

Indonesia-Germany cooperation in efforts to improve vocational education levels: Analysis of the Ausbildung program

Rafflialdi Hugo Atthareq *, RMT Nurhasan Affandi 

Universitas Padjadjaran, Indonesia.

* Corresponding Author. Email: rafflialdi18001@mail.unpad.ac.id

ARTICLE INFO

Article History

Received:

29 April 2022;

Revised:

19 August 2022;

Accepted:

11 September 2023;

Available online:

10 March 2023

Keywords

Ausbildung program;

International

cooperation;

Labor;

Vocational education

ABSTRACT

The quality of Indonesian human resources still needs improvement to compete in the international world. Currently, the international market requires a lot of competence in technical skills in the vocational field. For this reason, Indonesia focuses on developing vocational training and education. This demand was not fulfilled because Indonesian vocational graduates did not have the right skills. With abundant but ineffective resources, Indonesia must learn much from other countries, including Germany. The output of this international collaboration is the Ausbildung program or Apprenticeship Training. This article seeks to reveal how Indonesian-Germany cooperation in vocational education impacts the two countries by using a qualitative method of reviewing documents and interviews with relevant sources. Findings from this article's cooperation opens up new opportunities for exploiting intellectual labor, which is neo-capitalism. In terms of salary, the wages received by Indonesian workers are far below the minimum wage that should be given to professional workers in Germany.



This is an open access article under the [CC-BY-SA](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/) license.



How to cite:

Atthareq, R. H., & Affandi, R. M. T. N. (2023). Indonesia-Germany cooperation in efforts to improve vocational education levels: Analysis of the Ausbildung program. *Jurnal Pendidikan Vokasi*, 13(1), 69-79. <https://doi.org/10.21831/jpv.v13i1.49341>

INTRODUCTION

Indonesia has the fourth largest population in the world, and this asset should be further developed in various ways for the progress and welfare of the Indonesian nation. However, unfortunately, according to the UNDP (The United Nations Development Program) in 2018, the Human Capital Index or the Index of Indonesian human resources was ranked 107th out of 189 countries which shows that Indonesia needs to improve in improving the quality of its human resources (United Nations, 2018).

One indication that shows a significant change in the quality of a country's human resources is the level of education. A high level of education will be directly proportional to the quality of the country's human resources (Ivanova et al., 1999). One of the ways that Indonesia can effectively improve the quality of its human resources is to improve the quality of the vocational education system. Another reason for efforts to improve the quality of the vocational education system itself is that today the international labor market is dominated by companies that require skilled workers who are competent in the field of engineering and technical skills, which are the outputs of the vocational education area (Wiriadidjaja et al., 2019). The great demand for skilled workers in the labor market comes from various industrial countries, which can also be categorized as developed countries, especially countries on the European and American continents.

Indonesia, which has abundant human resources, has great potential to fill the void in the demand for skilled workers. With this potential in mind, Indonesia seeks to improve the quality of its human resources effectively. Therefore Indonesian vocational education, which is based on the provision of programs that are oriented to market needs and practices that improve the abilities and skills of vocational school graduates supported by the principle of participation in lifelong learning, needs to be intensified (Hendarman et al., 2016).

As previously explained, the demand for skilled laborers in vocational education is very high and open. However, Indonesia needs help meeting the market demands because Indonesian vocational graduates cannot match the right skills sufficiently (Verawardina & Jama, 2019). This is also the reason why despite the high demand for labor, according to the Central Statistics Agency (BPS), there are still around 6.87 million unemployed people in Indonesia, and unemployment among vocational school graduates or VET holds the largest portion of the unemployment rate in Indonesia (Wiriadidjaja et al., 2019).

The Indonesian government, in addition to internally carrying out various efforts such as increasing investment in the VET sector by establishing vocational schools and allocating the development of vocational schools to become a priority aspect of national education level development by increasing the ratio of students enrolled in vocational education as well, and also providing expertise certification to graduates.

However, another collaboration is needed to appropriately and effectively increase Indonesia's VET level. In this case, Indonesia needs to learn much from other countries that have effectively implemented a quality VET system, including Germany. Germany has implemented VET as one of the important pillars of education, which is very influential in the country's economy. The learning system applied seeks to improve the workability of the population based on comprehensive knowledge, which produces citizens who are fully knowledgeable about a particular aspect of the field (Wiriadidjaja et al., 2019).

