



Preservice teachers' pedagogical competence and transformative learning in a dual online-offline teaching practicum

M. Zaini Miftah^{1,2}, Utami Widiati^{1*}, Anik Nunuk Wulyani¹,
Tengku Intan Suzila Tengku Sharif³

¹Universitas Negeri Malang, Indonesia

²Institut Agama Islam Negeri Palangka Raya, Indonesia

³Universiti Teknologi MARA, Pahang, Malaysia

*Corresponding Author: utami.widiati.fs@um.ac.id

ABSTRACT

Research on preservice teachers' (PSTs) critical reflection on teaching practicum in transformative learning (TL) within teacher education programs is evident. However, studies investigating PSTs' pedagogical competence (PC) and TL through the lens of critical reflection on Indonesian EFL teaching practicum settings are still limited. This study investigates what PSTs learned from critical reflection on a dual online-offline teaching practicum for developing PC and how they performed TL. Ten PSTs engaged in a two-month teaching practicum experience within the English teacher education preparation program of a state university in Central Kalimantan Indonesia were voluntarily involved in this case study. Multiple data were garnered through reflective journals and focus group interviews. Data were analyzed deductively and thematically to explore prominent themes. The results shed some light on lessons learned encompassing the instructional practices for PSTs' PC development and their PC enhancement. PSTs performed TL by boosting students' ability to change mindsets and thinking habits in learning and making them aware of learning and becoming better learners. The research implication provides empirical evidence pertaining to how critical reflection on the dual online-offline teaching practicum contributes to PSTs' PC development and TL performance for professional development.

Keywords: critical reflection, dual online-offline teaching mode, pedagogical competence, preservice teacher, transformative learning

Article history

Received:
16 August 2023

Revised:
11 February 2024

Accepted:
7 March 2024

Published:
15 June 2024

Citation (APA Style): Miftah, M. Z., Widiati, U., Wulyani, A. N., & Sharif, T. I. S. T. (2024). Preservice teachers' pedagogical competence and transformative learning in a dual online-offline teaching practicum. *Cakrawala Pendidikan: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan*, 43(2), 381-397. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.21831/cp.v43i2.54371>

INTRODUCTION

Studies have shown an increased interest in critical reflection and transformative learning (TL) within the teaching practices in teacher education programs. Much research has proven that teacher education programs in preparing preservice teachers' (PSTs) careers with education services such as pedagogical competence (PC) development may produce competent teachers (see Barahona & Ibaceta-Quijanes, 2022; Madhavaram & Laverie, 2010; Mata & Suci, 2011; Supkhonovna, 2021). Meanwhile, other research investigated attempts to assist PSTs with reflective teaching during practicum (Widodo & Ferdiansyah, 2018) as an alternative approach to enhance PC in professional development (Hendriwanto, 2021; Qin et al., 2022) to be reflective teachers (Hendriwanto, 2021) and to develop teacher professional identity (Ardi et al., 2023a, 2023b) for better future careers (Wulyani, 2017). Positive trends in the studies of PSTs'

reflections on English teaching practicum for professional development are increasingly and rapidly evident (Miftah et al., 2022). Hence, within today's TL, critical reflection on teaching practicum becomes essential to empower PSTs in critical reflection on the field experience for reevaluating teaching practices (Farrell, 2009; Mezirow, 2000), improving PC, and stimulating efficacy and preparedness in future teaching (Bhatt et al., 2024; Nganga, 2020).

In teacher education programs, PSTs' PC development is essential (Nganga, 2020). PC plays a very influential output to gain through the instructional process for successful learning (Nganga, 2020; Mata & Suci, 2011), distinguishing competence from other professions (Shah et al., 2020). PC consists of five elements: content knowledge, knowledge of pedagogy methods, course capabilities, class, and student management (Madhavaram & Laverie, 2010). Owning more of each element can enhance PSTs' PC to be competent teachers (Perumal & Maistry, 2021) for quality foreign language teaching (Nganga, 2020). Thus, this study is based on Madhavaram and Laverie's (2010) framework to explore PSTs' PC through the lens of critical reflection on the dual online-offline teaching practicum as one innovation in the field experience in TL (Mezirow, 2000; Supkhonovna, 2021).

