JURNAL NATAPRAJA

Kajian Ilmu Administrasi Negara

Vol. 6, No. 1, 2018 <u>https://journal.uny.ac.id/index.php/natapraja</u>

DISCRIMINATION OF PUBLIC SERVICE IN POPULATION AND CIVIL REGISTRATION AGENCY NORTH LAMPUNG REGENCY

Rahadian Aksa

Magister Administrasi Publik, Universitas Gadjah Mada rahadian.aksa.map@mail.ugm.ac.id

Abstrak

Tujuan penelitian ini adalah untuk mengetahui bentuk-bentuk dan penyebab diskriminasi pelayanan masyarakat pada Dinas Kependudukan dan Pencatatan Sipil Kabupaten Lampung Utara. Metode yang digunakan dalam penelitian ini adalah metode deskriptif dengan pendekatan kualitatif.Hasil penelitian ini menunjukkan terjadi perlakuan diskriminasi yang dilakukan oleh pegawai di Dinas Kependudukan dan Pencatatan Sipil Kabupaten Lampung Utara dengan membeda-bedakan waktu dan biaya pelayanan, sikap petugas serta prosedur yang ditetapkan terhadap masyarakat biasa yang mengikuti prosedur pelayanan dengan masyarakat dari golongan tertentu seperti orang kaya, pejabat, tokoh masyarakat dan saudara atau kenalan pegawai di Dinas Kependudukan dan Pencatatan Sipil Kabupaten Lampung Utara. Tidak ditemukan adanya diskriminasi yang dilakukan karena faktor ras dan agama. Penyebab terjadinya diskriminasi pelayanan di Dinas Kependudukan dan Pencatatan Sipil Kabupaten Lampung Utara adalah dikarenakan budaya pelayanan yang masih terpengaruh kebudayaan lokal dan budaya hierarkis birokrasi menciptakan budaya paternalistis dalam pelayanan yang berpihak kepada pejabat dan penguasa, dan motif sosial seperti kedudukan seseorang. Kata Kunci: Diskriminasi, Pelayanan Publik, dan Dinas Kependudukan dan Catatan Sipil

Abstract

The objective of this research is to determine the forms and causes of discrimination in the services delivery provision of North Lampung population and civil registration agency. The research was a descriptive qualitative. Research results showed the prevalence of discriminatory practices in the delivery of services in the Population and Civil Registration agency in North Lampung Regency. Dissemination took forms of time required, and cost incurred to obtain services, attitude of service providers, and procedures that differed between those that applied to ordinary citizens (long and tedious) and for others (short and quick) that included the rich, officials, community leaders and relatives or acquaintances of population and civil registration agency. However, there was no evidence of discrimination in service delivery that was based on race and religion. Culture, as manifested in paternalistic form and bureaucratic hierarchy was the main cause of discrimination in the services delivery in population and civil registration agency. Thus, paternalism and bureaucracy culture underlie favoritism accorded to officials and rulers, individuals in key positions of government and society, and relatives and acquaintances of employees in the agency as opposed to other members of society.

Keywords: Discrimination, Public Services, Population and Civil Registration Agency.

Diterima 12 Maret 2018; Diterima dengan revisi 7 April 2018; Dipublikasikan 1 Mei 2018 2406-9515 (p) / 2528-441X (e)

^{© 2018} Rahadian Aksa. Dipublikasikan oleh JIAN FIS UNY

INTRODUCTION

Public services expected by the public is an efficient, effective and nondiscriminatory services. Public service activities were conducted by a person or group of persons or organization that aim to assist and facilitate the public in achieving its objectives (Savas, 1979; Moenir, 2000; Thoha, 2001). Furthermore, according to Grönroos (1990) "services is an activity or series of activities that are real that is due to the relationship between consumers and employees or other things provided by the service provider company which is intended to solve the problems of consumers or customers".

The government apparatus in the public service delivery must uphold the principle of equal footing for every citizen without differentiation either of skin color, class, race, ethnicity, religion and gender (Siagian, 1994; Otlowski, 2003; Klaus, 2012). In practice. discrimination experienced by citizens ultimately led to the practice of corruption, collusion and nepotism. This happens because the government apparatus as a public service delivers tend to be regarded higher than people who need public services. Sinambela (2008:15) Frederickson in states that in the public service, effectiveness and efficiency alone cannot be used as a benchmark. Another measure that necessary is justice, because without this measure of inequality of service cannot be avoided.