Germany has widely become one of the largest donors in education, especially in the field of VET in the international world. The German government, through the Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung (BMZ) or the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development, has developed a strategy on how VET can be implemented globally throughout the world (Wiriadidjaja et al., 2019). Germany did this with the justification that a global increase in VET could comprehensively improve global welfare. From the point of view of International Relations itself, the promotion of VET was carried out in Germany's efforts to strengthen cooperation both bilaterally and multilaterally as well as in cooperation. Internationally, in general (Hummelsheim & Baur, 2014).

Germany and Indonesia have signed an international cooperation. The two country leaders, President Joko Widodo and German Chancellor Angela Merkel have also committed to operating a partnership in the VET education system using elements of the German dualism approach, which closely collaborates with the private enterprise sector. The output of this collaboration is a program called Ausbildung or Ausbildungsplatz which can be translated as training or internships carried out by the Indonesian people or referred to as Ausbildung students from Indonesia who go to Germany to do this VET education.

With those backgrounds, this article seeks to discuss how cooperation international cooperation between Indonesia and Germany in the field of vocational training and education or VET in the output of the cooperation program, namely Ausbildung (internship training), in terms of the impact and objectives of this collaboration using the basic concept of international cooperation based on the principle of mutual gain between countries that carry out this cooperation (Grieco et al., 1993).

This article also intends to comprehensively look at how the Ausbildung program can assist Indonesia in developing the quality of its human resources and whether there are problems that threaten Indonesia in the implementation of this cooperation that can be used to be considered as a concern so that this cooperation can remain in its circumstances as cooperation that based on mutual benefit or mutual gain. Therefore, the main question of this article is whether the Ausbildung program could improve the quality level of vocational education to reduce unemployment and unskilled labor in Indonesia and provide benefits for both countries.

RESEARCH METHOD

This article uses descriptive qualitative research methods to explain. It seeks to reveal whether Ausbildung can increase vocational education in Indonesia and how it can benefit the two countries. The research in this article uses literature review data collection techniques complemented by interviews conducted with practitioners in education management, namely Reiner Bima Arigupta, who serves as operational director of Maxima Stiftung Indonesia. In addition, the process of compiling articles with qualitative methods is supported by supporting literature, like journal articles, books, official data on official websites, booklets, official reports, international agreements, and related archives, as well as news that discusses issues and topics that intersect with the discussion in the article.

In this research, the data analysis process is divided into several stages: data collection, interpreting and describing data, analyzing data, and drawing conclusions. The process of analyzing and interpreting the data in this article is assisted by tools, namely the Atlas.ti qualitative data analysis application version 9.0 using quotation and coding features. In terms of the validity of the data obtained, it is done by collecting data from various sources to obtain valid data. At the same time, the reliability of the data in this research was obtained through the use of a citation and bibliography maker application Mendeley.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

This article was written with the help of the Atlas.ti 9.0 application with a limited version using nine codes against 24 literature sources consisting of 16 journal articles, four books, three reports or reports, and one country-specific document. There are 150 quotations divided into nine codings starting from Reasonings, literature review, forms of cooperation, hypotheses, legal basis, the background of the problem, potential, system, and objectives of Indonesia-Germany bilateral foreign cooperation.

Conditions of Vocational Education (VET) in Indonesia

Vocational is a general term in any education world. Therefore, several studies have been carried out to develop vocational systems in several countries, especially those with large populations, and Indonesia is one of them. The Indonesian TVET system comprises vocational education and training, which are regulated separately (Kadir et al., 2016). The vocational experience can be gained by enrolling in formal vocational education, receiving vocational training, or combining both. Recognizing the importance of vocational education in preparing job-ready students, the Government of Indonesia is rapidly increasing the number of vocational schools and colleges. Despite the Indonesian government's efforts to increase the number of vocational schools and colleges, the demand for vocational education remains weak (Hendarman et al., 2016).

It is partially right. According to the Central Statistics Agency (BPS), there are still around 6.87 million unemployed people in Indonesia, and unemployment from vocational school graduates or VET holds the largest portion of the unemployment rate in Indonesia (Wiriadidjaja et al., 2019). The low demand for vocational education can be attributed to the negative image of the VET system. Parents in Indonesia usually view vocational school graduates negatively because of low salaries, unclear career paths, and low academic abilities compared to university graduates (Nagels, 2012).

Parents also think that students with general academic education fared better socio-economically than those with vocational education (Linten et al., 2014). In addition, male and female SMK students' lower academic abilities than their high school counterparts appear to have reduced their chances of pursuing higher education (Kadir et al., 2016). Therefore, Indonesian parents prefer that their children pursue general academic qualifications culminating in a university degree. Skills mismatch, referring to the gap between skills learned in school and skills needed in the job market, further weakens demand for vocational education (Wiriadidjaja et al., 2019).

