



AN ANALYSIS OF CAREER DEVELOPMENT OF WOMEN CIVIL SERVANTS IN MINISTRY OF FINANCE

Sonya Elfadhila¹ and Teguh Kurniawan

Faculty of Administrative Sciences, Universitas Indonesia, Indonesia

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received 9 September 2019

Received in revised form 19
December 2019

Accepted 4 February 2020

ABSTRACT

In global there has been an increase in the number of women who work in the public sector including Indonesia. However, it did not have much effect on the number of women civil servants representation in high managerial or structural positions as part of career development in PNS Management. This condition is also faced by the Ministry of Finance, which have a high commitment to the implementation of pro-gender staff development policies. This study aims to find out how the career development of women civil servants in the Ministry of Finance through the post-positivism approach uses qualitative methods with literature studies and in-depth interviews with officials related to career development. Theories from Viki and Fiona regarding women's career development through individual and organizational aspects are used in conducting analyzes. The results showed that the career development of women civil servants in the Ministry of Finance had not been running optimally. The high number of male civil servants affects the low number of women civil servants who will occupy higher-level structural positions. Furthermore, it can be seen in the individual variables that there is still a lack of interest in female civil servants participating in education and training, and also not all female civil servants get female mentors who can become a role models because mentors are direct supervisors of employees. while the organizational variables indicate that there are still gender issues faced by female civil servants in the Ministry of Finance.

Keyword:

career development, women
civil servants, Ministry Of
Finance.

INTRODUCTION

Paradigm shift at the global level impacts organisations in creating workers

diversity and equal employment opportunity in human resources specifically women in the last few decades. Management Strategy

¹sonya_dila@yahoo.co.id

of Human Resources (HRM) in recruiting women talents is defined as a sustainable challenge in discovering and retaining talented employees in order to achieve the organisation's objectives and milestones in the future. The revolution of increasing women's participation in the workforce significantly has shown new issues (Probosiwi, 2015) regarding the lack of women's representation in high-level managerial positions or decision makers from the total number of human resources in the private and public sector.

The low level of representation of women in high managerial positions in the public sector is a global problem that occurs in almost all countries (Burke et al, 2005). Starting from developed countries to developing countries including the United States (Ballard, 2015), the Netherlands (Groeneveld, 2009), Australia (Mcmohon et al, 2006), New Zealand (Hurst et al, 2015), South Korea (Yujin, 2015), India (Wesarat, 2017), Pakistan (Shabbir, 2017), Sri Lanka (Tharsini et al, 2016), Bangladesh (Equality, 2000) to Indonesia (Krissetyanti, 2018). A number of these studies state that the representation of women in high managerial positions in the public sector brings a different perspective on public policy, and has an important role in decision-making positions that determine the direction of strategic policy, especially in relation to problems faced by women.

Women in high-level managerial positions or decision makers in an organisation tend to show different leadership styles compared to men, women often show democratic and transformational leadership style which proves to be as effective as male's leadership style (Equality, 2000). Furthermore it is emphasized by the report Mapping Indonesia's Civil Service 2018 published by World Banks clearly stating that women leadership in bureaucracy can solve problems and more policies and programs in favor of women.

In relation to the governmental

administration, bureaucracy is the spearhead of public service implementation that encompasses various governmental policies and development programs starting with the human resources of the country's apparatus consisting of women and men. As a result, bureaucracy needs to reflect the society that it serves which essentially is the composition of women that represents half of the world's population (Verma, 2015). Puskapol UI (2012) in its research also states that a representative bureaucracy is able to accommodate various social issues, in particular women who are required to supervise national regulations about women issues and the government's adherence in the implementation process.

