 2023. This research is expected to be taken into consideration for readers to understand the current condition of gender inclusiveness in student learning materials.

Table 1. Previous studies of bibliometric analysis in gender representation in student learning materials.

No	Topic Discussion	Educational Contribution		References
1.	Indonesian students' perceptions of gender equality in education and gender equality in the curriculum and the challenges and opportunities for promoting gender equality in education in Indonesia, as well as strategies to overcome gender bias in learning materials and teaching practices.	domains of gender equality in education, namely equality of access, opportunity equality for both the educational accomplishment and the	2013-2021	Mustofa et al. (2021)
2.	Presents a critical discourse analysis of an English textbook for the third grade of primary school in Indonesia, examining the gender representation in the textbook to discover whether or not it promotes gender equality.	by highlighting the importance of promoting gender equality in	2014-2021	Maesaroh et al. (2022)

No	Topic Discussion	Educational Contribution	Research Year	References
3.	Gender equality in mathematics classrooms in Indonesia and explore how gender norms and stereotypes influence the learning experiences of male and female students in mathematics classrooms.	Contribute to reducing poverty, promoting sustainable development, and building good governance in Indonesia by exploring the importance of gender equality in education.	2013-2018	Olsson et al. (2018)
4.	A critical analysis of gender portrayals in English textbooks for primary school students in Indonesia and abroad.	The important role that textbooks play in shaping gender roles and promoting gender equality.	2012-2022	Fithriani et al. (2022)
5.	Explores how gender is represented in school textbooks for the 2013 primary school curriculum aimed at grade one and how this may influence teaching practices for students.	~ · ·	2015-2023	Wahyudi et al. (2023)

Table 2. Previous studies of bibliometric analysis.

No	Title	Topic Discussion	Ref
1	Bibliometric methods in management and organization	This article develops a reference source for management and organizations interested in using bibliometrics.	× ž
2	, , ,	Analysis of internationally renowned business and management journals regarding impact, main topics, most active authors and country of origin using bibliometric methods.	
3	A review on Environmental Kuznets Curve hypothesis using bibliometric and meta-analysis	This review tracks historical trends in the Environmental Kuznets Curve (EKC) Hypothesis with VOSviewer software and meta-analytic methods with bibliometrics and meta-analysis.	Asumadu Sarkodie and
4	Tourism and its economic im- pact: A literature review using bibliometric tool	The research concerns a dynamic literature review method called 'Systematic Literature Network Analysis', which combines systematic literature review and bibliographic network analysis.	and <u>Fernanda Strozzi</u>

No	Title	Topic Discussion	Ref
5	Bibliometrics: methods for studying academic publishing	This article introduces bibliometrics and defines its main terminology and concepts, including relational and evaluative bibliometrics, as well as the advantages and disadvantages of	
6	* *	bibliometrics. Analyze large numbers of publications and production patterns at macroscopic and microscopic levels with bibliometry	Peter Kokol. <i>et al</i> (2020)

METHODS

All bibliographic information from articles that were published between 2013 and 2023 that were indexed by Google Scholar was retrieved for this investigation. The Publish or Perish reference management program (which was viewed on September 23, 2023) is used for data retrieval. Then, information from Publish or Perish will be saved in two formats: *.ris (for data mapping using the VOSviewer application) and *.csv (for data processing in Ms Excel). Following data recovery, we employ the VOSviewer program. Software called VOSviewer can be used to display and examine bibliometric data (Anton, 2021). As a tool for data visualization, the VOSviewer application creates a network of pre-processed datasets as a representation of gender equality. We refer to "Gender", "Inclusiveness", "Learning Materials", "Elementary School", and "Indonesia" as keyword searches for data. You may read more about the steps taken throughout the bibliometric analysis investigation in **figure 1**.



Figure 1. Flowchart of bibliometric analysis steps.

2.1. Prepare Tools and Materials

Making the necessary preparations for the instruments and resources to be utilized in the analysis is the first stage in conducting a bibliometric analysis. The Publish or Perish (PoP) application, which is used to search for and collect article data based on keywords, the Microsoft Excel application, which is used for analysis and screening of search result data, and finally the VOSviewer application, which is used for visualization and mapping, all need to be prepared. data from a search.

2.2. Harvesting Data

At this point, we gathered information for an analysis of publishing trend according to the keywords chosen. At this point, using the Publish or Perish tool, published research documents (articles) relating to

the topic terms "Gender", "Inclusiveness", "Learning materials", "Elementary School", and "Indonesia" were gathered. We gathered research papers using the keywords "Gender", "Inclusiveness", "Learning materials", "Elementary School", and "Indonesia". The articles that were collected were those that were published in the previous five years, from 2013 to 2023.

2.3. Screening Data

Direct analysis of the research documents gathered during the data gathering step is not possible. Data filtering is therefore necessary. At this point, the year of publication is taken into consideration while screening the data. Articles that lack a publication year are nevertheless included. Additionally, this investigation exclusively used journal publications. As a result, at this step of data filtering, papers without a journal citation will be removed. After the data was screened, 996 publications were found, of which 988 could be used in this study. As a result of their inadequate metadata, certain articles are not used.

2.4. Visualization Data

To obtain data visualization, data that has been stored in the (*.ris) format is then submitted to the VOSviewer program. At this point, the phrases in the network mapping visualization in VOSviewer are filtered. The source database is used to map the article data. In this study, three different methods of visualization network visualization, overlay visualization, and density visualization were used.

2.5. Analysis Data

The accessible data is now examined to generate the findings that will be covered in the "results and discussion" section. The use of Microsoft Excel simplifies data analysis.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 What is Gender Inclusiveness

In Indonesia, inclusive education is still a new concept. By removing obstacles that can impede any student from fully engaging in school, inclusive education aims to change the way that education is provided (Junaidi, 2017). Ethnicity, gender, social class, and poverty are a few of these hindrances. In other words, inclusive education is a service that allows children with special needs to learn alongside typically developing children in order to maximize their potential.