The Indonesian government internally made various efforts to solve the problem through government policies. The president of Indonesia released a Presidential Regulation on Vocational Education and Training or also called Vocational Education and Training (VET), in 2007, which

aims to transform and increase the effectiveness of the education system concretely. Indonesian vocational education is based on providing programs oriented to market needs and practices that improve the abilities and skills of vocational school graduates, supported by the principle of participation in lifelong learning (Hendarman et al., 2016).

The Indonesian government, in addition, also increasing investment in the VET sector by establishing vocational schools that focus on technological and agricultural capabilities and allocating the development of vocational schools to become a priority aspect of national education level development by increasing the ratio of students enrolled in vocational education as well (Hendarman et al., 2016).

Germany and the Vocational Education Training System

Germany is widely known for its high-quality vocational education and training (VET) system. The two main features of the system are (1) an enterprise-based training program accompanied by a school-based component (one to two days per week), in which interns acquire upper secondary general education in core subjects (such as mathematics and German) and theoretical knowledge in their training work. This duality of practical and theoretical knowledge acquired in the workplace and vocational schools, (2) is accompanied by a private-public duality in governance structures (i.e., public governance of vocational schools, providing enterprise-based training governance) (Deissinger, 2015). In the recent recession, this so-called dual system has received much international attention, for example, in the US, UK, and Spain. While youth unemployment has increased rapidly in recent years in many (European) countries, this is not the case in Germany. Therefore, from the outside, Germany's low youth unemployment rate is attributed to the dual system (Hummelsheim & Baur, 2014).

In vocational education and training (VET), the German Federal Government is responsible for vocational training in enterprises, while Länder is responsible for vocational training in schools and vocational schools. Länder is responsible for public sector education, and vocational schools are under the responsibility of local authorities. All laws regarding schools, including vocational schools, are Land (territory) laws (Raggatt, 1988). The Federal Government is in charge of corporate, non-school VET.

The Federal Department of Education and Research (BMBF) is responsible for the centralized coordination of vocational education and training responsibility for fundamental issues in VET policy. The dual system is applied at the upper secondary level. After completing the dual system training, most participants took up jobs as skilled workers. Most of them take advantage of the opportunity to continue vocational training. Under certain circumstances, eligible students may attain the academic standards required to enter the Fachhochschule within one year of full-time schooling and continue to a higher level of education.

Participants who successfully continue their vocational education are allowed to continue their studies in higher education. Full-time vocational schools have the highest number of students. These schools prepare for vocational work or training in a dual system. Full-time vocational school attendance is carried out in the first year of training in a dual system. The right to study at a college or Fachhochschule can be obtained in several educational programs in full-time vocational schools (Hummelsheim & Baur, 2014).

A distinctive and unique thing that is owned by the German VET system is the duality program or dual system, which is a system that integrates vocational training schools owned by the government but also in collaboration with the private sector (Dittrich, 2010). This dual system of schools and internships in business companies ensures the output of a skilled and qualified workforce. This system is considered a mutually beneficial system for the various parties involved, namely to fulfill the needs of the parties while still upholding the goodness of both parties by improving the welfare of the community by increasing the community's economic competitiveness and also the active participation of the community in improving the national economic level which allows many people to contribute also benefit from the results of this system (Raggatt, 1988).

German dual system does have its advantages. This system allows youth without a university entry diploma to learn a trade and move fairly smoothly into skilled work. The German Dual System has attracted much attention in recent years, with several countries, especially Southern Europe,

trying to introduce a similar concept of structured apprenticeship leading to early vocational qualification (Hummelsheim & Baur, 2014). There is hope among politicians, in particular, that such a system can help address the problem of integrating school leavers into the education and vocational training sector and support the fight against youth unemployment (Reuter, 2019). However, Germany's vocational education and training system is more complex than it seems, with a still-heavy 'transition system' and full-time courses in vocational education and training in addition to apprenticeships and internships.

International Cooperation between Indonesia and Germany in the Ausbildung Program

Various studies have focused on cooperation between countries in the last decade. The recent international relations literature on cooperation has adopted a different approach. Instead of using a concept that only uses absolute gain and relative gain (Waltz, 2010), Snidal and Powell are modeling the conditions in which the two countries that work together can get the same benefit, namely the principle of mutual gain (Milner, 1992; Munn-Giddings, 2001; Snidal, 1991). In this article, international cooperation is the main focus of research on international development and education based on international assistance. Cooperation in the form of international development for education can be identified as a social network. In this network, the donor or the country that is the center and the recipient country are actors who are connected through the flow of cooperation. The network perspective is profound in this context because of its understanding of power and influence (Graf, 2013; Reuter, 2019; Shields & Menashy, 2019).