Civil servants (PNS) in Indonesia tend to become a lifetime career option from the acceptance day until the pension age at 58 years old through multiple promotion and echelon levels that will automatically take place every 4 years up through its maximum limit of promotion aligned with education level and position. In the government's bureaucracy, the term Career Position is known, which means a position among the bureaucracy environment that can only be held by a civil servant after fulfilling preliminary requirements. Moreover, a Career Position in a bureaucracy consists of structural and functional roles. Structural role/position is a position that encompasses roles, responsibilities, authority and rights of PNS in leading an organisation with echelon levels as stages of structural role (Presidential Regulation Number 11 year 2017). The mechanism of career development in civil servant has been regulated in Law Number 5 year 2014 about State Civil Apparatus and Presidential Regulation Nomor 11 year 2017 regarding civil servant management that shall be executed through merit-based process based on qualifications, competency,

Table 1. The Number and Percentage of Civil Servants by Gender in Indonesia (2015-2018)

%	Men	Women	Total
2015	2,354,226 (51.25%)	2,239,378 (48.75%)	4,593,604
2016	2,217,486 (50.69%)	2,156,855 (49.31%)	4,374,341
2017	2,143,163 (49.69%)	2,146,233 (50.04%)	4,289,396
2018	2,071,310 (49.49%)	2,114,193 (50.51%)	4,185,503

Source : Internal Data from National Civil Service Agency (2018)

performance review and the needs of governmental organisations without differentiating on gender, cultural group, religion, race and other groups by taking into account integrity and morale (Satlita, Yanuardi, & Ahdiyana, 2015).

The quantity of women civil servants from number's perspective as an entirety surpasses the number of men civil servants. Referring to the data from National Civil Service Agency (BKN) in 2018 as described on Table 1, from 4.185.503 civil servants, 2.114.193 or 50.51% is women and the remainder 2.071.301 (49.49%) is men. The distribution of women civil servants in Indonesia shows an increasing trend in the last few years, but the asymmetry is clearly visible if we take a closer look on the comparison between the composition of women civil servants to men civil servants in structural positions.

Based on National Civil Service Agency's (BKN) internal data, from the total of 461.468 structural positions available across all government's institutions in 2018, the number of positions held by women civil servants is 151.862 or 32.91%. The number is still significantly low compared to structural positions held by men of 67.09% or 309.624 positions.

The number is still significantly low compared to structural positions held by men of 67.09% or 309.624 positions. The discrepancy of the proportion between women is even more visible on the echelon structural positions. The highest proportion of women in high-ranking positions is visible on Echelon IV with 37.04% or 124.922

women and the lowest is seen on Echelon II with 14.91% or 3.358 women. That fact gives an impression of "vertical bias" phenomenon in the composition of women's participation in structural positions, meaning the higher the echelon level is, the lower the number of high-ranking positions held by women is (Didik, 2014). Ministry of Finance (Kemenkeu) as a ministry that has a high level commitment and directly contributes in consummating equality of rights between men and women and also is led by a female minister has implemented a pro-gender policy in its employees' development program, which ensures all policies, programs and activities within the Ministry of Finance is just and equal for both women and men.

The Ministry of Finance's commitment has been appreciated by the government through awarding Parahita Ekapraya award by the President of Republic of Indonesia from 2009 until 2018 on behalf of the ministry's exceptional attention and commitment towards the role of the organisation in its effort to consummate gender equality and justice. However, in the World Bank's report Mapping Indonesia's Civil Service 2018 published by the World Bank, it states that the proportion of women civil servants (PNS) in the Ministry of Finance sits on the lowest position compared to other ministries/government institutions that are also led by a woman. Based on table 3, it is clearly visible that the National Agency of Drug and Food Control (BPOM) occupies the first position with the proportion number of female civil servants

72% and the second position is held by the Ministry of Health with 61%. And in consecutive order are the Ministry of Women Empowerment and Child Protection 60%, Ministry of Social Affairs 46%, Ministry of Marine and Fisheries 30% and Ministry of Environment and Forestry 27%.

Meanwhile, the form of the Ministry of Finance's organisation is a holding company type department, has a high dependency towards the dynamic of changes in surrounding environmental and public demands to own massive work areas that are vertical units spread across the archipelago. Therefore, a number of units in Ministry of Finance for example in Tax General Directorate (DJP) with the number of employees 34.000 distributed across 33 local offices, 335 Tax Service Office (KPP) and 210 Extension Service and Tax Consultation Office (KP2KP) that are in Indonesia, the number of Tax General Directorate (DJP) employees is 78% men and 22% women. Career development with promotion and mutation causes women civil servants (PNS) unready to be transferred to other locations outside of the capital and Java island, causing an imbalance in the distribution of Tax General Directorate's (DJP) employees. This in turn causes a number of Tax Service Offices (KPP) suffering from the lack of men civil servants available and requests a termination for women civil servants recruitment process.