It is noted that inclusive schools strive to promote education equality by eliminating discrimination, allowing children with disabilities and general children to receive the same education (Darma, 2015). Inclusive education encompasses not only individuals with disabilities but also other vulnerable groups who may be susceptible to exclusion from education. Inclusion facilitates an environment that can cater to everyone, including individuals of all genders.

When discussing gender inclusivity, According to Gene (2008), gender describes the behavioral, cultural, and psychological traits that are frequently linked to distinct biological genders. It is focused on the societal expectations and norms associated with being male or female (Ahmad, 2019). Some experts suggest that the definition of gender encompasses:

1. Mansour Fakih

Gender, according to Mansour Fakih (1996), is the term used to differentiate distinctions between men and women based on their biological and sociocultural characteristics.

2. Saparinah Sadli

Gender is defined by Saparinah Sadli as having two main aspects. The first pertains to a set of psychological characteristics that are influenced by social factors and that have a connection to biological distinctions between men and women. The second aspect is based on the division of sexes, which is

determined by these biological differences and includes traits that are typically associated with each sex, namely males and females (Saparinah, 1995).

Women have the right to an education equal to that of men. Education is essential for women to be ready to face intellectual and sociological challenges, and to have the opportunity to work according to their abilities and dispositions (Junaidi, 2017). A study carried out by Hidayaturahman indicates that women do not possess the right to reject certain practices, such as early marriage or limited education. Additionally, a study concentrated on women in a specific region of Indonesia, Madura, reveals that Madurese folks consider women as beings that require safeguarding and monitoring (Munawara, Yasak, & Dewi, 2015). Madurese culture demonstrates gender division in the production of batik, where women apply the painted wax and men remove the wax from the cloth (Noer, 2012). The image, position, and status of women are strongly influenced by culture, according to research. For instance, blue and pink have historically been linked with males and women, respectively (Hutajulu, 2015).

The construction of gender inequity involves both written and unwritten conventions. In certain groups, regulations that are applicable to men frequently discourage gender, which has an impact on the varied structures of production and reproduction between different social classes (Lestari & Hidayah, 2016). The ideology of gender inequality is believed to form the foundation of women's oppression by enforcing feminine traits and practices that uphold patriarchy and lead to male supremacy (Rokhimah, 2014). For instance, although men are frequently viewed as the primary earners in families, they also make significant contributions to unpaid household labor. This association generally corresponds to women's roles as family caregivers or housekeepers.

All sectors of employment should afford human rights without gender discrimination so that women who decide to become teachers receive equal rights and job protection as men. Currently, there is no research evidence that proves female teachers' ability or job performance is lower than that of male teachers (Junaidi, 2017). Based on the above explanation, gender inclusiveness is a condition in which men and women have equal access, participation and opportunities in all aspects of life, including education. It removes barriers such as stereotypes, discrimination and inequality of access, and requires persistent effort to achieve.

3.1.1 What Are the Forms of Gender Inclusiveness in Education

Education is very important to convey the aims and objectives of development. Because the values and standards that exist in the middle of society have been firmly rooted in culture, bringing about change development at every level of society is difficult. According to Ace Suryadi and Tilaar (1994: 192), education serves to create three different types of cultural actors: 1) people who are conscious of their culture, 2) people who have a strong sense of culture, and 3) people who are culturalists in a broad sense. Therefore, education is very necessary because education then the development goals to achieve equity and equality will be achieved. Women and men will both benefit much from non-discriminatory education, particularly in achieving equity and equality. Both women and men, particularly for establishing equality and justice between the two in order to accomplish growth, development, and sustainable peace in human life (Asadullah, 2018). The Elementary component of the nation's intelligence is not just acknowledged as education, but also as a byproduct of social formation. But also as a result of social construction; as a result, education also influences how gender relations are formed in society (Lee, 2018).

Aiming to establish a setting that fosters gender equality and takes into account everyone's requirements, regardless of their age, gender, race, or condition, gender inclusion is a concept. (Opertti 2014). Gender inclusiveness in education is a fundamental strategy for achieving gender justice and equality and refers to creating a learning environment that is free from gender bias and promotes equality and inclusiveness of all marginalized, disadvantaged and diverse gender identities to achieve gender equality (Shaeffer, 2019). The right to education, the right to participate in the educational process in a setting that encourages gender equality, and the right to educational results that enable equitable accomplishment are the three main ways that gender equality in education may be accomplished. The forms of gender equality in the realm of education include. Gender-responsive teaching: Gender-responsive teaching is a learning approach that aims to minimize or eliminate gender bias in education. It focuses on recognizing that gender is a social construct that can influence the way people

think, act and learn. (Wijanarko, 2022). The purpose of gender-responsive teaching is to ensure gender equality in education, increase participation and learning achievement, develop skills and attitudes needed for life, and build gender awareness. Furthermore, there are principles of gender-responsive teaching (1) Equality: All students have the right to quality education, regardless of gender. (2) Inclusiveness: All students should feel welcome and valued in the learning environment, regardless of their gender. (3) Equity: All students should have equal opportunities to develop and reach their full potential: (I) Inclusive curricula: In line with the policy and commitment to equity and access, schools can develop gender-inclusive curricula, programs, activities, and practices. All genders, gender identities, and sexual orientations must be included in the design of puberty education and sexuality education programs (Sudarsono, 2019). The requirements of all students, regardless of their origin, aptitude, or identity, are met through inclusive curriculum. It aims to create an inclusive and supportive learning environment where all students feel welcome and valued. The goals of inclusive curricula ensure equal access and participation for all students, improve learning outcomes for all students and build awareness and understanding of diversity. (II) Professional development for staff may assist provide the groundwork for gender-inclusive practices by teaching workers about the complexity of gender and how to stop bullying, harassment, and cruel mocking. (III) Building a basis for gender-inclusive practices requires structural measures, such as welcoming all students, ensuring physical and mental safety, and decreasing gender role stereotypes (wagner 2016). Structural approaches to gender inclusivity are important because they can help to create a more equitable society for all. When women and men have equal opportunities and resources, they can reach their full potential and contribute to society in meaningful ways. (IV) Relational approaches: Relational approaches to gender inclusivity is an approach that focuses on changing relationships and interactions between people of different sexes and gender identities. sex and gender identities (Herliansyah, 2018). Individual interactions and exchanges can support the school's commitment to gender inclusivity. Gender inclusivity may be promoted by creating classroom themes that highlight "All children can..." and use inclusive language when speaking to the class as a whole.

