



International Relations Perspective of Sister City: Concept and Practices

Reynaldi Mandala Putra¹, Junita Budi Rachman, Windy Dermawan

Faculty of Social and Political Science, Padjadjaran University, Bandung, Indonesia

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received 16 September 2021

Received in revised form 13

October 2021

Accepted 14 November 2021

ABSTRACT

International relations is a study that discusses the relationship between actors in the international world. In its development, international relations are no longer dominated by the state as the main actor. International relations developed and expanded so that other actors, such as sub-national actors, emerged. Sub-national actors can include local or regional governments, one of which is the city government. Sister city is one form of international relations carried out by City Government actors. This paper will explain the concept and practice of sister city in International Relations. The concepts/theories used are International Relations and Sister city. While the research method used is descriptive qualitative by using the result of interviews, books, journals, websites and others as a reference. Conceptually, a sister city is a cooperative relationship carried out by two or more City Governments based on their similarities. However, in the practice, based on case studies, the reasons for sister city relationships are not always based on similarities. The practice of sister city relations has been carried out by many cities in the world in various fields. Sister cities also tend to be intertwined for a long time, but not a few have not been implemented effectively or even not running at all.

eyword:

Concept, Practice, Sister City, Cooperations, International Relations.

INTRODUCTION

International relations are basically a study that discusses the relationship between actors in the international world. In its development, the practice of international relations is no longer dominated by the state as the main actor. Today, actors in international relations

have developed and expanded so that other actors appear.

In this context, international relations at that time focused on the state's role as the leading actor and its influence on other countries in the struggle for power (Hadiwinata, 2017).

¹ Reynaldimandalap@gmail.com

The understanding of international relations keeps moving forward and gives a new perspective as a theoretical understanding of the international community or international system that discusses the relationships of various units such as states, nations, and supranational, transnational, and subnational groups that make up global or world politics (Bull, 1972).

Wider, international relations are interactions between various actors participating in international politics, including states, international organizations, non-governmental organizations, sub-national entities such as bureaucracies and local governments, and individuals (Mingst, 2004). The rise of actors outside the state in the international world has created a shift in the most fundamental thinking regarding the state as the main actor, one of which is local actors or local governments (Mukti, 2015; Fanggidae et al., 2016).

The emergence of actors other than the state also stimulates each local government to compete in promoting the potential of their respective regions to attract the attention of other parties in order to achieve cooperation that is expected to meet the needs of the region. Seeing this, a cooperation program started involving local governments such as sister cities.

Sister city is one form of international relations carried out by City Government actors. The concept of sister city also does not only refer to the relationship between cities because in practice, it also involves various levels of society.

Sister City is one of the concepts created because of the emergence of actors other than the state who can carry out international cooperation with one another. Sister city, also known as town twinning, is a concept of cooperation between two geographically and politically similar cities and aims to improve inter-cultural and individual relations. The term twin town, although not mandatory, often

has similar demographics and characteristics (Sinaga, 2010).

This study will explain the concept of a sister city from international relations perspective and describe its practice of it from the case of a sister city between Bandung and Fort Worth. This study also will try to explain the gap between the concept and the actual practice of the sister city.

METHODS

In this study, the authors try to link the changes in international actors and their relation to the emergence of the sister city concept through a qualitative descriptive approach or method.

The qualitative method is carried out by interviews as prime data with relevant informants to the sister city implementation, such as special staff in the Bandung City Cooperation Section who handles sister city relations between the Bandung City Government and the Fort Worth City Government. Then an interview was also conducted with one of the teachers in the city of Bandung who was directly involved in one of the student exchange cooperation programs. Data from interviews are used as new insights as an example of collaborative practice in sister cities.

This study also using data collection from books, reputable journals, websites and other scientific articles as reading material and theoretical analysis. In addition, the authors also add the results of interviews as a source of supporting data in writing this scientific paper.

Research-based on documents is carried out by managing the results of the documents that have been collected. These documents can be in the form of official documents from governments, organizations, online news and the results of previous internet-based research such as books and online journals.

RESULT AND DISCUSSIONS

International relations are complex relationships. The phenomenon of international relations is colored by various kinds of international interactions with different patterns, characteristics, and types of relationships. International relations as reflected in the form of interaction of the actors can be seen from three aspects, namely the intensity of the interaction, the number of actors involved, and the pattern of interaction. The intensity of interaction concerns the attitude of actors in international relations towards other actors. Patterns of international interaction can take the form of cooperation, competition, or conflict (Margono, 2015).