Similar conditions are also taking place in the Directorate of Treasury General across 210 offices in Indonesia including remote areas. Right now there are a high number of female civil servants in the III/d category who have not yet gained the status of Echelon IV. While in other provinces, specifically outside Java, there is a high number of Echelon IV positions that are vacant. This situation is caused by the high occurrence of women civil servants who were ready to be promoted to the next level yet rejected to be relocated.

According to Viki Holton and Fiona Elsa

(2016), in "A better career environment for women: developing a blueprint for individuals and organizations," there are important variables that contribute directly to increasing the effectiveness of women's career development. In this case, by creating a work environment that is responsive to individual women employees and organizations, they are as follows: Individual, there are develop self-awareness (Mondy, 2010; Yeung, 2009), have a career plan (Ivancevich, 2007; Monday, 2010), understand the role of others (Viki and Fiona, 2016), Networking (Rivai, 2005), make and take opportunities (Viki and Fiona, 2016; Ardaneswari, 2016) and organization there are mentoring, coaching and development (Mondy and Noe, 2010; Irianto, 2007; Lewis and Fagenson, 2005; Noe, et. al, 2010; Dessler, 2017), CEO and Senior Management Commitment (Benson and Yukongdi, 2005, Werther and Davis, 1996; Mathis and Jackson, 2010), talent management (Mathis and Jackson, 2010), organizational gender mix issues (Tharshini et al., 2016; Wilson, 2000, organizational cultural and attitude (Mathis and Jackson, 2010).

METHOD

This research will utilize the post positivisme approach through qualitative method by exploring a problem and developing informations obtained in details from a phenomenon (Cresswell, 2012), which is to probe information to clarify a description about how women's career development in Ministry of Finance is assessed from individual and organisational aspects. The technique in data collection utilized includes primary data which is in depth interview with relevant officials of civil servants career development in the Human Resources bureau within the Ministry of Finance namely Head of Subsection Employee Competency Analysis and Head of Subsection Mutation based on variables and

indicators within the utilized theory alongside with secondary data which is literature study.

RESULT AND DISCUSSIONS

Career Development of Women Civil Servants in Ministry of Finance

According to internal data of the Ministry of Finance's Human Resources Bureau (SDM) in March 2019, from the total employees of 79.522, 71% or 55.489 employees are men civil servants and 29% or 24.063 is women civil servants. The comparison result shows an asymmetry between the number of women civil servants to men that eventually will impact towards the low number of women civil servants in structural positions. This is shown on table 4, the average proportion of women civil servants sitting on a high-level managerial position is only 16.79% or 1.583 employees compared to men 83.21% or 9.320 employees. Career development of women civil servants in the Ministry of Finance consists of 2 variables which are Individual employee and organisation that will be further explained below:

1. Individual

a. Self-Awareness

Right now, women civil servants in the Ministry of Finance have realized the importance of possessing self-awareness in measuring strength, weakness, values, trust, talent, interest and other necessity of improving themselves to support their career development. This is influenced by the Management Strategy of Human Resources (MSDM) within the Ministry of Finance that obliges all employees of the Ministry of Finance to perform an assessment which is based on competency at Individual Assessment Centre Service (LIAC). Based on the implementation, competencies in the Ministry of Finance is classified into three categories (1) general competency which is competency that needs to be owned by each civil servant of the Ministry of Finance, (2)

core competency which is competency that needs to be owned by each civil servant in accordance to their level of echelon, (3) special competency which needs to be owned by each civil servant in accordance to their position. The result of this assessment published by Individual Assessment Centre Service (LIAC) will then be evaluated as a next step from the employees career development in the coming future.

The resource also adds that each employee is mandated to participate in education and training for 20 hours per year with respect to managerial competency, technical competency and social cultural competency that is necessary by the employees in significant positions or the soon-to-be promoted towards their career development planning with individual assessment system of one of its milestone which is hours per education and training.

b. Networking

To build an extensive network internally and externally in formal and informal types of networking is measured on each employee's characteristics, not gender. The result of the interview states that to build a network within your work environment is an expertise from each employee that is highly beneficial in easing their work. The Ministry of Finance is fully aware of the importance of networking in employees career development and showing it by providing training of public competency to officials who participate in Leadership Program with the objective to communicate certain issues internally or externally including intensive training in foreign languages.