3.1.2. Government Policy on Gender Inclusiveness in Education

Considering how necessary gender inclusiveness is in the continuity of education in Indonesia should demand the role of all parties to realize gender-inclusive education. Not only focusing on educational actors or limited to certain educational units, the government, which has a wider range of powers, also participates in solving this problem. The government's participation can be felt by the existence of policies regarding gender inclusiveness in the field of education. Gender inclusiveness in education is not something new to fight for. According to Dina Hermina (2015) the Indonesian government has signed the convention on the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women or CEDAW in Law Number 7 of 1984 as an effort to eliminate the gender gap with support in the form of national and international commitments in order to realize gender equality and justice and children, especially in the field of education. This was also felt in 1999 along with the Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 34 of 1999 concerning Human Rights, which states in Article 48 that women have the right to education and teaching in accordance with the requirements established by Article 60 Paragraph 10, that every child has the right to education and teaching in order to develop their personality in accordance with their interests, talents, and level of intelligence (Rina Haslita, et al, 2021).

In the preamble of the 1945 Constitution, the 4th paragraph explains that the purpose of the Indonesian State aims to promote social justice for all Indonesians and educate the population. Another policy is contained in Article 31 of the 1945 Constitution which states that the State guarantees every citizen, both women and men, the same rights and obligations to obtain education (Inayatul Ulya, 2013). In accordance with Law No. 20 of 2003 Article 6 on the National Education System, which states that every citizen aged seven to fifteen years is required to attend basic education, Article 31 of the Law of the Republic of Indonesia explains that every citizen has the right to education and is required to attend government-funded basic education. The word every citizen in the regulation means regardless of race, ethnicity, religion or even gender. (Ana Nurhasanah, et al, 2001). Gender equality is one of the mandates in national development in accordance with Government Regulation No. IV-1999 concerning Broad Guidelines for State Policy 1999-2004. As well as contained in Law Number 22/2000 regarding the National Development Program explains that gender justice and equality are development

issues in all fields, including education. Then Presidential Decree No. 163/1999, Gender mainstreaming is the responsibility of the Office of the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection. (Dina Hermina, 2015).

The commitment to realize gender justice and equality is also shown through Presidential Decree No. 101 of 2001 on the need for gender justice and equality with the national policy of empowering women. In addition, the Ministry of National Education also issued Minister of National Education Regulation No. 84 of 2008 concerning Guidelines for the Implementation of Gender Mainstreaming in the Education Sector. Another case with Permendiknas Number 84 of 2008 which is present as a form of state commitment to various forms of discrimination that lead to certain genders in various dimensions of life including education. (Rustan Efendy, 2014). According to Eha Saleha and Yuli Tirtariandi (2015) the policy on gender mainstreaming in national development which orders all ministries and local government agencies to implement PUG.

3.1.3. Why Gender Inclusivity is Important in Elementary School Learning Materials

Integrating special needs children into a diverse learning environment is known as inclusive education (Islam & Asdullah, 2018). All factors, particularly gender-related aspects, must be covered in this inclusive education. This inclusive education's gender component attempts to promote equal gender representation. According to Wodon, gender equality in education is crucial because it gives women and men the same opportunities to pursue an education, as well as equal rights to an environment that promotes gender equality, participation in the educational process, and educational outcomes that support equitable achievement. Increased comprehension, awareness, and gender sensitivity can all be benefited from gender equality in school. Gender inclusivity in education is a strategy and approach that recognizes and values gender differences in learning (Shaeffer, 2019). Gender inclusion exemplifies gender equality in education by attempting to provide an atmosphere where all students, regardless of gender, may study in a fair and equitable manner. Gender inclusiveness is crucial in the context of primary schools because it can support the development of a welcoming and inclusive learning environment (Borgonovi, 2018).

Gender concerns can be included in the curriculum and instructional materials to promote gender inclusion. Students will thus be better equipped to comprehend gender issues and see the disparities between women and men. Gender inclusivity in learning resources for elementary schools also has its own advantages, such as: (i) providing all children with a just and equitable learning environment Regardless of a student's gender, gender inclusion may aid in creating a fair and equal learning environment. In reality, many learning materials in elementary schools are not gender inclusive. For example, textbooks often feature pictures or stories that only depict men or women in certain roles. This can make students feel that they cannot do something because of their gender. By implementing gender inclusion in learning materials, teachers can help create a more fair and equal learning environment. This can be done by: Choosing gender-inclusive teaching materials, i.e. teaching materials that feature pictures or stories that depict men and women in various roles, using gender-inclusive language, i.e. language that does not use gender-biased words or expression, and creating a safe and comfortable learning environment for all students, regardless of their gender. (ii) Challenging gender stereotypes: Gender inclusion can help challenge gender stereotypes that can limit students' potential. Gender stereotypes are assumptions about the roles and behaviors expected of men and women. Gender stereotypes can limit students' potential because they can make them feel that they can't do something because of their gender. For example, gender stereotypes often limit students' career choices. Male students may feel that they cannot be teachers or nurses, while female students may feel that they cannot be engineers or doctors. By implementing gender inclusion in learning materials, teachers can help challenge gender stereotypes. This can be done by: discussing gender stereotypes with students, showing examples of men and women who do not conform to gender stereotypes, encouraging students to pursue their interests and talents, and regardless of their gender. (iii) Preparing students for life in a diverse society Gender inclusion can help prepare students for life in a diverse society. A diverse society is one that values gender differences. By learning about gender inclusion, students can learn to appreciate differences and coexist peacefully with people from different backgrounds. Gender inclusion can help students