The presence of industrialization and modernity has provided significant developments in the international world. It is integrated into society globally and provides an overview of the expansion of international cooperation into an institutionalized practice by governments as an outstanding aspect of international relations since World War II. The government is present as part of a complex network of institutions and practices this network which is generally known as international cooperation. International cooperation is understood to have expanded and developed into various fields such as trade and finance, security, environment, education to health.

Basically, international cooperation is not only limited to the understanding of mutual assistance between governments and institutions from different countries. Although international cooperation tends to lead to this. International cooperation is understood to have a broader meaning. International cooperation means that governments and institutions do not make individual decisions and take individual actions. International cooperation also means governments and institutions develop common standards and create programs that take into account the benefits as well as problems that can potentially extend to more than one society

and even to the entire international community (Sato, 2010).

Today, society is integrated into the conditions of the international sphere in many ways and development promotion policies interact with these conditions from various sides such as trade, finance, education, health, job creation, science and technology, and the environment. These things are important things on the international agenda and are aspects of development that cannot ignore the fact that in these fields relations with the international sphere are a basic conditioning factor (Sato, 2010).

Furthermore, it is also understood that international cooperation is one of the long-term aspects of foreign policy. International cooperation programs allow the establishment of practices and institutions that provide consistency, stability, and security in the foreign relations of these countries. In addition, it should be noted that in contemporary international relations, the role played by non-governmental institutions is growing and through these cooperation programs spaces are created so that non-state actors and sub-national institutions can engage in activities of these countries as in foreign relations. States, cities and even groups representing segments of society to some extent develop initiatives, actions and even political cooperation with international field agencies (Sato, 2010, pp. 44-45).

The emergence of actors other than the state makes the concept of International Relations more decentralized where local governments have the ability to establish foreign cooperation with other local governments. This opens up opportunities for cooperation in various fields such as investment, education, culture, which can focus more on the needs of each region.

The form of regional autonomy in international relations is one of the methods used by sub-national actors or local governments to fulfill their regional interests instead of national interests. Because after all, only the sub-national actors themselves know more about the

region and its potential (Alam & Sudirman, 2020).

With this, it is hoped that each local government can find a more effective way of building cooperation with other parties which are expected to achieve goals and resolve shared problems. Where with knowledge about the advantages and potential of the region, it is hoped that more targeted strategies and policies will be created with greater potential for success.

Cremer, Gounder and Ramasamy (1996) say that these advantages are obtained in a foreign relations scheme using an integrated approach. The approach emphasizes international friendship between two or more sub-state actors through cultural understanding. Cremer, Gounder and Ramasamy continue that mutual understanding is formed through elements of culture, trade and economic development which will then become important indicators in building local foreign relations (Affandi, Alam, & Dermawan, 2020).

This cooperation will bring benefits to regions that have not succeeded in achieving the things mentioned earlier from their own countries because until now several countries are still having difficulties in distributing technology and building facilities fairly and equitably to each region.

Gibbs et al. (2015) said that there are several main characteristics in international relations carried out by local governments as a whole described as having characteristics which include first, involving two or more local governments in different countries and making mutual commitments to establish relations. Second, there is the signing of a formal agreement which is usually intended for an indefinite period or a long period of time. Third, each relationship tends not to be confined to a single project. Then lastly, the relationship will usually show a real example of success (Gibbs, Gooding, Woods, Pillora, & Smith, 2015).

Today's international relations are colored by various actors such as non-government actors (central government),

one of which is the local government, which is called paradiplomacy. Paradiplomacy is one part of diplomacy. Paradiplomacy is described as an activity carried out by local governments to create international relations and international cooperation with various foreign partners, such as governments abroad or the private sector. In developing countries, many of these diplomatic activities are carried out by local governments (Lecours, 2008).