After the COVID-19 pandemic, the new normal has imposed a dual online-offline teaching mode in many Indonesian schools. The dual online-offline teaching mode is like a blended learning system as a basic element for distance teaching instruction (Jiang et al., 2021; Mumford & Dikilitaş, 2020). It is a learning mode that combines contact teaching with the PSTs and online resources taken from the internet (Li & Lin, 2022). Our observation revealed that many Indonesian schools applied online-offline learning mode in such a way that PSTs experienced the dual online-offline teaching practicum through handling teaching online mode at a certain time and offline at other times. The current teaching practicum, therefore, refers to blended learning as a learning system designed to provide learning services with distance learning instructions (Ma & Lee, 2021). It prepares online-offline activities and materials by integrating face-to-face teaching with technology (Jiang et al., 2021; Kusuma, 2021). It enhances the quality of the learning experience, enables students to be more enjoyable and active, and facilitates learning engagement (Wang, 2021; Wong et al., 2020) in the new normal. Thus, this study takes this working definition of the dual online-offline teaching mode in English teaching practicum in the Indonesian EFL context due to the nature of the blended mode.

It is now well established that critical reflection on the teaching practicum program could develop PSTs' PC in the framework of TL. This is echoed in the empirical data regarding PSTs' PC positively affected by their critical reflections on the field experience of teaching practicum programs (Nganga, 2020; Supkhonovna, 2021). These reflections are vital so PSTs will be more engaged in their future careers. In addition, it has been shown that student learning progress would be more directed when guided by a competent PST with adequate PC during teaching practicum (Farhadiba & Wulyani, 2020). Conversely, the lack of critical reflection experience can affect the teaching experiences of PSTs in their attempts to develop PC in teacher education programs (Cho & Johnson, 2020). They might encounter pedagogical issues in their future careers in the real teaching profession (Barahona & Ibaceta-Quijanes, 2022). This issue, therefore, demands attention.

PSTs may still have a misconception about PC. PC could be improved in diverse learning settings through critical reflection on field experiences (Qin et al., 2022). Most Indonesian PSTs have little experience with PC development in dual-mode teaching school settings, such as the current online-offline teaching mode, whereas being engaged in such a teaching mode may provide them with a practical pedagogical experience in the present school setting, leading them to be more competent teachers (Cho & Johnson, 2020; Qin et al., 2022). For this purpose, teacher preparation programs attempt to educate PSTs about the diverse school teaching environments (Wong et al., 2020), including such a dual mode. Thus, PSTs would bring the understanding of PC development and practice it through the lens of critical reflection (Farrell, 2009; Qin et al., 2022) to the field experience of dual teaching mode (Jiang et al., 2021; Li & Lin, 2022; Mumford & Dikilitaş, 2020).

To date, limited research has investigated PSTs' PC and TL through the lens of critical reflection on the dual online-offline teaching practicum. Previous research in diverse contexts of

ESL/EFL showed different results regarding PSTs' PC and TL through critical reflection on teaching practices (see Barahona & Ibaceta-Quijanes, 2022; Cho & Johnson, 2020; Jacobs & Haberlin, 2022; Qin et al., 2022). In a case where the field experience was in a Spanish-English dual language school, PSTs benefited in promoting their reflective practice resulting in TL (Cho & Johnson, 2020). However, their critical reflections were focused more on linguistics use and cultural backgrounds (Cho & Johnson, 2020). In a short period, an international teaching practicum may not have resulted in a positive transformation (Jacobs & Haberlin, 2022). However, teacher mentors often influenced PSTs' success rather than their critical reflections (Jacobs & Haberlin, 2022). On the other hand, research in cross-national teacher education (Qin et al., 2022) has shown positive reinforcement of reflection practices on teaching experience differently. PSTs shared practical experiences with no solid practices due to the disconnection of the learned English pedagogy and real practicum (Qin et al., 2022). Meanwhile, Chilean PSTs' reflections on three different modes of practicum revealed different degrees of pedagogy responsibility (Barahona & Ibaceta-Quijanes, 2022). Therefore, it is necessary to embark on research to investigate the impact of critical reflection on teaching practicum programs as it is necessary to boost PSTs' pedagogical practices for PC and TL.