to understand that men and women have equal roles and rights in society. It can help students to become more just and inclusive citizens.(iv) To achieve gender inclusion in learning materials in primary schools, support is needed from all relevant stakeholders, including the government, educational institutions, teachers, parents, and the community. This assistance can take the form of supplying teachers with the necessary tools, such as genderinclusive textbooks, training them on gender-related topics, and launching community-wide campaigns to raise awareness of the value of producing accurate and pertinent gender representations as well as the inclusion of gender in education.

3.2 Representation of Equal Gender Inclusion

Gender-inclusive representation is an effort to ensure that men and women receive fair and equitable treatment in various aspects of life, such as the workplace, politics, education, and social life in general. This means that neither party feels advantaged or disadvantaged in decision making and other opportunities. In the world of education, in order to achieve gender equality, education must be approached as a whole or holistically. This means that education must consider all aspects as a whole. Not only that, in an effort to promote diversity, inclusion and equality in education, education must also integrate social justice into its processes (Deborah, 2021).

According to Michelle Kaffenberger and Lant Pritchett (2020), education goals at the international level expect gender equality and assume that equality will result in at least an adequate education for girls. If boys consistently achieve education and learning goals and girls do not, this may be understandable. However, if boys also fail to achieve the goals set, it means that without equality, educational goals cannot be achieved. This means that education should not only think about how to create diversity and inclusion, but also how to integrate social justice issues into the educational process itself. In this way, education can become a tool for promoting broader social justice in society. Gender inclusiveness does not limit either gender in developing the potential, interests and talents of learners.

3.2.1 What is the Role of Textbooks in Increasing the Representation of Equal Gender Inclusion in Indonesia

Education can eliminate gender gaps because the link between gender and education helps achieve gender equality and eliminate prejudice against men and women. However, schools are now one of the factors that encourage gender bias practices in education which is a big problem. The proof is that many textbooks in elementary to high school are written with gender bias, marginalizing women and emphasizing masculinity. This is a problem because the curriculum does not explicitly include material on gender equality. (Mustofa. et al (2021). Textbooks are a very important classroom teaching resource in Indonesian education as the most effective teaching materials are books, in shaping children's attitudes, beliefs and values. This has been found to contribute to gender inequality in education. (Bilah and Refti, (2013). Textbooks can serve as a source of teaching materials commonly used in the classroom for a curriculum that emphasizes gender equality. Therefore, textbooks are crucial for promoting the subject matter as well as the values or issues embedded in them. As character education values are often included in textbooks have the power to either advance gender equality or reinforce prejudice and preconceptions.. (Rahmah Fithriani, 2022).

The social cognitive theory, which highlights the significance of imitation, observation, and modeling in human development, sees textbooks as having a big impact on how kids acquire their gender roles, especially at the basic level. There is a lot of information about behavior, characteristics and roles that already exist, social norms according to gender, which are outlined in school textbooks that children will follow. because students spend most of their class time using textbooks, constant exposure to overt and covert gender practices and ideologies are integrated into school textbooks, subsequently shaping children's views on gender according to normative ways of thinking, acting and behaving depending on gender expression. Thus, textbooks are crucial in helping students develop their perspective on the obligations that men and women have in society. (Kobia in Rahmah Fithriani. (2022). A good book can definitely show gender justice and equality through the roles played

by women and men based on status, environment, culture and societal structure. This can be achieved through illustrations and sentence descriptions. (Sitijauhari, 2022).

3.2.2 Result Metrics

Table 2 shows the search result metrics for publications on gender inclusiveness in education in Indonesia. The year range of all publications analyzed in this study is from 2013 to 2022. The number of papers found and metadata processed was 31. The number of citations of all publications on gender inclusiveness in education in Indonesia found in the Google Scholar database was 2185 citations. Meanwhile, the average annual citation is 218.50 times and the average citation per article is 70.48 times. The H-Index of publications on gender inclusiveness in education in Indonesia indexed by Google Scholar is 26 with a G-index of 31. The H-index is a metric used to measure the contribution and impact of researchers' scientific publications (Cormode et al., 2013). The H-index can be calculated by looking at the number of citations of all articles published by a researcher. In this research, it is known that the H-index is 26, which means that there are 26 papers that are cited at least 26 times. Table 2. Result metrics publication on gender inclusiveness in education in Indonesia.

2013-2022
10 (2013-2023)
31
2185
218.50
70.48
26
31
19
1.90
14

3.2.3 Annual Publication Repot

The findings in Figure 2 indicate that research on gender inclusiveness in learning materials or education has decreased every year. Although in 2018 research on gender inclusiveness in learning materials or education had increased. However, in the following year research on this topic experienced a decline again. In 2013, there was just one article; in 2014, there were three; in 2015, there was only one; in 2016, there were three; in 2017, there were two; in 2018, there were nine; in 2019, there were five; and in 2020, there were none.

As a result, it is probable that research on gender learning materials or education will still be active in academia in the month of 2023, particularly for future educators who will be more concerned with and sensitive to gender inclusivity in the field of education.



3.2.4 Article Trends

Table 3 displays the classification of articles and books on gender inclusiveness in learning materials or education. With a total of 295 citations, the article by HM Lips has received the most, according to the article data in Table 3. according to the most cited book. Based on the article data in Table 3, the article by HM Lips is the most cited with a total of 295 citations. Based on the most cited book, and published in 2016, it examines

the psychology of women from the perspective of gender, culture, and ethnicity. And a little mention also about Stereotypes and gender discrimination in the field of education. Regarding the second, PloS One has released a study by Islam and Assadullah (2018).