Rosenau (1997) sees that the relationship between Governments other than the state has a more complex pattern than a fixed pattern. Furthermore, Rosenau also explained that the pattern of this relationship is no longer exclusively owned by the state and its national government. Looking at Rosenau's opinion, the patterns that exist in International Relations such as conflict and cooperation can involve a wider range of other actors such as sub-state governments, Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), Multi National Corporates (MNC) and Regime International. The presence of sub-national government actors is a tangible manifestation of the development of the world of international relations. Paradiplomacy then emerged as a concept that was present and could be explained as a response by the City Government in responding to globalization, as well as the inability of the state to protect the entities under it in the face of the globalization process (Alam & Sudirman, 2020, pp. 33-34).

Conceptually, paradiplomacy provides a new picture in the study of international relations that actors can be present in various forms of government layers within one country. In practice, sub-national actors such as local governments have their own rights and sovereignty to involve themselves in foreign relations in the international world. Paradiplomacy can be said as the emergence of the ability of actors other than the state in the capacity to issue foreign policy. Actors other than the state in question are municipal governments, provincial governments,

federations and units granted special autonomy by the state (Alam & Sudirman, 2020, p. 34).

Local governments are present as one of the actors in the world of international relations and tend to cooperate with other regional governments abroad. The cooperation is carried out by local governments as an effort to increase the potential of their respective regions. One part of the Regional Government that carries out this collaboration is the City Government.

Several regions in the world have characteristics and similarities to each other, where some of them have the same interests so that it will be more profitable if both parties cooperate either in advancing their area or in solving problems that are being faced together. So the City Government began to establish cooperative relationships with actors who are administratively equivalent.

In addition, in the application of cooperation there are two types that can distinguish the level of position in each City that builds the partnership. First, symmetrical relations, in which the two cities stand parallel, give and receive in a balanced way in various implementations of cooperation programs. Second, asymmetrical relations, i.e. the two cities do not stand parallel, where one city gives more to its partner city based on the added value it has, such as technology, experience and financial capabilities (Silalahi, 1999).

Some of the economic advantages of local foreign relations, such as those carried out by the City Government are building business networks, establishing trade routes and market routes, strengthening business reputation and image and reducing bargaining costs. In addition, this collaboration can also facilitate joint research and attract newcomers, such as foreign students, visitors and tourists in the context of tourism which can then be further developed as a basis for creative economic opportunities. The form of cooperation

between the City Government is usually called a sister city.

Concept of Sister City

By looking at the pattern of spread of technology that is still uneven in the world, several regions in developing countries are trying to reach developed countries in the hope of building a cooperative relationship that will have a positive impact on the country, especially in certain fields. Seeing this, efforts have been made by various layers of government through an international collaboration such as a sister city.

Sister city is basically an international relationship carried out by the City Government with City Governments in other countries. City Governments in sister city relations tend to carry out cooperation which is expected to achieve the interests of their respective cities.

The Sister Cities International organization explains that the sister city relationship is a long-term partnership relationship with a broader understanding between two communities in two countries, such as cities, counties and states. This relationship is a relationship that is carried out officially and is recognized after an agreement is signed by an elected official to become a sister city partner. One City has the possibility to establish sister city relationships with more than one City, with community involvement ranging from a few community members to hundreds of volunteers (Sister Cities International, 2021).

The occurrence of cooperation in this formal form is also an official relationship carried out to promote peace through mutual respect for each other, mutual understanding and cooperation carried out by one individual to one community at the same time (Government of Cambridge, 2021).

The extent of understanding of the concept of a sister city such as community involvement in sister city relationships is also explained by Villiers, et al. (2006) which says that the words "town" and "city"

in terms of sister cities or twinning communities also involve the role of civil society and are not only limited to the government. There are three main sectors involved in the sister city concept, namely local government, business and various kinds of the wider community who are involved voluntarily (Villiers, Coning, & Smit, 2006).

Sister Cities International is an organization that includes representatives from various groups who can be involved in sister cities, such as non-profit organizations, the City Government, the private sector and other civil organizations. Sister cities can develop from a number of things such as pre-existing relationships between Mayors, trade relations, historical relationships, demographic relationships, expatriate communities, shared geographical challenges, faith-based groups and personal experiences from studying or working abroad to the existence of wedding (Sister Cities International, 2021).

Broadly speaking, the members of Sister Cities International are independent organizations accompanied by a management structure. The organization is an organization run by various levels of society such as volunteer groups. Representatives of local institutions, and representatives of formal agencies such as City Government and Mayors or a combination of these.