Furthermore, the Ministry of Finance also has a medium in developing social interest of its employees and is also utilised to develop informal networks within its employees which is known as extracurricular programs that are held after hours i.e sport clubs and other activities that can further advance its employees creativity. In this matter, women employees are more

Table 2. Ministry of Finance Employee Based on Education

No.	Education	2015		2016		2017		2018	
		M	F	M	F	L	M	F	M
1.	D3	11.435	2.906	13.017	3.897	12.194	4.529	11.104	5.388
2.	S1	14.575	6.314	15.163	7.105	15.547	7.136	16.883	7.796
3.	S2	5.899	1.327	5.987	1.328	7.516	1.748	8.393	2.085
4.	S3	100	6	99	8	131	14	171	20
Total		32.009	10.553	34.266	12.338	35.388	13.427	36.551	15.289
Persentase		75.2%	24.7%	74.7%	25.3%	73.5%	26.5%	70,5%	29,5%

Source: Human Resources Bureau, Ministry of Finance (2018)

active and utilising it as a medium to gather with their work colleagues from different units.

c. Career Planning

Civil servants career planning process in the Ministry of Finance was designed thoroughly and has been running smoothly and effectively in order to strive for equality across employees in owning competency and qualifications without differentiating them based on their gender. From the data obtained by the researcher, each employee in the Ministry of Finance is mandated to create an Individual Development Program (IDP) in their career development that will be further developed into Individual Work Dialogue (DKI) for employee and officials and Organization Work Dialogue (DKO) for officials who have strategic objective in improving performance and achievement optimization.

Moreover, the result of Job Person Match (JPM) in the Ministry of Finance's employees is an average resulting above 90, a solid result of performance average which shows harmony between competency level of an employee towards the requirements for the position as a proof of high-quality Human Resource in the Ministry of Finance.

d. Role of Others

Support and the role of a supervisor, work colleagues and family influence women civil servants career development in the Ministry of Finance. According to sources,

like any other government institutions, initial coaching of Human Resources in the Ministry of Finance is the supervisors' responsibility that is essentially to support equality between women and men but still emphasising on the organisation's objectives.

The role of work colleagues is equally important specifically in helping each other when the female civil servant is absent from work. The Ministry of Finance also realized that the support from and the role of family is highly influential in the employee's career development, therefore the Ministry of Finance mandates its employees to fill out a consent form from family members for the relocation process in relation to the promotion/mutation in any vertical unit in the Ministry of Finance.

e. Take and Create Opportunities

Based on data obtained, it is shown that motivation and participation of women civil servants in the Ministry of Finance in participating in education and training is still lacking compared to men civil servants. While the Minister of Finance commands each employee to possess "competitive advantage" adjusted to the organization's needs in the present or the future. This is explained from the data on table 5 that shows the number of women civil servants in the Ministry of Finance who have Masters Degree and PhD is lower compared to men civil servants. Other than that, the low number of formal education in women civil

servants is caused by a smaller number of women civil servants compared to men.

Furthermore the proportion of lower women civil servants of 12% compared to men civil servants 88% from participants of Leadership Program. According to resources, this significant difference is relevant to the number of women civil servants in the Ministry of Finance who started later compared to men civil servants.

2. Organisation

a. Mentoring, Coaching and Development

The implementation of mentoring, coaching and development of human resources of the Ministry of Finance as a part of talent management has been progressing well to further support career development of women civil servants. Aligned with the Regulation of Minister of Finance (PMK) Number 60 Year 2016 states that mentoring is a supporting activity done by fixed and not fixed mentors for employees who are in preparation to occupy a strategic position (talent). Fixed mentor is the direct supervisor who mentors, coaches and develops employees within their authority. During the time that the fixed mentor is absent or not available, the mentoring can be performed by their superior or a supervisor with an equal structural position. Unfixed mentor is a mentor who is adjusted with the competency development needed by the employee.