Research on PSTs' reflection on the teaching practices in English teacher education programs in Indonesia has been extensively conducted. In reflective practices, PSTs paid more attention to personal perception and contextual aspects of teaching. Their challenges were in skills and practices which were used for classroom management and lesson planning (Widiati et al., 2018). The level of reflectivity was mostly in dialogical reflection, which revealed the ability to describe, analyze, and evaluate instructional practices (Nurfaidah et al., 2017). However, research by Nurfaidah et al. (2017) and Widiati et al. (2018) did not specifically address the issue of PSTs' critical reflection but rather revealed the challenges of PSTs within teaching practices which exposed little quality of critical reflection domain. Other pieces of research have indicated the transformation of PSTs reflective practitioners for the teaching profession (Cirocki & Widodo, 2019; Hendriwanto, 2021; Widodo & Ferdiansyah, 2018) and professional development (Widodo & Ferdiansyah, 2018). PSTs developed reflective competence in an international teaching practicum (Auliya et al., 2020) as a tool of innovation for professional development (Widodo & Ferdiansyah, 2018). Furthermore, PSTs' self-reflection on teaching competence was affected by individual abilities (Rachmawati, 2022). However, research by Auliya et al. (2020), Girocki and Widodo (2019), Hendriwanto (2021), Rachmawati (2022), and Widodo and Ferdiansyah (2018) have not explicitly addressed the issue of PSTs' PC development through the lens of critical reflection, but rather developing reflective competence as an individual strategy for professional development.

There is a limited number of studies portraying PSTs' PC and TL through the lens of critical reflection on the dual online-offline teaching practicum despite the amount of research that has been carried out aforementioned. Thus, more research is needed to investigate the current issue of critical reflection on the teaching practicum for PSTs' PC development and their TL from the Indonesian EFL teacher education program during the new normal as a case study. Such investigation can portray the practical experiences of PSTs' critical reflection on the dual online-offline teaching practicum. In this respect, the urgency of the present research lies in the need to facilitate the PSTs to learn more from critical reflection on the dual online-offline teaching practicum to develop their PC and foster their TL. The PSTs would be engaged in the teaching practicum mode in their placement schools to experience a practical pedagogy in increasing their PC (Cho & Johnson, 2020) and fostering TL (Carter & Kurtt, 2019) through the lens of critical reflection. PSTs' engagement can make them more competent teachers (Qin et al., 2022). In addition, this study would enable PSTs to contribute to teaching practices in blended and hybrid learning systems (Badiozaman et al., 2023; Gil et al., 2022; Pham & Vu, 2024). PSTs' critical reflection on the dual online-offline teaching practicum would lead to their continuous professional development in the post-pandemic (Rafique, 2024). Furthermore, through critical reflection on experience of the dual online-offline teaching practicum, the study would contribute to developing PSTs' PC to the TL process (Carter & Kurtt, 2019; Nganga, 2020). The valuable insight of PSTs' PC development during the teaching practicum within the TL framework

(Mezirow, 2000) would take them to the teaching profession confidently in the changes of teaching practices in the post-pandemic world (Bhatt et al., 2024). Moreover, future Indonesian EFL teachers should possess the standard of teacher competencies, one of which is PC (Saukah, 2009; Widiati & Hayati, 2015; Zein, 2022), implying that PC is essential for teachers to develop (Irmawati et al., 2017; Mata & Suci, 2011). The study will also encourage PSTs to disclose their perspectives on the teaching experience and make changes to achieve more effective and efficient learning within the TL framework (Mezirow, 2000; Mezirow & Taylor, 2009). Therefore, this case study explores lessons learned from how critical reflection on the dual online-offline teaching practicum develops PSTs' PCs and how they perform TL. The study addresses these two research questions: 1) What do Indonesian EFL PSTs learn from critical reflection on the dual online-offline teaching practicum for developing PC? 2) How do Indonesian EFL PSTs perform TL through their field experience of the dual online-offline teaching practicum?

METHOD

The study adopted a qualitative research approach with a phenomenological case study design (Yin, 2015). In this case study, ten PSTs enrolled in a dual online-offline teaching practicum within a two-month teaching practicum experience at schools served as the "case." A case is a "bounded system, a specific, a complex, functioning thing ... an integrated system" (Stake, 1995, p. 2). Within this framework, the study fits with the characteristics of the chosen research design, including small-scale research, no generalization intended, natural class setting, and elaboration of cause-effect relationships. The current issue of critical reflection on the teaching practicum for PSTs' PC development and their TL was explored.