Typically, sister cities are governed by a Board of Directors or a Commission. Some sister city relationships are also run by local institutions such as museums, cultural centers or chambers of commerce. Usually the contacts for sister city organizations are at the Mayor's office, the tourism or visitor bureau, the international affairs office, the protocol office or the economic development office (Sister Cities International, 2021).

In some literature, sister city is understood as a concept of 'movement'. This movement is carried out by local or sub-state actors to achieve an interest. Nick Clarke (2011 in Ogawa)

conceptualizes a sister city or town twinning into three depending on the purpose of implementation. Clarke further explained that the concept of sister city or town twinning should be done in 3 ways. The first is as a tool, to produce topological proximity for actors with far topographic locations. Second, a repertoire, whether in the form of formal agreements, trade delegations, joint projects to exchange visits and so on, will form a set in the high-level repertoire of peace activists, council officials and others. The last is as a model, when sister city or town twinning in terms of set or repertoire has proven to be very active and has been used by different interest groups for different contexts with many different purposes. (Ogawa, 2012).

A sister city relationship is a long-term partnership strategy that should be done profitably for the parties involved, and identifying potential partners is one of the important foundations for developing a successful relationship. Sister Cities International explains that there is a need for common ground in identifying potential partners. First is the size of the population, although there are differences in the number of populations for each city is normal, but choosing a city with a similar population size tends to provide better symmetry between the City Government, community groups, private organizations can also provide an overview of the challenges and opportunities similar.

The second is geographical similarity, geographical similarity can be in the form of climate similarities, ports and so on. The existence of geographical similarities can mean that each city and its partners can share or exchange information and knowledge about the challenges and opportunities related to the quality of each city. Third is the need for similarities in the industrial sector. The existence of industrial similarities can lead to sister city relationships, as is the case between the sister cities of Bandung City and Fort Worth City which is motivated by cooperation in the aviation industry between PT. Dirgantara Indonesia in

Bandung with PT. BELL Helicopter in Fort Worth (Joanita, 2017).

Fourth is academic institutions, cooperation programs involving academic institutions can be in the form of student exchanges and the need for similar partner institutions that must be identified from the start. The fifth is cultural institutions, which can be in the form of museums, music venues and community centers. Sixth is a pre-existing relationship, the relationship is not limited to formal matters such as relations between Mayors but can also be in the form of trade relations, diaspora, religious-based groups to marriage. Then the last is the existence of historical or ancestral relationships (Sister Cities International, 2021).

It is understood that the sister city relationship is officially carried out after the signing of a cooperation agreement in the form of an MoU or the like. The sister city relationship is also a way to build the community. Sister city that is carried out is not only in certain fields. The sister city covers wider fields of cooperation, such as business, trade, technical exchange, to education, such as student exchange.

There are four advantages to sub-national actors from building local foreign relations in a sister city scheme. First, sub-national actors from developed countries can open up opportunities for the availability of experts in various fields. Second, sub-national actors from developed countries can achieve higher education. Third, sub-national actors from developing countries can benefit because sub-national actors from industrialized countries are always looking for investment opportunities. Then fourth, through cultural development programs, people from developing countries can be recognized by western society who can politically assert their cultural identity (Affandi, Alam, & Dermawan, 2020).

O' Toole (2001) said that the concept of twinning or sister itself is a dynamic concept and has continued to change since its inception. O' Toole identified three (3) stages of development that were

understood from the results of his research in Australia which concluded that there was a shift in focus from friendly ties to economic development. These three stages are distinct but interconnected and overlapping phases, the phases consist of Associative Phase (twinning based on friendship, cultural exchange), Reciprocatative Phase (twinning based on educational exchange, people exchange) and Commercial Exchange Phase (twinning based on economic development) (Villiers, Coning, & Smit, 2006).

The concept presented by O'Toole explains that the sister city is a dynamic concept characterized by three phases. The first phase is a phase based on cultural exchange. The second phase is an advanced phase marked by cooperation in the field of education and more involvement of the community. Then the last phase is a phase based on cooperation as an effort to develop the economic sector.