No	Cites	Authors	Title	Year	Source
1	295	HM Lips	A new psychology of women: Gender, culture, and ethnicity	2016	Waveland Press.
2	181	Islam and Assadullah	Gender stereotypes and education: A comparative content analysis of Malaysian, Indonesian, Pakistani and Bangladeshi school textbooks	2018	PloS one
3	164	Opertti, et al.	Inclusive education: From targeting groups and schools to achieving quality education as the core of EFA	2014	SAGE handbook of special education
4	128	Warin and Adriany	Gender flexible pedagogy in early childhood education	2017	Journal of gender studies
5	123	JFK Lee	Gender representation in Japanese EFL textbooks-a corpus study	2018	Gender and Education
6	100	Psaki, et al.	Measuring gender equality in education: Lessons from trends in 43 countries	2018	PloS one
7	94	Wagner, et al.	Gender, ethnicity and teaching evaluations: Evidence from mixed teaching teams	2016	Economics of Education Review
8	85	Ahmad and Shafi	A critical discourse analysis of gender representations in the content of 5th grade English language textbook	2019	International and Multidisciplinary journal of social Sciences
9	80	Shaeffer	Inclusive education: a prerequisite for equity and social justice	2019	Asia Pacific Education Review
10	80	Mustapha	Gender and language education research: A review	2013	Journal of Language Teaching and Research
11	76	Jiang, et al.	Cross-national comparison of gender differences in the enrollment in and completion of science, technology, engineering, and mathematics Massive Open	2018	PloS one
12	74	Rasmitadila, et al.	Student teachers' perceptions of the collaborative relationships form between universities and inclusive elementary schools in Indonesia	2021	F1000Research
13	70	Asadullah	Madrasah for girls and private school for boys? The determinants of school type choice in rural and urban Indonesia	2018	International Journal of Educational Development

No	Cites	Authors	Title	Year	Source
14	69	Rasmitadila, et al.	Teachers' Perceptions of the Role of Universities in Mentoring Programs for Inclusive Elementary Schools: A Case Study in Indonesia	2022	Journal of Education and e-Learning Research,
15	54	Tambak, et al.	Professional Madrasah Teachers in Teaching: The Influence of Gender and the Length of Certification of Madrasah Teachers	2021	Dinamika Ilmu
16	53	Adriany and Warin	Preschool teachers' approaches to care and gender differences within a child-centred pedagogy: findings from an Indonesian kindergarten	2014	International Journal of Early Years Education
17	53	Suharto	Transnational Islamic education in Indonesia: an ideological perspective	2018	Contemporary Islam
18	46	Sudarso, et al.	Gender, religion and patriarchy: The educational discrimination of coastal Madurese women, East Java	2019	Journal of International Women's Studies
19	45	Adriany	Being a princess: young children's negotiation of femininities in a Kindergarten classroom in Indonesia	2019	Gender and Education
20	45	Borgonovi, et al.	The gender gap in educational outcomes in Norway	2018	Oecd library
21	43	Warin	Men in early childhood education and care: Gender balance and flexibility	2018	Springer
22	42	Kostas	Discursive construction of hegemonic masculinity and emphasised femininity in the textbooks of primary education: children's discursive agency and polysemy of the narratives.	2021	Gender and Education
23	40	Mills and Mustapha	Gender representation in learning materials	2015	International Perspectives
24	31	Juwita, et al.	Students' tolerance behavior in religious- based primary school: Gender perspective	2018	International Journal of Educational Research Review,
25	31	Kaffenberger and Pritchett	Aiming higher: Learning profiles and gender equality in 10 low-and middle- income countries	2020	nternational Journal of Educational Development
26	26	Tsuda, et al.	Gender flexible pedagogy in early childhood education	2017	journal of gender studies
27	24	Asadullah, et al.	Support for gender stereotypes: does madrasah education matter?	2019	The Journal of Development Studies
28	11	Gabriel	Race, ethnicity and gendered educational intersections	2021	Gender and Education
29	9	Clarke, and Sawyer	Girls, disabilities and school education in the East Asia Pacific region	2014	New York: United Nations Girl's Education Initiative

No	Cites	Authors	Title	Year	Source
30	8		In their experience: A review of racial and	2022	Race and Justice
		Blount-Hill, et	sexual minority experience in academe		
		al	and proposals for building an inclusive		
			criminology		
31	5	Wodon	What Matters Most for Equity and	2016	Worldbank
			Inclusion in Education Systems		

3.2.5 Co-occurrences Analyst (network, overlay, density)

Co-occurrences analysis is an analysis that takes into account an event's high frequency and number of occurrences (Li et al., 2018). The authors of publications on gender inclusivity in learning or educational resources are also taken into account in this study's co-occurrence analysis, which makes use of bibliometrics and the VOSviewer tool. Images joined by codes are used to represent the whole co-occurrence analysis. In order to review the authors and words that are frequently used in gender inclusion research in learning materials, this study used three different forms of of networks, overlays, and densities are shown in Figures 3 through 5.

Figure 2 depicts the network visualization used in studies on the incorporation of gender in learning or educational materials. 12 terms were discovered after limiting the terms in the study on gender inclusivity in learning materials to a minimum of one occurrence. Three clusters of the 12 terms were formed.

- 1. Cluster 1 in red has six items: 5th grade english language, content, critical discourse analysisis, elt material, english language textbook, dan equal gender inclusion.
- 2. Cluster 2 in green has three items: english language learning, exploration and representation.
- 3. Cluster 3 in blue has three items: educational material, gender equity, dan vocabulary.