Based on the research results of Desentralization Governance Survey 2002 in Dwiyanto (2003) found four important issues which are prevalent the field in the delivery of public services, which is the first, not the creation of justice and (discrimination in services). equality Service delivery is influenced by buddy relationship, similarity political affiliation, ethnicity, and religion. Second, the low level of public satisfaction with public services. Third, there is no certainty the cost and time of service. And fourth, the rampant bribery culture in the delivery of public services. This is a logical consequence of the existence of discrimination in services due to the uncertainty of such services. Furthermore Dwiyanto (2011) states people are willing to pay more expensive to avoid the uncertainty of service.

Based on these descriptions, the public services in accordance with Pancasila and Act of 1945 is very important because in the process of public service, the community is the main object in the process, where the community has put high expectations on the quality of public services that do not discriminate the public service delivery. Therefore, realizing the importance of equality in public service delivery, it is necessary to study and analyze efforts related to discrimination in public service delivery and its various factors, which will be identified based on theoretical assumptions built into the conceptual framework.

Administration of population and civil registration is required by the government for various policies and activities that will be made. Meanwhile people also needed it as a condition of a wide variety of activities as self-identity that required the implementation of good service, friendly and non-discriminatory. However, the public service delivery in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency still shows discrimination against the community. The purpose of this study is to determine the forms and causes of discrimination in the public service delivery of the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency.

METHOD

This research was a descriptive study with a qualitative approach. In this study, the focus of research was the forms and the factors that lead to discrimination in services at the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung The writer obtained Regency. the information and experience that there were discriminations in the public service delivery, as well as the Government of North Lampung District where the writer has been working. This research was conducted in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency, because there has a fairly high population heterogeneity in which residents not only were the original inhabitants, but there are also many people from outside the tribe as former Lampung regency through the transmigration program.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Population and Civil Registration Agency is one of the North Lampung regency that is implementing administrative authority in the field of Administration of population and civil registration. This process is required by the government for various policies and activities that will be made. People also need it as a condition of a wide variety of activities as self-identity required for obtaining well, friendly and nondiscriminatory public services. The public service provision in the Population and Civil Registration Agency of North Lampung Regency, however, shows

discriminated acts committed by government officials to the community services users. The forms of discrimination occurred in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency is as follows:

Time and Cost of Service Differentiation

In the delivery of services in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in fact there has been established by Decree of the Head of Population and Civil Registration Agency No. 262 year 2012 on Public Service Standards of Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency. Minimum service standard is intended to provide the equal quality of services for all people who access them at the Population and Civil Registration Agency. Nevertheless, in the provision of minimum service standards, there will be a time of uncertainty and cost of service for each person depend on the completeness of the files as terms of service, social position in society and government, and proximity to the employee in the Population and Civil Registration Agency. Unfortunately many service personnels believe that good service is only seen from the speed of service personnel in completing the process of service without regarding to

service procedures and minimum service standards. It has to be done in the service process that leads to uncertainty in the service delivery and differentiation and the ability of workers to provide various sorts of reasons in the event of delaying services. This condition does not comply with the Act No. 25 Year 2009 concerning public services that requires public service providers to establish service standards and require people to have a standard of service that is comprised to the type of services, conditions of services, process / service procedures, officials responsibility for services, time for getting services and cost of services.

Form of service differentiation can be seen when people who come to have acquaintances or relatives of employees in the Population and Civil Registration Agency. They do not go to the counter or room service that has been provided, they immediately meet and leave the file to the employee who may have close relationship to the service users in accessing services. Form of service differentiation can also be seen when officials, political figures or public figures who come to access services, where they just come into the room directly toward the heads of the field or even directly to the department head room. Then they will just wait in the room or if there is

something else they would go and ask for help immediately. The services provision to those kind of people will be very fast and prioritized even without the need to complete the necessary requirements files since the staff get direct order from his superiors to resolve the service process. This differentiation is also visible services for specific matters and urgent when there are people who come to access services due to complete the necessary paperwork to get free medical services provided by the government or health insurance to complete the file because one of their family members require immediate treatment or surgery.