EFL PSTs were engaged in a two-month teaching practicum experience as required in a *Teaching Practice 2* course within the English teacher education preparation program at a state university in Palangka Raya, Central Kalimantan, Indonesia. Ten PSTs were involved, coded as PST1-PST10, enrolled in the dual online-offline teaching practicum during the new normal, and selected through purposive sampling. This technique explores data-rich cases for an in-depth study (Patton, 2015). The participants were selected under the adjusted criteria: willingness to be voluntary research participants, being assigned to teach in junior and senior high schools of diverse cities and school characteristics, being placed in schools different from the previous stages of the practicum, being placed in different teaching levels and grades, and being identified as reflexive PSTs under their teacher educators' approval. The final selected PSTs were based on the recommendations of the faculty members who mostly became their teacher educators. Before the outset of the research, all the participants were assured confidentially and dispensed pseudonyms. The demographic information of the research participants is shown in Table 1.

Multiple data were obtained from reflective journals and focus group interviews throughout a two-month teaching practicum in the dual online-offline teaching practicum. Reflective journals (Finlay, 2008) were used to explore PSTs' critical reflection on TL's field experience and performance. PSTs' PC development and TL performance were identified from their written reflections.

Focus group interviews (Seidman, 2006) were conducted in three groups to confirm or validate the data from the reflective journals. A semi-structured interview was employed (DeJonckheere & Vaughn, 2019; Jamshed, 2014). It is an "in-depth interview where the respondents must answer preset open-ended questions" (Jamshed, 2014). This method was guided by a flexible interview guide and supplemented with a follow-up question, investigation, and comment (DeJonckheere & Vaughn, 2019). All participants were interviewed synchronously through the Zoom platform. The three concurrent focus group interview sessions included 3-4 participants in each session. The focus group interviews were Zoom-recorded and transcribed verbatim for analysis.

The data obtained from the reflective journals and focus group interviews were analyzed deductively (Cho & Johnson, 2020; Creswell, 2012). The data obtained from the focus group interviews were then analyzed thematically. Finally, the identified themes from the thematic

analysis of written reflections and interview data were discussed under each research question to interpret the data (Silverman, 2015) and draw conclusions to present the findings.

Table 1. Demographic information of the participants

Name	Personal profile			Placement context			
	Sex	Age	Teaching level (grade)	Average class size	School characteristic	City area	Teaching mode
PST1	Female	23	Secondary/Junior High School (8th)	30	Public	KPS	Online-offline
PST2	Male	22	Secondary/Junior High School (7th)	20	Religious	BRS	Online-offline
PST3	Female	22	Secondary/Senior High School (10th)	44	Public	PKY	Online-offline
PST4	Male	22	Secondary/Junior High School (8th)	15	Public	BRS	Online-offline
PST5	Female	22	Secondary/Senior High School (10th)	30	Vocational	PKY	Online-offline
PST6	Female	22	Secondary/Senior High School (10th)	40	Public	MHU	Online-offline
PST7	Female	21	Secondary/Junior High School (7th)	15	Public	KPS	Online-offline
PST8	Female	21	Secondary/Junior High School (9th)	36	Public	PKY	Online-offline
PST9	Female	22	Secondary/Senior High School (10th)	34	Vocational	PKY	Online-offline
PST10	Female	22	Secondary/Senior High School (11th)	30	Vocational	PKY	Online-offline

For the trustworthiness of the data analysis process, some methods were applied as follows: elaborating on how to come up with the results by presenting the data in detail, describing our role in the analysis process, reflecting varied arguments, and triangulating multiple data collection methods (Creswell, 2012). These undertaken steps allow more valid data representation.

In summary, this phenomenological case study (Yin, 2015) was carried out to investigate what PSTs learned from critical reflection on a dual online-offline teaching practicum for developing PC and TL. It comprises recruiting the participants, briefing sessions for PSTs to write reflective journals, giving assignments for reflective journal writing, identifying the critical reflection, holding focus group interviews, performing thematic analysis, and ensuring the trustworthiness of the study.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Finding

Significant themes emerged from the analyzed data. This allows the portrayal of interpretations to answer the RQ1 and RQ2. All the themes that emerged from the analysis were adopted from the familiar prior codes in the literature on critical reflection for developing PSTs’ PC within the TL framework.

Critical reflection on the dual online-offline teaching practicum for developing PC

Two themes emerged from the data analysis dealing with lessons learned from critical reflection on the dual online-offline teaching practicum for developing PSTs’ PC. The codes and emerging themes are shown in Table 2.