Figure 3 displays the overlay visualization's geometry.. We can find the year's trend on the overlay visualization of Gender Inclusiveness in Student Learning Materials there was study done. The information in Figure 3 indicates that the range of 2013 to 2023 is where the trend of these phrases appears. Among the phrases that have just recently emerged are 5th grade English language, content, representation, English language learning, and educational material. Figure 4 displays the visual representation of the density of publications on gender inclusivity in educational materials for students. Based on Figure 4, it can be determined by a node's color how frequently it appears and is utilized in articles discussing the inclusion of gender in student learning resources. The color of each node in Figure 4 can be used to determine how frequently a node appears and is used in the debate of gender inclusivity in student learning.



Figure 3. Publishing of network visualization on Gender Inclusiveness in Student Learning Materials



Figure 4. Publishing of overlay visualization on Gender Inclusiveness in Student Learning Materials

In this study, we looked at the researchers that wrote articles about gender inclusivity in student learning materials that were published in journals both domestic and abroad that are indexed by Google Scholar. This co-authorship analysis reveals that, 58 Between 2013 and 2023, authors contributed to the writing of papers on gender inclusiveness in student learning materials. Table 4 displays 58 authors who have produced a minimum of three documents to various publications. Meanwhile, The network visualization between authors is shown in Figure 6. Assadullah has the most papers, 3 documents, which belong to cluster 3 and have an overall link strength of 3. Adriany follows with three documents, a link strength of 2, and membership in cluster 13.



Figure 5. Publishing of density visualization on gender inclusiveness in student learning materials

Table 4. An article on gender inclusivity in teaching materials included contributions from a number of authors. (2013-2023).

Author	Total of Document	Total Link Strength	Cluster
Asadullah	3	3	3
Adriany	3	2	13
Warin	3	2	13
Rasmitadila	2	3	2
Mustapha	2	1	16
Amiin	1	2	3
Chaundhury	1	2	3
Islam	1	1	3
Hapsari	1	2	6
Hartini	1	2	6
Tsuda	1	2	6
Ahmad	1	1	14
Shah	1	1	14
Mills	1	1	16

Author	Total of Document	Total Link Strength	Cluster
Shaeffer	1	0	22
Winarno	1	2	12
Salim	1	1	12
Juwita	1	2	12
Rahmadtullah	1	2	2
Asri	1	2	2
Humaira	1	2	2
Keban	1	2	8
Mas udah	1	2	8
Sudarsono	1	2	8
Bount Hill	1	2	7
Motton	1	2	3
John	1	2	7
Mvvarthy	1	2	9
Mensch	1	2	9
Psaki	1	2	9
Kostas	1	0	19
Zhang	1	2	10
Walker	1	2	10
Opertti	1	2	10
Voorvelt	1	2	11
Rieger	1	2	11
Wagner	1	2	11
Suhartono	1	0	23
Xi,d	1	4	1
Eccles	1	4	1
Scvhenke	1	4	1
Jiang	1	4	1
Warscjauer	1	3	1
Borgonovi	1	2	5
Maghnouj	1	2	5
Ferrara	1	2	5
Sawyer	1	1	15
Clarke	1	1	15
Latipah	1	3	4
Mahfud	1	3	4
Sukemti	1	3	4

Author	Total of Document	Total Link Strength	Cluster
Tambak	1	3	4
Pritchett	1	1	17
Kaffenberger	1	1	17
Lee	1	0	20
Lips	1	0	21
Gabriel	1	0	18
Wodon	1	0	24



Gambar 6. Publication of network visualization the author on gender inclusiveness in student learning materials

CONCLUSION

Men and women should have equal access to, involvement in, and opportunities for contribution in all spheres of life, including education, according to the definition of gender inclusivity. Forms of gender equality in the realm of education include gender responsive teaching, gender responsive teaching is a learning approach that aims to minimize or eliminate gender bias in education. The government has played a role in realizing gender inclusive education, this is reflected in various policies that are poured out. Gender inclusion is needed in learning materials to create a fair learning environment, challenge gender stereotypes, and help students to live in a diverse society. Textbooks can act as a medium for gender socialization because students learn and interact a lot with textbooks at school. Therefore, it is important to have a special institution responsible for organizing gender-inclusive textbooks.

AUTHORS' NOTE

No conflicts of interest exist, according to the authors, with the publishing of this article. The authors attested that there was no plagiarism in the work.

REFERENCES

- Adriany, V. (2019). Being a princess: young children's negotiation of femininities in a Kindergarten classroom in Indonesia. *Gender and Education*, 31(6), 724-741.
- Adriany, V., & Warin, J. (2014). Preschool teachers' approaches to care and gender differences within a childcentred pedagogy: findings from an Indonesian kindergarten. *International Journal of Early Years Education*, 22(3), 315-328.
- Ahmad, M., & Shah, S. K. (2019). A critical discourse analysis of gender representations in the content of 5th grade English language textbook. *International and Multidisciplinary journal of social Sciences*, 8(1), 1-24.