Based on the result of the interview, women civil servants are not automatically going to secure a woman mentor who could play as a role model in their career development based on their direct supervisor. But the resource claimed that there are plus and minus points of having a woman mentor from the perspective of women civil servants, for example women mentor most of the time will give more difficult challenges as the result of emotional bonding from coming from the same gender as a good intention to motivate and strengthen each other. Therefore sometimes

a woman mentor forgets how to build a solution-oriented discussion in overcoming obstacles happening within women civil servants work life.

b. CEO and Senior Management Commitment.

Support and commitment from the highest level of management in this regard is the Minister of Finance herself (Menkeu) towards women civil servants career development is no doubt done through giving equal opportunities and understanding the difference the needs between women civil servants and men civil servants. In ample opportunities, the minister of finance stated her thoughts to women civil servants to balance out the role of women as a career woman and a housewife, one of the examples is to negotiate with their partner about responsibilities in terms of career and household chores.

Other support from the Minister of Finance and the officials of Echelon 1 at the Ministry of Finance towards the women civil servants can be further explained by the policy modification and pr-gender programs to support women representation in high-level managerial positions by advocating a responsive work environment towards women. Starting from gender mainstreaming program, women leadership program initiation, gender-based budgeting that facilitates procurement for special facilities such as breastfeeding rooms, child care facilities, medical check-up benefits and also full salary for women employees who are on maternity leave.

c. Talent Management

Talent management implementation in the Ministry of Finance has been working very well with the launching of Regulation of Ministry of Finance number 60 year 2016 regarding talent management. Talent Management in the Ministry of Finance is a system to find, manage, develop and retain

the best civil servant that should be prepared as the future leaders in order to support the achievement of vision, mission and strategy for the long term purposes of the organization. One of the advantages of talent management for the organisation is (1) to scout the best talent to lead the strategic position within the organisation to optimise strategic achievement and support the Ministry of Finance to become “world class government institution”, (2) to implement a systematic, on-time and transparent succession plan, (3) to build positive competency climate among employees of Minister of Finance. Meanwhile another advantage of talent management for the employees is to obtain an equal opportunity in career development and a medium to achieve self actualisation through competency and career development.

The evaluation and monitoring are consistently performed within the talent management policy mechanism. The number of administrative officials confirmed as potential talent for high ranking officials from 2017 to 2019 declined significantly especially in the men talent pool originally was 1.025 became 262 talents. The same case applies to women civil servants talents originally totalled at 185 talents in 2017 shrunk to 82 talents in 2019.

The significant decrease in the number of potential talents for women and men officials in 2017 and 2018 is very clearly depicted. Meanwhile the number of potential talent and talent for women civil servants is always significantly lower compared to potential talent and talent for men which reached 24% in 2016. The source emphasized the low number of women civil servants compared to men in the potential talent pool is a normal case considering that the number of men civil servants is higher compared to women.

The Ministry of Finance is in the process of creating a program to improve the talent management system called “Leaders Factor of the Ministry of Finance” as a program with

an objective to improve competency and career development of its employees. Through this program, the birth or creation of the next wave of leadership in the Ministry of Finance is expected. Leaders who are able to answer and overcome various present and future challenges faced by the Ministry of Finance for example the increasing of the country’s income, improving public’s trust, the era of disruption, millennial and global economic challenges.

d. Gender Mix Issue

Through observations and interviews, women civil servants still face gender issues within the Ministry of Finance environment that could potentially become an obstacle in their career development. When women talent enter the workforce, they are often faced with a “masculine” world. Regarding this, women tend to have to prove their capability and their worth to hold a position compared to men's talents through working two, three times harder. This also took place on women officials of our sources “for example, I just got accepted, I was tested and asked about my abilities, specifically when I entered the Ministry with a Master’s Degree, I was galvanized and supervised, while men civil servants with the same position as mine were treated differently. I also had to work harder and made sure it was seen and I also was handed bizarre assignments.”. Even though after, the source realized that the said treatment is one of the preparation steps she had to do to be promoted.

Meanwhile, the source also stated that there is still a stereotype regarding women leadership in the Ministry, for example women are more fit to hold administrative and financial positions because women are considered to be more accurate and detail-oriented compared to men. Nevertheless women tend to be eliminated from the decision maker positions determining the direction of the policy due to the general understanding that women are more emotional and fussy. Women are also more

often assigned to less strategic positions to showcase equality layering of the women versus men number in order to fulfill certain requirements (Probosiwi, 2015).