There are several steps that must be passed to formalize the sister city agreement. The first thing to do is to form a committee that will represent a community that will be involved. The community has links with the sector that will be carried out in the framework of sister city. Then there is the preparation of background information regarding the types of activities to be carried out, especially matters relating to local activities such as the profile of human resources, education systems, cultural institutions and so on. The sister city committee will then submit a proposal to the relevant local government. After the activity proposals begin to be processed, one person from the committee members will be appointed as the person in charge of the sister city program. Then this cooperation protocol will be compiled by the city government as a form of intention to establish sisterly relations with other cities which later the protocol will be sent officially via diplomatic post (Roldan, 2018).

Practice of Sister City

Initially sister city itself is a term used for inter-city governments that

establish friendship, until finally the purpose of sister city itself began to shift towards mutually beneficial cooperation for both cities. The term sister city itself first appeared in 1920 in Europe, which began with the collaboration between the city of Keighley, West Yorkshire in England with the city of Poix Du Nord, France. According to the promise, the city of Poix-du-Nord was made a "host city" by Keighley, while a formal deed exchange took place only in 1986 (Telegraph & Argus, 2021).

The term sister city was also used by the President of the United States, Eisenhower in 1954 in a speech in 1954. Eisenhower explained that sister city type-relationships (SCTR) or relationships such as sister cities aim to increase international understanding and promote peace by promoting international communication and exchange. directly at the individual level through City-to-City affiliation (Cremer & Ramasamy, 1988). In addition to sister city, another term that is widely used for cooperation between these cities is twin city or also called twinning town. The use of the term sister city is widely used by several countries in Europe and America which then began to be used by other countries.

In addition to these terms, there is also the use of a term called friendship city. The use of the term "sister city" sometimes has different meanings from "friendship city". In general, friendship cities are less formal than sister cities. Some cities use the term friendship city as an initial level in establishing City-level relationships, after the relationship is getting stronger and the partner city is sure that they want to have a long-term relationship, then the relationship will become a sister city (Sister Cities International, 2021).

The following are the stages of sister city:

First is scoping. The assessment is carried out by exchanging the potential of the regions between the two parties. This exchange can take advantage of the representative office of a foreign country in

Indonesia or the representative office of the Republic of Indonesia abroad.

Second is signing of the Letter of Intent (LoI). If the desire to cooperate gets a positive response from each party, then both parties can sign a Letter of Intent (LoI).

Third, the preparation of a cooperation plan. After the signing of the LoI, the City Government immediately prepares a Cooperation Plan or Term of Reference and Plan of Action that describes the aims and objectives of the cooperation and the benefits obtained.

Fourth, city Representative Council Approval. The Cooperation Plan, Plan of Action and LoI that have been signed by both parties are then submitted to the City Representative Council for approval.

Fifth, request for Government Facilitation. After the approval of the City Representative Council, the City Government submits a letter to the Minister of Home Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia requesting the facilitation of cooperation. This Application Letter is used as a requirement to determine the discussion of the Draft MoU by involving the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, the State Secretariat of the Republic of Indonesia, the Ministry of Home Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia and other relevant Ministries/institutions.

Sixth, drafting a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU). The MoU for sister city is classified as an International Agreement, so that its preparation was carried out by the Directorate General of Law and International Agreements of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia as an international law expert. The draft which has been prepared by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia is then discussed at the Interkem (inter-ministerial) forum consisting of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, the State Secretariat of the Republic of Indonesia, the Ministry of Home Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia and other relevant ministries/institutions.

The Interkem Forum then initialed the draft MoU that had been discussed. The draft MoU resulting from the interkem meeting was submitted by the Ministry of Home Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia to be forwarded to Indonesian representatives abroad to be communicated with the sister city candidates to obtain responses.

Seventh, signing of the MoU. The draft MoU which has been approved by foreign cooperation partners by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia is then submitted to the Ministry of Home Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia and the relevant City Government for the process of proposing a Power of Attorney (Full Power).

The City Government then submits an application for the issuance of a Power of Attorney (Full Power) to the Minister of Foreign Affairs through the Minister of Home Affairs by attaching an initialed draft of the MoU. The Secretary General of the Ministry of Home Affairs on behalf of the Minister of Home Affairs sends a letter of recommendation to the Minister of Foreign Affairs for the issuance of a Power of Attorney (Full Power) signing the MoU to the official whose name is listed in the Power of Attorney (Full Power) according to a predetermined date.