This description proof that the position of a person greatly affects the services obtained. Officials, political figures or public figures who come just leave the file to the head of department, often get prioritazion in obtaining services due to their positions. This situation is in accordance with the research of Dwiyanto (2010)that argue the uncertainty of the time and cost affect people's behavior in accessing services is indispensable so that the time and cost standards in service delivery. In line with Arif, Rohman, Ahmad, Purnomo, Sa'id (2008) it is stated that in the service delivery system, family, friends, kickbacks, and so relatives are more effective to smooth the various

interests. The application of minimum service standards is very important to be run as well as possibility to prevent discrimination against people who use the service due to the uncertainty of the cost and time taken in accessing public services.

Personnel Attitude Differentiation

In serving the public, service personnel in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency often provide different attitude. It is shown by the service personnel for the service users who followed procedure in comparison to public figures who ask for help in order to help accelerate the services. It is usually that staff will prioritize its services and be friendlier to the public figures or popular persons.

Attitude differentiations in providing public services often happen since the staff do not follow the minimum standar of public service delivery. In terms of hospitality, the services provided can still be said to have been friendly enough, the staff smile to the service users. Also the different backgrounds between the personnel and the users who receive the services, does not affect the service provided.

Differentiation of service personnel attitude who tend to be keen to

people who are officials, political leaders, community leaders, or a high position person in the region, is caused by a cultural factor. It affects the personnel who still adhered to hierarchical and paternalistic bureaucracy. The officer will be reprimanded as if afraid or transferred by his superiors even if he does not serve a fine officer. This differentiation is also visible when services acquaintances or relatives of service personnel who come to access services. This condition is in accordance with the opinion of Dwiyanto (2006) who states that bureaucratic culture that has been developed is a culture that is more pressing on power. Officials of public bureaucracy is more oriented to power. They do not put themself as the man who should serve the community well, but as a ruler who can treat people as clients who can be treated casually.

Procedure Differentiation

procedures in the Service Population and Civil Registration Agency in implementing service system are divided into two areas, the Citizenship Identity (Kartu Tanda Penduduk) service and Family Card (Kartu Keluarga/KK) on Population Administration section and deeds of civil registration service in the Civil Registration section. Service system allows irregularity the practices committed by service personnel, because the service is provided in a different room. It is hard to keep an eye for every case of extortion committed by service personnel when any services to the community is served in a particular section. In fact if there is one officer in the section who cannot attend work or is out of office, the service in the section will be delayed. This service method is opposed to the Presidential Regulation No. 38 year 2008 on the Government Work Plan year 2009 which states public service in the form of the union activities of various service units in a single unified place (one stop service) embodies an effort to minimize the discriminatory treatment for users in various sectors of society, methods of doors in perceiving effective and efficient service to meet public's expectations of quality public services and non discriminatory.

Based on the writer's observation, service procedure differentiation is due to a lot of people who use the assistance of employees in the Population and Civil Registration Agency want to save time with minimal efforts. They assume that service procedures are long and convoluted. The similar condition is also expressed by other communities who like and think if they take care of themselves then the service budget will become larger and burden some because they charge in terms of transportation costs, time and their delayed work. This differentiation is also seen service procedures when there are officials, political leaders, community leaders, acquaintances or relatives of employees in the Population and Civil Registration Agency comes to accessing services, they do not need to follow the procedure applicable services, and does not even have to join the queue to obtain service. When this happens, of course, will hinder the process of service to the common people who follow the service procedure and also would like to obtain fast service.

Discrimination in service procedure occurs in regular society with acquaintances or relatives of officials and employees of the Office of Population and Civil Registration. As for the poor and the rich are not so visible differentiation except the rich man asks for expedited service with the help of certain benefits. This condition is in accordance with the opinion of Dwiyanto (2006) who states paternalistic culture that puts the political interests and bureaucratic elite, and / or are close to the bureaucrats. They often get preferential treatment in public service. This has led public to disillusionment with service users because they are not treated fairly.