- Asadullah, M. N. (2018). Madrasah for girls and private school for boys? The determinants of school type choice in rural and urban Indonesia. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 62, 96-111.
- Asadullah, M. N., Amin, S., & Chaudhury, N. (2019). Support for gender stereotypes: does madrasah education matter?. *The Journal of Development Studies*, 55(1), 39-56.
- Billah Nurlaili Zulmi, & Handini Lisytani, R. (2017). Bias Gender dalam Buku Tematik Siswa Kurikulum 2013 (Studi Semiotika Ketidaksetaraan Gender dalam Pendidikan). Paradigma: Jurnal Online Mahasiswa S1 Sosiologi UNESA, 5(3), 253229.
- Blount-Hill, K. L., St. John, V., Moton, L. N., & Ajil, A. (2022). In their experience: A review of racial and sexual minority experience in academe and proposals for building an inclusive criminology. *Race and Justice*, 12(3), 457-480.
- brief, P. (2013). ACDPINDONESIA Education Sector Analytical And Capacity Development Partnership Gender Equality in Education in Indonesia.
- Borgonovi, F., Ferrara, A., & Maghnouj, S. (2018). The gender gap in educational outcomes in Norway.
- Clarke, D., & Sawyer, J. (2014). Girls, disabilities and school education in the East Asia Pacific region. *New York: United Nations Girl's Education Initiative.*
- Comerio, N., & Strozzi, F. (2018). Tourism and its economic impact: A literature review using bibliometric tools. *Tourism Economics*, 25(1), 109–131. Sagepub. https://doi.org/10.1177/1354816618793762
- Darma, I. P., & Rusyidi, B. (2015). PELAKSANAAN SEKOLAH INKLUSI DI INDONESIA. Prosiding Penelitian Dan Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat, 2(2). https://doi.org/10.24198/jppm.v2i2.13530
- Donthu, N., Kumar, S., & Pattnaik, D. (2020). Forty-five years of Journal of Business Research: A bibliometric analysis. *Journal of Business Research*, 109, 1–14. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2019.10.039
- Fithriani, R. (2022). Gender Portrayals in Indonesian and International English Language Textbooks for Primary Students: A Critical Image Analysis. *MEXTESOL Journal*, *46*(4), n4.. (Vol. 46, Issue 4).
- Gabriel, D. (2021). Race, ethnicity and gendered educational intersections. *Gender and Education*, 33(7), 791–797. https://doi.org/10.1080/09540253.2021.1967667
- Gene, E., Linnda, F., & Donna, M. (2008). Mengajar Dengan Senang. 73.
- Hamidah, I., Sriyono, S., & Hudha, M. N. (2020). A Bibliometric Analysis of Covid-19 Research using VOSviewer. Indonesian Journal of Science and Technology, 5(2), 209–216. https://doi.org/10.17509/ijost.v5i2.24522
- Haslita, R., Samin, R., Kurnianingsih, F., Okparizan, O., Subiyakto, R., Elyta, R., Anggraini, R., Muhazinar, M., & Ardiansya, A. (2021). Implementasi Kebijakan pada Kesetaraan Gender dalam Bidang Pendidikan. *Takzim : Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat*, 1(1), 81–86. https://doi.org/10.31629/takzimjpm.v1i1.3845
- Herliansyah, R., Prahara, P. J., & Zahara, A. (2018). Modelling Gender-Based Differences in Financial Inclusion. *The Eighth Research Dive on Financial Inclusion*, 15.
- Hermina, D. (2015). Strategi Pelaksanaan Pengarusutamaan Gender (PUG) dalam Pendidikan. Muadalah, 2(1). https://doi.org/10.18592/jsga.v2i1.459
- Istiqomah, H., Suyadi, dan, Magister PGMI, P., & Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, U. (2019). PERKEMBANGAN FISIK MOTORIK ANAK USIA SEKOLAH DASAR DALAM PROSES PEMBELAJARAN (STUDI KASUS DI SD MUHAMMADIYAH KARANGBENDO YOGYAKARTA). Desember, 11(2), 155–168. http://journal.uinmataram.ac.id/index.php/
- Islam, K. M. M., & Asadullah, M. N. (2018). Gender stereotypes and education: A comparative content analysis of Malaysian, Indonesian, Pakistani and Bangladeshi school textbooks. *PloS one*, *13*(1), e0190807.
- Jauhari, S. (2022). ANALISIS GENDER DALAM BUKU TEMATIK SISWA KELAS IV SD KURIKULUM 2013 (pp. 1–94).
- Josua Parulian Hutajulu. (2015). ANALISIS PERAN PEREMPUAN DALAM PERTANIAN DI KECAMATAN RASAU JAYA KABUPATEN KUBURAYA. Jurnal Social Economic of Agriculture, 4(1), 23060. https://doi.