A bilateral cooperation relationship is a ridge that describes the reciprocal relationship between cooperation carried out by two countries while still respecting the rights and obligations of both countries in international agreements in order to provide added value to both countries even though the main purpose of establishing this bilateral cooperation is to pursue and fulfill their respective national interests. International cooperation is based on the concept of mutual respect and mutual gain (Munn-Giddings, 2001). Indonesia has carried out many forms of bilateral cooperation in bilateral relations. However, in this article, the bilateral international cooperation between Indonesia and Germany will be analyzed in depth, especially in the field of vocational education (McGrath, 2002).

The bilateral cooperation between Indonesia and Germany will focus on a relationship that will no longer only use government-to-government contact instruments. However, the efforts of the two countries to build people-to-people contact between the Indonesian people and the German people will be promoted and become an important point in contemporary bilateral relations between the two countries (Cherkes et al., 2016).

However, the main challenge remains that the theory of cooperation is based on the fulfillment of self-interest, where the results are beneficial to both parties and can be obtained by working together. There are several reasons why a country cooperates with other countries: (1) to increase economic prosperity, (2) to increase efficiency related to cost reduction, (3) to minimize problems that threaten common security, and (4) to reduce negative losses caused by individual countries. Actions that have an impact on other countries (Snidal, 1991).

The Indonesian government and the German government have declaratively committed to strengthening and deepening international cooperative relations in the field of vocational education by signing an agreement, namely the Joint Declaration of Intent between Indonesia and Germany on the Strengthening and Deepening of the Partnership in the Field of Technical and Vocational Education and Training. This agreement is the result of a long history of development cooperation between the two countries, which is mutually beneficial for both countries and is carried out in the education aspect and in various fields of cooperation. Cooperation in VET is one of the most prominent topics of cooperation among other collaborations that the two countries have done (Hendarman et al., 2016).

This collaboration was initiated by two state leaders, President Joko Widodo from Indonesia and German Chancellor Angela Merkel, who are committed to strengthening cooperative relations between the two countries with the VET instrument as one of the areas of cooperation (McGrath, 2002; Wiriadidjaja et al., 2019). This collaboration is based on the historical success of cooperation

in Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET), which has been going on for a long time. Also, this collaboration is expected to improve the quality of the VET system in Indonesia using the key elements possessed by the system that has been implemented for a long time and become the basis for implementing the VET system in Germany, which briefly applies a dualistic approach to formal education in education as well as conducting practical education in the field of education, which is carried out by collaborating with the private sector, which makes graduates have the expertise and skills that are needed by the market for labor demand which in fact, is demanded by private sector business drivers (Dittrich, 2010).

Dialogue about this cooperation has occurred at various levels. It is being intensively encouraged to accelerate the implementation of the basic principles that will be fulfilled by both parties in this cooperation. To improve and strengthen Indonesia-Germany cooperation in the field of VET, several points have been agreed declaratively by both parties to be implemented while developing the VET system. Some of these points are clearly stated in the cooperation agreement, which will be explained in the agreement.

The points that become the fulcrum of this article are actively providing a long way and green light for the citizens of the two cooperating countries to make significant exchanges. In addition, it is stated that German support is an integrated support that supports a sustainable linkage or relationship between the vocational high school system and vocational higher education, which until now is still very limited and can even be said to have not met certain international standards that need to be achieved by an institution. higher education in order to produce VET graduates who can have the right set of skills to work directly in the VET field. This is supported by the agreement about developing educators and instructors so that they can train and educate graduates to a certain standard by conducting training and exchanges for instructors and teachers of vocational education in Germany.

In addition, the German and Indonesian parties paved the way for the dualistic principle of the German VET system for various parties, including VET institutions, private companies owned by Indonesia and Germany, and Indonesian citizens to interact directly in this system. This collaboration allows the provision of training courses with a German dual system hosted by Indonesian citizens through the Indonesian-German Chamber of Commerce, which acts as one of the providers of course and training delivery services.

This course and training are based on interviews conducted by researchers with related resource persons, namely language training institutions and sending Indonesian students to Germany "Maxima Stiftung," referred to as Ausbildung or Ausbildungsplatz, translated as Internship Training. Maxima Stiftung is a private educational management institution that is half owned by Indonesian citizens and half owned by German citizens. Researchers had the opportunity to interview the operational director of Maxima Stiftung Indonesia, Reiner Bima Arigupta, on May 5, 2021, at the Maxima Stiftung Indonesia head office in Bandung.