After the Power of Attorney (Full Power) is issued, the City Government/Mayor official whose name is issued a Power of Attorney (Full Power) can sign an MoU with the City Government official of the partner in the foreign cooperation. Signing can be done at home or abroad. The signed MoU is sent to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs to be stored as a State Document. The Ministry of Foreign Affairs issues an official copy that is legal as a guide for the City Government and the Ministry of Home Affairs.

Eighth, implementation of cooperation. After the MoU is signed, the cooperation document binds both parties and the agreed programs can begin to be implemented. The City Government forms

a work team as the daily implementer of the agreed results of activities. The City Government can allocate funds that may arise in the cooperation through the APBD and other legitimate sources.

Ninth, evaluation of the implementation of cooperation. The Ministry of Home Affairs and other relevant Ministries/institutions will conduct Monitoring and Evaluation periodically to find out the achievements and results of the cooperation in accordance with the Monitoring and Evaluation Instruments compiled by the Ministry of Home Affairs.

And last one is reporting on the implementation of cooperation. The City Government submits a report to the Ministry of Home Affairs regarding the implementation of the cooperation program according to the format contained in the Monitoring and Evaluation Instrument. The results of the evaluation can be used as a basis for consideration of plans for further sister city with other partners in cities abroad (Bagian Kerjasama Kota Bandung, 2021).

Today, sister cities have developed with the involvement of many City Governments from various countries to establish relationships with other City Governments. It is understood that one City Government can have sister city relationships with several City Governments at once. An example is the City of Fort Worth which is recorded to have sister city relationships with 8 Cities in the World.

One of the understandings of the sister city concept is the relationship between the City Governments due to the similarity of characteristics such as politics, geography or the similarity of historical backgrounds. An example of the sister city is the sister city between Bandar Aceh City (Indonesia) and Samarqand City (Uzbekistan). This collaboration is motivated by the similarity of history and socio-culture which then encourages the two City Governments to cooperate (Lyndi & Iqbal, 2018).

In practice, sister city is not always and must be motivated by the similarities in characteristics shared by the two cities. In developments in the international world, sister city is carried out for various reasons. One of them is the sister city collaboration between the City of Fort Worth and the City of Bandung. The sister city between the City of Fort Worth and the City of Bandung began with a collaboration between PT. BELL in Fort Worth with IPTN in Bandung. Then the cooperation was inaugurated with the signing of the MoU in 1990 (Prokopim Kota Bandung, 2021).

Sister city is basically a form of cooperation between the City Government. In practice, cooperation is not always reciprocal, it can also be in the form of assistance provided by one city to another. Such as the cooperation in the Green City program carried out by the City of Kyushu, Japan and the City of Surabaya, Indonesia. Green City is one of the programs carried out by the Surabaya City Government as an effort to reduce waste management problems, improve water quality and develop community participation (Nuralam, 2018).

Kyushu City provides assistance in the form of learning about waste management through the 3R (Reuse, Reduce, Recycle) program. The City of Kyushu was chosen by the Surabaya City Government because the City of Kyushu is one of the cities that has succeeded in creating sophisticated environment-based industry and technology.

The implementation of the sister city program has complex reasons and objectives, where each practice will not be the same between each other. Each region will develop programs in accordance with what it wants to achieve at that time with the hope that it can be carried out better if it is taken through a sister city program that involves other parties to jointly achieve these goals.

Petaling Jaya City (Malaysia) and Bandung City (Indonesia) are examples of two cities that have collaborated to improve the creative economy. This collaboration is

to help the City of Bandung to improve the economy through the Little Bandung program. The program is a program to encourage the participation of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) in the City of Bandung so that they can be active in the international trade economy (Anggia, Rohayatin, & Munawar, 2020).

The sister city program is carried out with various objectives in various different fields. One form of cooperation that is most often held is the student exchange program. Fort Worth is one of the cities that offers student exchange programs to its 8 sister cities every year called the International Leadership Academy (ILA). ILA is an exchange program for high school level that has been carried out since 1989 until now (Fort Worth Sister Cities International, 2021).

Although cooperation tends to be implemented, sister city relationships are not always effective in achieving their goals. As the result of research on the effectiveness of sister city between Semarang City and Brisbane City in 2002-2007 by Eka Titiyani. The collaboration is said to have not been effective because it has not reached the target to broaden the knowledge of the people of the City of Semarang regarding the knowledge and culture of the City of Brisbane. In fact, many Semarang people do not know and do not understand the cooperation between the two cities (Titiyani, 2014).