North high Lampung has population heterogeneity. It consists of various ethnic, religious, educational level and economic level differences. Residents of North Lampung regency are not only the original inhabitants, but there are also many people from outside the tribe as former Lampung is regency transmigration area adjacent to the island of Java. This causes racism among communities in North Lampung Regency Immigrant communities already are mingling with the local population. The services procedure to the minorities, and not seen any particular religious differentiation made by service personnel. However, service differentiation seen in people from both tribes Lampung like Lampung Sungkai and Lampung Abung, serve community service personnel with more friendly Lampung tribe. This condition is in accordance with the opinion Dwiyanto (2010:30) in the public service are criteria commonly used to distinguish people from their citizenship identity, such as the similarity of origin, ethnicity, religion, and so on. The area is often linked with the practice of public service for various civil identity. As a result, the public service system tends to very subjective, exclusive, be and discriminatory.

Various forms of discrimination that occurred in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung showed that discriminatory Regency actions are performed either by officers or officials such services already become a culture or tradition that is difficult to remove. In accordance with Dwiyanto argument (2011:374) that the cause of low quality public service delivery in Indonesia are friendship discrimination,, ethnicity, political affiliation, and religion.

Causes of Public Service Discrimination in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency

In the context of a bureaucratic culture. North Lampung regency administration especially the Office of Population and Civil Registration needs to create a culture of bureaucratic apparatus in accordance with the government's role as a public servant who provide good service in friendly and nondiscriminatory The public manners. service delivery in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency, however, still occur gainst people who use services. The cause of discrimination that occurred in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency is as follows:

1. Service Cultures

Kinship relations in Lampung community as brotherhood relationship and friendship is highly valued in accordance with the prevailing customs and traditions. Lampung people really keep in touch with each other. But if kinship is used to get faster service and not in accordance with service procedures, then of course this kind of relationship has been incorrectly used, because it will lead to discrimination against those who do not family ties with have government officials. Things like this in the Population Registration and Civil Agency is prevalent, the officer will not be able to if refuse service any friends. acquaintances, or relatives who came for help to access services in the Population and Civil Registration Agency for the reason that's what they charge at the office.

Discriminatory service culture is not just about the relationship of brotherhood or friendship alone, but also because of the influence of one's position environment both on the in the government and society. An official in the North Lampung regency administration and board members who are representatives of the people always get priority service, as well as an community leader and respected and influential in the community. Officials and community leaders when they come, will go directly to the leader room and be accepted well by the leader. Even they will get drink and snacks. Then the papers were handed over to the service personnel who were called to the leader room, without waiting for a long time for finishing their services. The file will be completed and delivered to the service personnel, thus he will postpone to work on other files. Ordinary people who have come to queue in accordance with the procedures of service will receive service barriers that cause frustration and dissatisfaction with the services provided.

Verv hierarchical bureaucracy causes the service procedure become long and convoluted services. A hierarchical bureaucratic also cause superiors have power so excessively treat more subordinates with devotion and loyalty are high because the leader who determines career in the bureaucracy based on trust and closeness is not based on one's ability. Then, giving tips or money to the service personell has become a culture to obtain faster service in the Population and Civil Registration Agency. In fact there is an employee in the Population and Civil Registration Agency that society deliberately seek or offer help to people who come to the Population and Civil Registration Department to expedite the service process.

Service culture that has been adopted in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency is still very paternalistic and hierarchical. Attitude of service personnel who put themselves as rulers, causes they are not able to be fair in providing services. This is in line with the opinion of Nurmandi (2010) who argue that the patrimonial bureaucracy is still occur in delivering public services in Indonesia. This is similar with Dwiyanto (2006) who states that during this bureaucratic culture the developed culture provide more pressure on power. Officials of public bureaucracy has emphasized on more power orientation. They do not put the staff as the man who should serve the community well, but as a ruler who can treat people as clients who can be treated casually.

2. Discrimination Motives

Acts of discrimination that occur in community service in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency is necessarily constituted by an inner urge of staff to commit to the act of discrimination. Needs or basic thinking patterns that drive in man to perform an activity or action something called motive. The author divides into two kinds of motives which underlie acts of discrimination in the Population and Civil Registration Agency are as follows:

a. Social motives

Humans as social beings cannot be separated from the relationship of brotherhood and friendship. It is inevitable even in a work environment relationship... One's position in the environment and the relationship of brotherhood and friendship is very difficult for the staff because employees demand professionalism in carrying out his duties as a social creature but can not seem to rule out social relationships. Lampung society in with accordance the customs are maintaining a relationship of brotherhood and friendship.