Reiner clearly explained what he could explain about the Ausbildung program, one of the results of the Indonesia-Germany international cooperation program. When asked in general about Ausbildung, Reiner answered that this program can be followed by every Indonesian citizen aged 17 to 27 years. This program does not have physical requirements that need to be met. The only requirement that every Indonesian citizen who wants to participate in the Ausbildung program has to fulfill is the ability to speak German at a certain level, namely B1, as evidenced by a certificate of passing the German language test as a foreign language. The official German institution that promotes German language and culture is the Goethe-Institut (Komala, 2018).

Then after graduation, this management will find a vocational higher education institution that provides education in the field of VET in Germany according to the interests of every student who is an Indonesian citizen. After obtaining approval from the German embassy, having a visa permit, and being permitted by the Indonesian government through the regional manpower office, this Ausbildung student can go to Germany. Arriving in Germany, several facilities provided by this VET educational institution were waiting for Ausbildung students.

Some of them are housing, salaries, food allowance, transportation fees, uniforms, and several other educational support facilities according to the needs of the students and the field of education they take. The salary Ausbildung students receive is Rp 6,000,000, - or 300 Euros per

month. Ausbildung students carried out this Ausbildung program for three years, and only for three years were Ausbildung students contracted by the company without any official ties afterward. In Germany, Ausbildung students will receive formal education in theory classes for two days a week. Then they will conduct an internship training program in the field they are engaged in for three days a week, and the remaining two days, the students can enjoy their holidays.

This internship is one of the results of the dual system of VET education in Germany in close collaboration with private companies. In short, according to Reiner, this VET educational institution looks like a high school owned by Indonesian companies such as STT Telkom, Telkom Indonesia owns has a system if you want to work in the company. The students need to do education in the educational institution they have. or official ties.

After graduation, Ausbildung students will receive a certificate from the relevant educational institution stating that they have undergone internship training in Germany for three years with specific competencies, which can then be used to apply for jobs or continue their studies to a higher level, such as undergraduate and postgraduate. The certificate is valid for applying for a job that matches the qualifications of Ausbildung education participants throughout Europe and America. It makes them reliable experts with their abilities with German standards, which incidentally is one of the countries with an education level recognized as above average by the German government. Countries in the world.

However, according to Reiner also, the various facilities provided by Germany to the Ausbildung students are indeed fear in itself Germany for several things. First, Germany, with a background in a country with a very low crime rate but a high standard of living, has anxieties about foreigners and whether these foreigners can survive the harsh life in Europe.

Based on this skepticism, the private sector, which will employ the students part-time, needs to provide various supporting facilities so that these foreign nationals can survive in Germany. In addition, with the shortage in the labor market sector in European countries against the backdrop of a low labor force due to the low rate of population growth, Germany itself, according to Reiner, requires 17,500 foreign workers per year to meet its workforce needs. This makes Ausbildung students highly valued by Germany.

Based on the results of these interviews, it can be concluded that basically, Ausbildung Students are an outcome program of the Indonesia-Germany International Cooperation that focuses on sending Indonesian students to study and gain skills and certifications in specific vocational and training fields (VET) which will open various doors of work in the international world. This is what is expected by Indonesia as one of the parties collaborating in an international cooperation agreement to benefit from this cooperation.

The Dark Side of Vocational Education Cooperation

The main findings of this article will be presented in this sub-chapter. As previously discussed, although the principle of mutual gain (Snidal, 1991) used in the implementation of international cooperation in the field of vocational education carried out by Indonesia-Germany continues to be upheld and used as a guide, no ivory is not cracked. Since the first time processing various data and sources that are massively spread about the benefits and positive sides of this international cooperation program in the VET field, it seems that various aspects of this collaboration seem to lead to various aspects that can improve the quality of vocational education or vocational education in Indonesia (Nagels, 2012; Wiriadidjaja et al., 2019). On the other hand, Germany also gets many benefits from this cooperation. However, as a country that generally dominates and spends more capital than Indonesia, it seems odd if Germany only distributes aid as a good cause for Indonesia (Arel-Bundock et al., 2015).

Based on the theory of international relations, namely realism, every country in the current international system, which tends to be an anarchic international system, will encourage every country to seek strength and power, commonly called power, concerning other countries in the international arena (Morgenthau, 2014). According to realists, even the state will seek various relative advantages to achieve a goal, namely the national interest (Michelmann & Hocking, 1995; Pardo, 2017). In this case, the context of soft power from Germany is highly highlighted in

international cooperation efforts in education, which incidentally is a low-level affair in politics (Nye, 2008).