Then there is the youth exchange program conducted by the City of Fort Worth every year, namely ILA. Bandung is one of the cities that sent a delegation to the City of Fort Worth to be involved in the program since 2010. In practice, there are still some things that are said to be ineffective. Mr. Herman Benyamin as the assistant for students from Bandung in his interview explained that the socialization to send representatives from Bandung was still not effective. Marked because of the lack of participation and knowledge of students in the city of Bandung about the program. Mr. Herman also explained further that there was no financial

assistance from the Government in order to reduce the cost of the delegation's departure because it was still using private funds (Benyamin, 2021).

Practically, sister city relationships do not always run effectively, but there are still relationships that run consistently. The sister city relationship between Yokohama City, Japan and Mumbai City, India is one example. The sister city of the two cities was inaugurated in 1965 and has been running for more than 50 years. Like Yokohama City, Mumbai City is also a city that has a history of development as a port city.

Since the establishment of the sister city relationship, the two cities have cooperated a lot, such as exchange program activities centered on the field of Japanese culture. There was also a prize given by the Mumbai City Government in the form of an elephant which was presented for presenting a Japanese-style garden in Mumbai. The relationship between the two cities is maintained by holding an exchange program at the city level which is held every five years (Japan Economic Foundation, 2016).

CONCLUSION

Understanding the concept of a sister city as a 'sister' city is no longer based on the similarities between one city and another. In practice, the background of sister city relationships has varied. It doesn't always follow the concept, the sister city background can be implemented for various reasons. From several previous research results, it is shown that sister city can run in various fields and for a long period of time. However, many of these cooperation programs have not been implemented effectively. One of the reasons for the ineffectiveness of sister cities is due to the lack of public knowledge about sister city. Lack of local government socialization causes the lack of community participation in the cooperation program. Further research is needed regarding the gap in this

study. this relates to a broader case study on the practice of sister city.

REFERENCES

- Affandi, R. N., Alam, G. N., & Dermawan, W. (2020). The Government of Bandung City's Effort in Utilizing Foreign Sources: Case Study in Sister City Cooperation. *Cosmogov: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*, 132-133.
- Alam, G. N., & Sudirman, A. (2020). Paradiplomacy Pemerintah Kota Bandung Melalui Kerja Sama Sister City. *Jurnal Ilmiah Hubungan Internasional*, 32.
- Anggia, G., Rohayatin, T., & Munawar, L. (2020). Strategi Kerjasama Sister City Kota Bandung dengan Petaling Jaya di Bidang Ekonomi Perdagangan. *Jurnal Caraka Prabhu*, 181.
- Bagian Kerjasama Kota Bandung. (2021, June 6). <http://kerjasama.bandung.go.id>. Retrieved from <http://kerjasama.bandung.go.id>: <http://kerjasama.bandung.go.id/ksln/ksdpl>
- Bell, D. (1989). *The Third Technological Revolution and Its Possible Socio-economic Consequences*. Salford: University of Salford.
- Benyamin, H. (2021, May 28). Delegasi International Leadership Academy dari Kota Bandung. (R. M. Putra, Interviewer)
- Bull, H. (1972). *The theory of International Politics, 1919-1969*. London: Oxford University Press.
- Chan, S. (1984). *International Relations in Perspective: The Pursuit of Security, Welfare, and Justice*. Macmillan.
- Cremer, R. D., & Ramasamy, B. (1988). The Economic Role of International Sister-City Relationships Between New Zealand and Asia. *Journal of the Asia Pacific Economy*, 449.