In the vertical unit of the Ministry of Finance, the difficulty to find available women civil servants to be promoted to outside of their domicile area still occurs and becomes a challenge in their career development. Even though each vertical unit of the Ministry of Finance has its own uniqueness and characteristics of different job description with expansive work coverage enabling certain positions specification can only be occupied by men civil servants, with consideration of safety factors. For example, there is a work specification for positions at the border with the risk of life safety of the civil servant and requires pristine physical endurance and the environment that is considered uncondusive for women civil servants.

e. Culture and Atitude

Based on the interview, cultural changes as a form of generation changes adaptation is impacting the work environment for women civil servants. Based on the gathered data, structural composition of employees age within the Ministry of Finance is considered within productive age level where the employees composition is still dominated by the millennial generation of 62% who has a massive impact towards work culture shift including the designation of women civil servants as an equal partner with men civil servants in occupying structural positions within the organisation.

Patriarchal culture that is often identified as a bureaucracy culture is slowly diminished and felt less by women civil servants within the Ministry of Finance, this is also caused by the cultural shift happening in the society through more women staying in the workforce and having high and equal education compared to men.

Based on the source's explanation, work culture shift also impacted work-life balance

culture from the positive and negative point of view. The positive impact in work-life balance is there are more women civil servants using the "daycare" benefit by getting their kids to the daycare during working hours so they will have more time to see their children's development compared to if they leave them behind at home specifically for children below five years old. This is done as a form of balancing "dual career" between family and career. Nevertheless, there is a negative side to this affecting career development of women civil servants which is the higher the women civil servants' position, the impact of having requirements i.e longer working hours and inflexibility at times and in turns it will impact the family side of married women civil servants.

CONCLUSION

Based on the analysis from the theory utilised through individual and organisation variable it can be concluded that women civil servants career development within the Ministry of Finance is not at its most optimum implementation. The pro gender policy of human resources management is not yet able to increase the women civil servant representation number in high-ranking managerial or structural positions. The result of the research in general shows that the low level of women civil servant career development in high-ranking managerial or structural positions is caused by the high number of men civil servants within the Ministry of Finance. On the individual variable level with the dimension of Take and Create Opportunities it is explained that women civil servants show lack of motivation in taking on opportunities and interest in participating in education or training. Furthermore, through the dimension of Mentoring, Coaching and Development, mentor and coach provided to women civil servants is their direct superior without differentiation in gender, thus not all women civil servants have women

mentors or someone they can look up to as a role model. On the other side, from the dimension of Gender Mix Issue, the existence of gender issues occurring within the Ministry of Finance relating to women leadership style stereotype, the demand for women civil servants to prove that they are better qualified and more appropriate to occupy a position by working harder compared to men colleagues, the difficulties of women civil servants to be promoted outside of their domicile area within the vertical units in the Ministry of Finance.

This phenomenon is mainly called "Glass Ceiling" which essentially means the obstacle faced by women within their work environment in her career development especially for decision maker positions that are oftentimes not clearly visible but impacts women directly. In the research done by Women Career Advancement in Public Service (2012) which was conducted within the civil servants environment in Indonesia showcases that the obstacle of most women's career in general is caused by rejecting promotion if the position is located quite far from their domicile area and they would prefer to take care of their family instead. Furthermore, the lack representation of women in bureaucratic positions is often associated with the strong element of patriarchal culture value occurring mostly in countries like Indonesia as stated by Lathabavan and Balasubramaniam in "Glass Ceiling and Women Employee in Asian Organizations" (2017). A number of research also have shown that Asian countries tend to have a strong patriarchal value thus impacting the phenomenon of lack of representation of women in decision maker positions (Choi, Sungjo and Park, 2014).