Germany, which has economic strength, uses Indonesia as a source of materials for industry, namely using Indonesia, which has abundant human resources. Germany uses these human resources to fulfill its need for skilled labor, which is necessary to make a strong industry. Unfortunately, Germany's population growth (Samani, 2018) based on research conducted by the Max Planck Institute for Demographic Research and population data according to the Federal Statistical Office (Destatis) 2021 (Kreyenfeld et al., 2012; Statistisches Bundesamt, 2021) continues to decline. The birth rate per year in Germany is lower than the death rate (mortality), which causes a low level of the German population overall despite the high life expectancy and the number of the population in terms of productive age (Kreyenfeld et al., 2012).

From the German point of view, the arrival of Ausbildung students from developing countries such as Indonesia is very beneficial. However, when viewed from the level of equality of welfare, even with conditions in Indonesia's point of view, the facilities provided and provided for Ausbildung students are very attractive and sufficient to meet the needs of the students. Economic level in Indonesian society, but in terms of equality, the income received by German and Indonesian people at the same level of education is very different (McGrath, 2002). As information obtained from a joint interview with Reiner, director of an education management company in Germany, an Ausbildung student from Indonesia only earns €300 a month for three years.

In contrast, based on research from several sources from other education management companies from European countries, an Ausbildung student with the same major and competence but from a European country gets three times more wages paid, around €1000 per month. Professional salary standards in Germany are far above what Ausbildung experts receive. The minimum wage for Germany is 9.35 euros per hour or 1584 euros per month professionally in 2020 (Nienaber, 2018; Statistisches Bundesamt, 2023).

This indicates that there is an unequal difference in terms of wages received by Indonesian citizens who undergo the Ausbildung program. In terms of macroeconomics, this can be categorized as a form of Neo-Capitalism that seeks to exploit intellectual workers with the mask of vocational education that gets honorariums, even though the use of these workers is, in fact, not following the labor laws of certain countries (Coleman & Underhill, 1998; Grieco et al., 1993; Ivanova et al., 1999). In addition, with the hustle and bustle of abroad and Europe minded as the blue continent, Indonesia's potential youth become interested in carrying out a job that can essentially be done for their own country with various pseudo-work ethos behind it. This is what in the study of International Relations in the view of eastern realism can be a doctrine to promote that western countries are superior and superior to eastern countries that are still developing (Baber, 2012; Raggatt, 1988).

This needs to be the concern of the Indonesian government to reduce the negative impact of the entry of western ideas that can affect the development and culture of the Indonesian nation if allowed to expand massively. In addition, the Indonesian people deserve to have a better life following the basic philosophy of life of the Indonesian people, namely Pancasila and the 1945 Constitution. Education development in the country also needs to be further improved to reach a certain level that can increase the quality of Indonesian human resources.

Continue to rise to achieve Indonesia's national interest (Hendarman et al., 2016; Muhtadi, 2008; Verawardina & Jama, 2019). Because, according to the perspective of sovereignty, by conducting international cooperation, the country's sovereignty will be eroded more or less by the emergence of an international regime that must be obeyed and ratified by the countries involved in the cooperation (Pardo, 2017). However, the author argues that it should be fine if you lose a little in order to get more results.

CONCLUSION

International cooperation between Indonesia and Germany with one of its outputs, namely the Ausbildung program, is a collaboration that is generally accepted and justified by the various facts presented in this article as a successful collaboration between Indonesia and Germany to fulfill their respective interests respectively. Especially in this research, Indonesia has had a direct, concrete

impact as a donor country. The impact that is felt the most is the increasing number of Indonesians who can continue their education in one of the countries with the best education levels in the world, especially in the vocational field. With this program, the job opportunities of the Indonesian people are increasingly wide open, not only competing domestically but also being able to penetrate the international market with the Ausbildung certification they have obtained. In addition, the Ausbildung program is also an arena for the transfer of knowledge and technology from Germany to Indonesia. With the increasing number of graduates from Ausbildung, the level of vocational education in Indonesia will gradually increase both in terms of teachers and graduates in Indonesia. Ausbildung students with work experience and training with high European qualifications can also practically transmit their knowledge to Indonesia. In addition, with the Ausbildung program, vocational students in Indonesia can increase, which ultimately encourages the development of the domestic economy.