- Fanggidae, I. G., Fajri, H., & Pandhu, Y. (2016). Menelisik Kinerja Governance di Daerah Otonomi Khusus Papua Barat. *Jurnal Natapraja: Kajian Ilmu Administrasi Negara*, 4(1), 91–106. <https://doi.org/10.21831/jnp.v4i1.12618>
- Fort Worth Sister Cities International. (2021, June 16). www.fwsistercities.org. Retrieved from www.fwsistercities.org/join-in/apply-for-youth-programs/
- Gibbs, M., Gooding, A., Woods, R., Pillora, S., & Smith, R. (2015). Sister Cities and International Alliances. *Australian Centre of Excellence for Local Government*, 3.
- Government of Cambridge. (2021, August 5). www.cambridgema.gov. Retrieved from www.cambridgema.gov/departments/peacecommission/SisterCitiesSummary#:~:text=Cambridge%20has%20seven%20official%20sister,Tsukuba%2C%20Japan%3A%20established%20October%201983
- Hadiwinata, B. S. (2017). *Studi dan Teori Hubungan Internasional: Arus Utama, Alternatif dan Reflektif*. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia.
- Japan Economic Foundation. (2016, April). <https://www.jef.or.jp/>. Retrieved from https://www.jef.or.jp/journal/pdf/206th_Cultural_Exchange.pdf
- Joanita, I. (2017). Kerja Sama Siter City Kota Bandung dengan Kota Fort Worth. *Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta*, 14.
- Lecours, A. (2008). Political Issues of Paradiplomacy: Lessons From Developed World. *Netherlands Institute of International Relations 'Clingendael'*.
- Lyndi, I. F., & Iqbal, M. P. (2018). City Partnership (Sister City) Between Banda Aceh (The Republic of Indonesia) and Samarqand (The Republic of Uzbekistan) on Trade and Industry in Banda Aceh. *Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa Bidang Hukum Kenegaraan*, 384.
- Margono. (2015). Aktor Non-Negara dalam Hubungan Internasional. *Jurnal Pendidikan Pancasila dan Kewarganegaraan*, 108.
- Mingst, K. A. (2004). *Essentials of International Relations*. New York: W. W. Norton.
- Mukti, T. A. (2015). Paradiplomacy: Bangkitnya Aktor Lokal di Fora Internasional. *The Politics: Jurnal Magister Ilmu Politik Universitas Hasanuddin*, 86.
- Nuralam, I. P. (2018). Peran Strategis Penerapan Konsep Sister City Dalam Menciptakan Surabaya Green-City. *Journal of Applied Business Administration*, 148.
- Ogawa, A. (2012, August 5). core.ac.uk. Retrieved from [core.ac.uk](https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/161440647.pdf): <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/161440647.pdf>
- Prokopim Kota Bandung. (2021, June 15). humas.bandung.go.id. Retrieved from [humas.bandung.go.id: https://humas.bandung.go.id/profil/bj-habibie-mak-comblang-kota-bandung-dengan-fort-worth](https://humas.bandung.go.id/profil/bj-habibie-mak-comblang-kota-bandung-dengan-fort-worth)
- Roldan, M. D. (2018). Local Governments as International Players: Examining Town Twinning as a Mechanism. *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research*, 503.
- Sato, E. (2010). International Cooperation: An Essential Component of International Relations . *Revista Eletrônica de Comunicação, Informação e Inovação em Saúde*, 42.
- Silalahi, R. P. (1999). Sister Cities Relations: Yesterday, Today and

Tomorrow. *Forum Manajemen Prasetya Mulya*, p. 30.

Sinaga, H. O. (2010). *Otonomi Daerah dan Kebijakan Publik: Implementasi Kerjasama Internasional*. Bandung: LEPSINDO.

Sister Cities International. (2021, May 18). *sistercities.org*. Retrieved from *sistercities.org*:
<https://sistercities.org/about-us/what-is-a-sister-city-3/>

Sister Cities International. (2021, August 29). *sistercities.org*. Retrieved from *sistercities.org*:
<https://sistercities.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/Guide-to-establishing-a-sister-city-relationship.pdf>

Telegraph & Argus. (2021, June 15). *www.thetelegraphandargus.co.uk*. Retrieved from *www.thetelegraphandargus.co.uk*:
<https://www.thetelegraphandargus.co.uk/news/8030388.keighley-celebrates-twin-town-jubilee/>

Titiyani, E. (2014). Efektivitas Kerjasama Sister City Kota Semarang (Indonesia) dengan Brisbane (Australia) Tahun 2002-2007. *Jom FISIP*, 3-7.

Villiers, J. C., Coning, T. J., & Smit, E. v. (2006). Towards an Understanding of the Success factors in International Twinning and Sister-City Relationships. *S.Afr.J.Bus.Manage*, 2.