org/10.26418/j.sea.v4i1.10135

- Junaidi, M. (2017). Pendidikan Multikultular Dan Pendidikan Inklusi Gender. Jurnal Pendidikan Islam, 7(2), 130-145. https://doi.org/10.38073/jpi.v7i2.48
- Kaffenberger, M., & Pritchett, L. (2020). Aiming higher: Learning profiles and gender equality in 10 lowand middle-income countries. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 79, 102272. https://doi. org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2020.102272
- Kokol, P., Blalun Vošner, H., & Završnik, J. (2020). Application of bibliometrics in medicine: a historical bibliometrics analysis. *Health Information & Libraries Journal*. https://doi.org/10.1111/hir.12295
- Jiang, S., Schenke, K., Eccles, J. S., Xu, D., & Warschauer, M. (2018). Cross-national comparison of gender differences in the enrollment in and completion of science, technology, engineering, and mathematics Massive Open Online Courses. *PloS one*, 13(9), e0202463
- JUWITA, W., Salim, A., & Winarno, W. (2018). Students' tolerance behavior in religious-based primary school: Gender perspective. *International Journal of Educational Research Review*, 3(3), 51-58.
- Kostas, M. (2021). Discursive construction of hegemonic masculinity and emphasised femininity in the textbooks of primary education: children's discursive agency and polysemy of the narratives. *Gender and Education*, *33*(1), 50-67.
- Lips, H. M. (2016). A new psychology of women: Gender, culture, and ethnicity. Waveland Press.
- Lee, J. F. (2018). Gender representation in Japanese EFL textbooks-a corpus study. Gender and Education, 30(3), 379-395.
- Lestari F, E. (2016). Bias Gender dalam Sturktur Organisasi KAMMI (Kesatuan Aksi Mahasiswa Muslim Indonesia) Komisariat UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta. *Undergraduate Thesis*, *5*, 3.
- Maesaroh, D. T., Asih, Y. U., & Suhatmady, B. (2022). Does the English Textbook for Young Learners in Indonesia Promote Gender Equality? IJELTAL (Indonesian Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics), 7(1), 35. https://doi.org/10.21093/ijeltal.v7i1.1152
- Mansour, F. (1996). Menggeser Konsep Gender dan Transformasi Sosial (pp. 7-8). Pustaka Pelajar.
- Mills, S., & Mustapha, A. S. (2015). Gender representation in learning materials. International Perspectives.
- Mustapha, Abolaji S. "Gender and language education research: A review." Journal of Language Teaching and Research 4, no. 3 (2013): 454.
- Munawara, Yasak, E. M., & Dewi, S. I. (2015). BUDAYA PERNIKAHAN DINI TERHADAP KESETARAAN GENDER MASYARAKAT MADURA. JISIP : Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Ilmu Politik, 4(3). https://doi. org/10.33366/jisip.v4i3.123
- Mustofa, Fidita Karya, D., & Halim, abdul. (2021). Indonesian students' perception of gender equity in education. *Pegem Journal of Education and Instruction*, 11(4). https://doi.org/10.47750/pegegog.11.04.18
- Ninkov, A., Frank, J. R., & Maggio, L. A. (2021). Bibliometrics: Methods for studying academic publishing. *Perspectives on Medical Education*, 11(3), 173–176. https://doi.org/10.1007/s40037-021-00695-4
- Nurhasanah, A., Marini, A., & Mohamad Syarif Sumantri. (2021). PENGELOLAAN PENDIDIKAN BERBASIS KEBIJAKAN GENDER DI SALAH SATU SEKOLAH DASAR BANTEN. *Elementary School Journal PGSD FIP UNIMED*, 11(1), 79–79. https://doi.org/10.24114/esjpgsd.v11i1.24729
- Noer, K. U. (2012). Land, Marriage and Social Exclusion: The Case of Madurese Exile Widow. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 65, 180–185. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.11.108
- Opertti, R., Walker, Z., & Zhang, Y. (2014). Inclusive education: From targeting groups and schools to achieving quality education as the core of EFA. *The SAGE handbook of special education*, *2*, 149-169.
- Psaki, S. R., McCarthy, K. J., & Mensch, B. S. (2018). Measuring gender equality in education: Lessons from trends in 43 countries. *Population and Development Review*, 44(1), 117-142..
- Rasmitadila, R., Humaira, M. A., & Rachmadtullah, R. (2021). Student teachers' perceptions of the collaborative

relationships form between universities and inclusive elementary schools in Indonesia. F1000Research, 10.

- Rasmitadila, R., Megan Asri, H., & Reza, R. (2022). Teachers' Perceptions of the Role of Universities in Mentoring Programs for Inclusive Elementary Schools: A Case Study in Indonesia. *Journal of Education and e-Learning Research*, 8(3), 333-339.
- Rokhimah, S. (2014). Patriarkisme dan Ketidakadilan Gender. Muwazah, 6(1), 132-145.

Rustan Efendy. (2014). Kesetaraan Gender dalam Pendidikan. Jurnal Al-Maiyyah, 7(2), 142-165.

- Saleha, E., & Tirtariandi EA, Y. (2015). KEBERHASILAN IMPLEMENTASI KEBIJAKAN PENGARUSUTAMAAN GENDER DI INDONESIA MENYONGSONG ME. Nasional Fakultas Ilmu Sosial Dan Ilmu Politik., 488–496.
- Tambak, S., Mahfud, C., Latipah, E., & Sukenti, D. (2021). Professional Madrasah Teachers in Teaching: The Influence of Gender and the Length of Certification of Madrasah Teachers. Dinamika Ilmu, 21 (2), 417-435.
- Shaeffer, S. (2019). Inclusive education: a prerequisite for equity and social justice. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 20(2), 181-192.
- Saparinah, S. (1995). Identitas Gender dan Peran Gender, dalam Omas Ihroni, (ed), Kajian Wanita dalam Pengembangan . Yayasan Obor Indonesia.
- Sarkodie, S. A., & Strezov, V. (2019). A review on Environmental Kuznets Curve hypothesis using bibliometric and meta-analysis. *Science of the Total Environment*, 649, 128–145. https://doi.org/10.1016/j. scitotenv.2018.08.276
- Sudarso, S., Keban, P. E., & Mas'udah, S. (2019). Gender, religion and patriarchy: The educational discrimination of coastal Madurese women, East Java. *Journal of International Women's Studies*, 20(9), 2-12.
- Suharto, T. (2018). Transnational Islamic education in Indonesia: an ideological perspective. *Contemporary Islam*, *12*(2), 101-122.
- Suryadi, A., & Tilaar, H. A. R. (1993). Analisis kebijakan pendidikan: suatu pengantar. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Ulya, I. (2018). PENDIDIKAN BERBASIS KESETARAAN GENDER: Studi Kebijakan Pemerintah dan Aplikasinya dalam Pendidikan. MAGISTRA: Media Pengembangan Ilmu Pendidikan Dasar Dan Keislaman, 4(1). https://doi.org/10.31942/mgs.v4i1.946
- Wagner, N., Rieger, M., & Voorvelt, K. (2016). Gender, ethnicity and teaching evaluations: Evidence from mixed teaching teams. *Economics of Education Review*, *54*, 79-94.
- Wahyudi, A., & Lutfauziah, A. (2023). ANALISIS WACANA GENDER PADA BUKU TEMATIK SEKOLAH DASAR KURIKULUM 2013. Lingua Franca: Jurnal Bahasa, Sastra, dan Pengajarannya, 7(2), 137-155.
- Warin, J. (2018). Men in early childhood education and care: Gender balance and flexibility. Springer.
- Warin, J., & Adriany, V. (2017). Gender flexible pedagogy in early childhood education. *Journal of gender studies*, 26(4), 375-386.
- Wodon, Q. (2016). What Matters Most for Equity and Inclusion in Education Systems.
- Zupic, I., & later, T. (2015). Bibliometric Methods in Management and Organization. Organizational Research Methods, 18(3), 429–472. https://doi.org/10.1177/1094428114562629