On the other hand, for Germany, this program can solve its population problem by filling the many available education seats in Germany but needing more population in Germany. In addition, with the low population of Germany but with the form of the German state, which is economical and in the industrial sector, which incidentally requires a lot of skilled workers, the Ausbildung program can also be one of the answers to fill the shortage of skilled workers. This cooperation has also become the basis for strengthening Indonesia-Germany bilateral relations.

Therefore, it can be concluded that the Ausbildung program, either directly or indirectly, is the right effort and can be done to increase the level of education and the quality of Indonesian resources, which will also increase the level of economic welfare, increase the number of experts as a whole and improve the education system. vocational education that will boost the image of the Indonesian nation.

However, what is found in this article is that there is a dark side to the implementation of this international cooperation. International cooperation in VET is indeed based on the principle of mutual benefit. However, it still contains the national interests of both countries, like the Ausbildung students, who are skilled workers and intellectuals but are only paid a third of what they are supposed to earn under German law. This is evidence of the exploitation of cheap labor by industrial countries in developing countries.

REFERENCES

- Arel-Bundock, V., Atkinson, J., & Potter, R. A. (2015). The Limits of Foreign Aid Diplomacy: How Bureaucratic Design Shapes Aid Distribution. *International Studies Quarterly*, 59(3), 544–556. <https://doi.org/10.1111/isqu.12191>
- Baber, H. E. (2012). The Routledge Companion to theism. In C. Taliaferro, V. S. Harrison, & S. Goetz (Eds.), *The Routledge Companion to Theism*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203123294>
- Cherkes, B., Linda, S., & Kolomyeytsev, A. (2016). Theory and practice of academic education in architecture and urban design: From bilateral cooperation to international projects. *ARCHITECTURAL STUDIES Bohdan*, 2(1), 1–8. <https://journals.indexcopernicus.com/api/file/viewByFileId/275507.pdf>
- Coleman, W. D., & Underhill, G. R. D. (1998). *Regionalism and global economic integration: Europe, Asia, and the Americas*. Routledge.
- Deissinger, T. (2015). The German dual vocational education and training system as ‘good practice’? *Local Economy: The Journal of the Local Economy Policy Unit*, 30(5), 557–567. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0269094215589311>
- Dittrich, J. (2010). Can Indonesia learn something from the German model of TVET teacher education? *Educationist*, IV(2), 67–77. http://file.upi.edu/Direktori/JURNAL/EDUCATIONIST/Vol._IV_No._2-Juli_2010/02_Joachim_Dittrich.pdf

- Graf, L. (2013). The hybridization of vocational training and higher education in Austria, Germany, and Switzerland. In *The Hybridization of Vocational Training and Higher Education in Austria, Germany, and Switzerland*. Budrich UniPress. <https://doi.org/10.3224/86388043>
- Grieco, J., Powell, R., & Snidal, D. (1993). The relative-gains problem for international cooperation. *American Political Science Review*, 87(3), 729–743. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2938747>
- Hendarman, H., Suharti, S., Fahturahman, F., Khurniawan, A. W., Bakrun, B., Lestari, S. P., Ambarukmi, S., Panca, I. G., Masitoh, S., Kurniawan, K., Ibrahim, G. A., Purwadi, A., & Bakar, K. A. A. (2016). *Revitalisasi pendidikan vokasi Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan*. Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Republik Indonesia. <http://repositori.kemdikbud.go.id/5259/1/KgWeJzPa3E1B0G1rZxM6mQn4Jxi5F4SHv4E Z1j3 %281%29.pdf>
- Hummelsheim, S., & Baur, M. (2014). The German dual system of initial vocational education and training and its potential for transfer to Asia. *PROSPECTS*, 44(2), 279–296. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11125-014-9311-4>
- Ivanova, I., Arcelus, F. J., & Srinivasan, G. (1999). An assessment of the measurement properties of the human development index. *Social Indicators Research*, 46(2), 157–179. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1023/A:1006839208067#citeas>
- Kadir, S., Nirwansyah Nirwansyah, & Backrul, B. A. (2016). *Lee Kuan Yew School of Public Policy – Microsoft case study series on technical and vocational education and training*. Case title: *Technical and vocational education and training in Indonesia: Challenges and opportunities for the future*. Lee Kuan Yew School of Public Policy, National University of Singapore. https://lkyspp.nus.edu.sg/docs/default-source/case-studies/lkysppms_case_study_technical_and_vocational_education_and_training_in_indonesia.pdf?sfvrsn=e5c5960b_2
- Komala, N. K. (2018). *The strategies of Germany's cultural diplomacy through Goethe-Institut in Indonesia (2013-2016)*. President University. <http://repository.president.ac.id/xmlui/handle/123456789/237>
- Kreyenfeld, M., Zeman, K., Burkimsher, M., & Jaschinski, I. (2012). Fertility data for German-speaking countries: What is the potential? Where are the pitfalls? *Comparative Population Studies*, 36(2–3), 349–380. <https://doi.org/10.12765/CPoS-2011-06>
- Linten, M., Prustel, S., Woll, C., Roth, U., & Wurdak, A. (2014). *Attractiveness of vocational education and training: Permeability successful school-to-work transitions and international mobility*. UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED560494>
- McGrath, S. (2002). Skills for development: a new approach to international cooperation in skills development? *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 54(3), 413–430. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820200200207>
- Michelmann, H. J., & Hocking, B. (1995). Localizing foreign policy: Non-central governments and multilayered diplomacy. *International Journal*, 51(1), 174. <https://doi.org/10.2307/40203768>
- Milner, H. (1992). International theories of cooperation among nations: Strengths and weaknesses. *World Politics*, 44(3), 466–496. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2010546>
- Morgenthau, H. J. (2014). A realist theory of international politics. In *Realism reader* (pp. 53–59). Routledge. <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/realism-intl-relations/>
- Muhtadi, A. (2008). Studi komparatif sistem pendidikan di Jerman dan Korea Selatan. *Dinamika Pendidikan*, 15(1), 76–93. <https://journal.uny.ac.id/index.php/dinamika-pendidikan/article/view/4031>