Based on the observations made by the author, the services provided in the Population and Civil Registration Agency was very disturbed with the closeness of the relationship and the relationship of brotherhood. Care workers would prefer the service to the community he knew well that a relative, friend, or neighbor. Service Officers to differentiate services without following the procedure of service in various ways such as notifying the people he knew to the back door service counter so no need to queue or store the files for the service personnel and the results will be delivered home. Such conditions would be very disturbing to the community service process that follows the procedure.

The authors also found that a person 's social standing has a huge influence in obtaining quality accessible services. Officials, community leaders and the rich at the time came, would go directly to either the head of the leader room, secretarial services even department heads, without having to queue and complete the required paperwork, they will get the results without the need for a long time there even care the results of which are required to be delivered to their home so they do not need to wait in the Population and Civil Registration Agency.

The same thing also applies to the family and relatives of Regional Head or people who have a close and friendly relations with regional heads. Especially for families and relatives of region head, the authors observe that their service personnel are familiar with both spatial and delivered direct agency heads to be served. As for the people who have friendly relations with regional heads, they usually come as officials in general because agency heads just do not dare to refuse a request from them and serve them as well as possible.

Based on the previous description it can be concluded that social motives are motives that are very difficult to avoid in service to the community, so it often happens discriminatory acts committed by service personnel based on this motif. While social motives based on religion, race, and ethnic discrimination are rare. The service personnel seemed to justify the emotional closeness and position of a person causing discriminatory service provided are the right things. Dwiyanto (2006) states paternalistic culture that puts the interests of political and bureaucratic elite, and / or are close to the bureaucrats get preferential treatment in public service.

b. Economic motives

Based on the author's observation, the low level of employee welfare is often used as an excuse by the employee in the Population and Civil Registration Agency to discriminate in service is to use the service procedure situation fraught with uncertainty and complicated, causing people prefer to use the employee assistance in Office of Population and Civil Registration gratitude by giving money in return, full service state of uncertainty and is used as a convoluted land to earn extra income. In fact there is an employee in the Population and Civil Registration Agency intentionally seek community or offer help to people who come to the Population and Civil

Registration Department to expedite the service process.

Things like this have become a tradition in service in the Population and Civil Registration Agency, so expect an employee gratitude money given by people who access services at the Population and Civil Registration Agency by not following procedures. It is common knowledge that people and employees in the Population and Civil Registration Agency mutual need and benefit.

Based on the author's observation, the service personnel in the Population and Civil Registration Agency happier in serving officials, political leaders, community leaders, and the rich because they will provide more benefits than that usually provided by ordinary people. This of course gives more motivation to care workers to always provide the best service to them, so of course service to ordinary people who follow procedures delayed.

Based on the previous description it can be concluded that the low level of welfare of employees with incomes that do not meet the needs of life and inadequate incentives to make employees in the Population and Civil Registration Agency so expect "gratitude money" to meet their needs and as additional money for daily operations. This is supported by the circumstances in which the absence of a superior firmness in applying quality service and clean from corruption, collusion, nepotism. The absence of reward and punishment in the operation of public service employees make a foul in the process of service to the community. Good performance of employees do not get any awards both in terms of career and income. Career employees in North Lampung, especially the Office of Population and Civil Registration was assessed by factor of proximity to the rulers and officials.

This condition is in accordance with the opinion of Savas (1978)"in providing public services there is equal payments for equal amounts of service". Furthermore. according to Klaus (2012)"Low awards are useless and Encourage discrimination at the same time discourage such awards Victims, only full compesation for all material and non material damages as well as punitive damages will end discrimination". In the public service, government officials are entitled to a reward of services rendered to the public in accordance with the amount of work done. This is intended to prevent acts of discrimination with the differentiation of service provided to the community that will provide something to the government apparatus in service delivery.