REFERENCE

- Ardaneswari, C. P. (2016). Transfer of Training (Analisis Pelaksanaan Transfer of Training di Badan Kepegawaian Daerah (BKD) Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta). *Jurnal Natapraja: Kajian Ilmu Administrasi Negara*, 4(2), 137–152. Retrieved from <https://journal.uny.ac.id/index.php/natapraja/article/view/12622/8907>
- Ballard, Velma J. (2015) *Gender and Representative Bureaucracy: The Career Progression of Woman Manager in Male Dominated Occupation in State Government*. Virginia: Virginia Commonwealth University.
- Benson, J., & V. Yukongdi, "Asians Women Managers: Participation, Barriers, And Future Prospects", dalam *Asia Pacific Business Review*, 11(2), 2005:283-291
- Burke, R. J., Moore, L., Burke, R., Blake-Beard, S., & Vinnicombe, S. (2014). Introduction: advancing women's careers: a key business issue. *Handbook of Research on Promoting Women's Careers*
- Choi, Yujin. (2015). Career Success Factors of Women in the Public Sector: An Empirical Analysis of the Korean Central Government. *Asian Social Science*; Vol. 11, No. 9; 2015 ISSN 1911-2017 E-ISSN 1911-2025 Published by Canadian Center of Science and Education
- Cresswell, John W. (2009). *Research Design; Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*, 3rd ed. USA: SAGE Publication, inc.
- Dessler, Gary. 2017. *Human Resource Management* 13th ed. USA: Pearson Education, Inc.
- Equality, P., & Journal, A. I. (2000). Women Civil Servants and transformational leadership in Bangladesh. *Diversity*. <https://doi.org/10.1108/02610150010786157>
- Gilley, Ann, Pamela Dixon and Jerry Gilley.(2009). *The Praeger Handbook of Human Resource Management*. London: Praeger Publisher
- Groeneveld, S. (2009). Careers in the Dutch civil service: A gender perspective.

- International Review of Administrative Sciences, 75(3), 493–507.
- Holton, V., & Dent, F. E. (2016). A better career environment for women: developing a blueprint for individuals and organisations. *Gender in Management*, 31(8), 542–561. <https://doi.org/10.1108/GM-08-2015-0074>
- Hurst, J., Leberman, S., & Edwards, M. (2016). Women managing women. *Gender in Management: An International Journal*, 31(1), 61–74.
- Irianto, Jusuf. (2007). Perempuan dalam praktek manajemen sumber daya manusia. Dalam *Journal Unair: Masyarakat, Kebudayaan Dan Politik*.
- Krissetyanti, E. P. L. (2018). Women's Perceptions about Glass Ceiling in their Career Development in Local Bureaucracy in Indonesia. *Bisnis & Birokrasi Journal*, 25(1).
- Lewis, A.E., & E.A. Fagenson, "Strategies for developing Women Managers: How well do they Fulfill their Objectives? Dalam *journal of management development*, 14(2), 1995:54-64
- Mapping Indonesia's Civil Service. (2018). World Banks
- Mathis R.L dan Jackson J.H. (2010). *Human Resources Management* (13th ed. United States of America: South Western Cengage Learning
- McMahon, M., Limerick, B., Cranston, N., & Andersen, C. (2006). Going up? Women in the public
- Mondy, R.Wayne and Robert M Noe. (2010). *Human Resources Management*, Ninth Edition. Pearson Prentice Hall
- M Ivancevich, John dan Robert, Konopaske. (2013). *Human Resource Management International Edition*. Singapura: Mc Graw – Hill.
- Puskapol UI, 2012, –Ketimpangan Keterwakilan Perempuan dalam Birokrasi, www.puskapol.ui.ac.id/wp-content/uploads/2014/04/factsheet-ketimpanganketerwakilan-perempuan-dalam-birokrasi.pdf
- Probosiwi, R. (2015). Perempuan Dan Perannya Dalam Pembangunan Kesejahteraan Sosial (Women and Its Role on Social Welfare Development). *Natapraja*, 3(1). <https://doi.org/10.21831/jnp.v3i1.11957>
- Shabbir, H., Shakeel, M. A., & Zubair, R. A. (2017). Gender Stereotype , Glass Ceiling and Women ' S Career Advancement : an Empirical Study in Service Sector of, (2013), 236–246.
- Tharshini, U., Kumar, S., & Rathnasekara, H. (2016). Climbing ladders of success: Perceptions of barriers to public sector career advancement in Jaffna district, Sri Lanka. *South Asian Journal of Human Resources Management*, 3(1), 1–24.
- Verma, S. (2018). Examining the New Dimensions of Career Advancement of Women Employees. *Global Business Review*, 1–13.
- Wesarat, P., & Mathew, J. (2017). Theoretical Framework of Glass Ceiling. *Paradigm*, 21(1), 21–30.