- Munn-Giddings, C. (2001). Links between kropotkin' theory of 'mutual aid' and the values and practices of action research. *Educational Action Research*, 9(1), 149–158. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09650790100200144>
- Nagels, K. (2012). *Successful partnerships Indonesian technical and vocational education institutes working hand in hand with enterprises a word of welcome*. Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit. http://www.hmp-consultservice.de/PDF/broschuere_eng.pdf
- Nienaber, M. (2018, June 26). Germany to raise minimum wage to 9.35 euros in 2020. *Reuters*. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-germany-economy-wages-idUKKBN1JM1AS>
- Nye, J. S. (2008). Public diplomacy and soft power. *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 616(1), 94–109. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0002716207311699>
- Pardo, R. P. (2017). After hegemony. In *After Hegemony*. Macat Library. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781912282203>
- Raggatt, P. (1988). Quality control in the dual system of West Germany. *Oxford Review of Education*, 14(2), 163–186. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0305498880140203>
- Reuter, T. (2019). *German cultural diplomacy in Indonesia: Building cooperation in a changing world*. ifa (Institut für Auslandsbeziehungen). <https://nbn-resolving.org/urn:nbn:de:0168-ssoar-62399-2>
- Samani, M. (2018). Vocational education in the era of industry 4.0: An Indonesia case. *Proceedings of the International Conference on Indonesian Technical Vocational Education and Association (APTEKINDO 2018)*, 201(Aptekindo), 45–47. <https://doi.org/10.2991/aptekindo-18.2018.10>
- Shields, R., & Menashy, F. (2019). The network of bilateral aid to education 2005–2015. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 64(April), 74–80. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2017.07.003>
- Snidal, D. (1991). Relative gains and the pattern of international cooperation. *American Political Science Review*, 85(3), 701–726. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1963847>
- Statistisches Bundesamt. (2021). *Bevölkerung nach Nationalität und Geschlecht - Statistisches Bundesamt*. Destatis.De. <https://www.destatis.de/DE/Themen/Gesellschaft-Umwelt/Bevoelkerung/Bevoelkerungsstand/Tabellen/liste-zensus-geschlecht-staatsangehoerigkeit.html>
- Statistisches Bundesamt. (2023). *Minimum wages*. Destatis.De. <https://www.destatis.de/EN/Themes/Labour/Earnings/Minimum-Wages/Tables/minimum-wages-germany.html>
- United Nations. (2018). *Human Development Index (HDI)*. <https://hdr.undp.org/data-center/human-development-index#/indicies/HDI>
- Verawardina, U., & Jama, J. (2019). Philosophy TVET di era derupsi revolusi industri 4.0 di Indonesia. *Jurnal Filsafat Indonesia*, 1(3), 104–111. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jfi.v1i3.17156>
- Waltz, K. N. (2010). *Theory of international politics*. Waveland Press.
- Wiriadidjaja, A., Andriasanti, L., & Jane, A. (2019). Indonesia-Germany cooperation in vocational education and training. *Journal of Local Government Issues*, 2(2), 178–192. <https://doi.org/10.22219/LOGOS.Vol2.No2.178-192>