When viewed from the motive discrimination by an employee in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency, both of these motives in accordance with the opinion of the Eisanstadt in Dwiyanto (2002) who stated they were close to the bureaucratic and political elite or those who are willing to pay and provide facilities to officials of the bureaucracy tends to acquire the rights and privileges in the public service. It is very noticeable how service personell "favoritism" recognize in providing services to people who follow the usual procedures for services than the public service is requested expedited service process, officials, community leaders, acquaintances or relatives of employees in the Population and Civil Registration Agency.

CONCLUSION

The forms of discrimination that occurs in the form of either differentiation of service time, cost, attitude and procedure attendant to the ordinary people who follow certain procedures to gain service. Meanwhile officials, public community leaders. relatives or acquaintances of employees in the Population and Civil Registration Agency usually requests assistance for expedited service by paying Rp 10.000,- to Rp 50.000,- rather than ordinary people who follow procedures. Discrimination in the delivery of service in the Population and Civil Registration Agency also occur for Lampung indigenous people who get priority services because most employees in the Population and Civil Registration Agency is Lampung tribes.

Causes of community discrimination community in gaining public service delivery in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency is a hierarchical and paternalistic culture. Also giving tips or gratification money affects almost all employees in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency. This lead to discrimination in the administration of services, social motive for both kinship and friendship ties of brotherhood and social position of a person such as officials, community leaders and the rich. Also it leads to a boost of employee numbers in the Population and Civil Registration Agency in North Lampung Regency to discriminate in the service delivery occurred in the Department of Population and Recording civil District of North Lampung, Economic motives for the low level of employee causes many employees to do so. Service system procedure that is full of uncertainty and convoluted is

another factor to earn extra income for service personnel in providing services to the community. There are even employees who deliberately seek community or offer help to people who come to the Population and Civil Registration Department to expedite the service process. Finally, the lacks of reward and punishment policy also cause ineffective working circumstances. The employees do not have motivatition to give their best and do not afraid to commit a bribery in service delivery.

REFERENCE

- Arif, Saiful. Rohman, Ahmad Ainur, Purnomo, Sa'id Mas'ud, 2008, *Reformasi Pelayanan Publik*, Program Sekolah Demokrasi Bekerja Sama dengan Averroes Press, Malang.
- Dwiyanto, Agus, 2002, Membangun Sistem Pelayanan Publik Yang Memihak Rakyat, POPULASI Vol 13 (1), Hal 1-18.
- Dwiyanto, Agus dkk, 2003, *Reformasi Tata Pemerintahan Dan Otonomi Daerah*, PSKK-UGM, Yogyakarta.
- Dwiyanto, Agus dkk, 2006, *Reformasi Birokrasi Publik di Indonesia*, UGM Press, Yogyakarta.
- Dwiyanto, Agus, 2010, Manajemen Pelayanan Publik : Peduli, Inklusif, dan Kolaboratif. UGM Press, Yogyakarta.
- Dwiyanto, Agus, 2011, Mengembalikan Kepercayaan Publik Melalui Reformasi Birokrasi, PT.Gramedia

Pustaka Utama, Jakarta.

- Klaus. M. A, 2012, *Damages In Discrimination Cases*, ERA Forum Vol 13 PP 257-273.
- Moenir, H.A.S, 2000, Manajemen Pelayanan Umum di Indonesia. Bumi Aksara, Jakarta.
- Nurmandi, Achmad, 2010, Manajemen Pelayaan Publik. PT.Sinergi Visi Utama, Yogyakarta.
- Otlowski, Margaret, 2003, *Exploring The Concept Of Genetic Discrimination*, Bioethical Inquiry, Vol 2 No 3, PP 165-176.
- Savas, E. S, 1978, On Equity In Providing Public Services, Management Science, Vol 24 No 8 PP 800-808.
- Siagian, Sondang, P, 1994, Patologi Birokrasi :Analisis, Indentifikasi dan Terapinya, Ghalia Indonesia, Jakarta
- Sinambela, Lijan, Poltak, dkk, 2008, *Reformasi Pelayanan Publik, Teori, Kebijakan dan Implementasi,* Bumi Aksara, Jakarta.
- Thoha, Miftah, 2001, *Perilaku Organisasi* : *Konsep dasar dan Aplikasinya*, PT. Raja Grafindo Persada, Jakarta.