Table 2. Codes and emerging themes for RQ1

Codes	Themes
Understanding learners' characters effectively, well-prepared teaching planning, well-prepared materials, assessing students' works, recalling students' background knowledge, Presentation format management, choosing an effective teaching method	Instructional practices for developing PC
Classroom management capability, suitable apps with online-offline teaching mode, understanding learners' characters, student management capability, the competence of tech-mediated teaching method use, mastering scenario lesson planning, Selection of teaching material needs	PC enhancement

Instructional practices for PSTs' PC development

One of the significant instructional practices within the teaching practicum serves to develop PSTs' PC which includes managing the course effectively. The data showed that PSTs began teaching practice in a well-prepared planned teaching session. By doing so, they practiced developing PC, especially in course management capability (Madhavaram & Laverie, 2010; Shah et al., 2020). Most PSTs practiced it for their PC development, as revealed in the following data.

"From my critical reflection, the lesson learned from my teaching practice is that, as a teacher candidate, I can solve problems regarding teaching preparations, such as being well-prepared. They are in terms of collecting materials from learning resources, planning lessons for each meeting, and mastering subject matters. Those are the essential things that I have mastered." (PST2, Reflective Journal)

"Based on my self-reflection on the teaching practice at a vocational high school, I have learned a lot about managing classes and courses, interacting with students, preparing teaching materials, and evaluating students' work." (PST5, Focus Group Interview)

Additionally, PSTs revealed that they managed the classroom effectively by formatting the presentation of the materials for the practical class due to learners' varied abilities, as stated by PST1.

"In the case of teaching materials, I have taught [in my class], I divided some of the materials into two meetings. I did so as I didn't force them to master [the materials] in just one day. This is also due to the different abilities of students. Some students quickly understood the materials, but others needed more time to digest the materials I conveyed." (PST1, Reflective Journal)

As the above excerpt indicated, PSTs tried to format presentation quality by guiding students with varied abilities so that the students would develop self-awareness in learning. This result is akin to the study denoting that PSTs' reflective practice escalated their PC through effective classroom management with different presentation formats to raise student awareness in learning (Auliya et al., 2020). However, student awareness was more oriented toward language awareness (Dubiner, 2018). By formatting the quality of the presentations in the instructional practices, PSTs may focus on developing their capabilities in classroom management (Madhavaram & Laverie, 2010).

Besides, PSTs applied an instructional practice for PC development. They handled the teaching mode situation by conveying materials to assist students in learning, as indicated by PST1.

"The school was not fully open as before the pandemic; this becomes a challenge to implementing an online learning model. Consequently, one class is divided into two groups in which half of the first group should be present in the class, and the rest should do their self-study at home. Another problem is teaching time. If offline learning is carried out, a one-hour lesson is only 30 minutes long. It has been reduced from the typical 45 minutes without a break. It certainly concerns me. How can I convey the material quickly [as scheduled in offline teaching mode] to make students understand." (PST1, Reflective Journal)

In a PC development component, coded under instructional practices for class and course management capabilities, PSTs reflected on the field experience that students can be taught to organize by understanding their characteristics. They experienced it along with self-confidence development in the teaching practicum.

“Based on my reflection on my teaching experience, I have gained a lot of knowledge in terms of teaching preparation, building self-confidence, and understanding the characteristics of each student. I can learn how to understand it to make effective learning.” (PST3, Focus Group Interview)

“The lesson I got from reflecting on my teaching practice is understanding students' characteristics. Some students can understand the lesson quickly, but others are delayed. So, I must be more careful in choosing the right teaching method for students so that they have the same opportunity to actively participate even though their learning abilities are different.” (PST4, Reflective Journal)

PSTs' PC enhancement

The part of PSTs' PC improvement in the teaching practicum included classroom management capability. Within the data, PSTs controlled the class effectively in the teaching practicum despite their first teaching experiences. This finding agrees with the previous research that showed PSTs' experiences of managing the class in certain teaching modes lead them to be competent teachers (Cho & Johnson, 2020; Qin et al., 2022), as evidenced below.

“When I taught my students in offline and online classes, my teaching [pedagogical] competence has increased, including managing the class. I could select and use the teaching materials taken from internet resources such as textbooks and [combine] the technology in software/hardware applications, blogs, YouTube videos, and learning websites. I felt it is effective and efficient learning.” (PST8, Reflective Journal)

“... [my improved pedagogical competence] is controlling the class and being closer to students so that they can understand what I taught. [It deals with] teaching techniques and class management.” (PST7, Focus Group Interview)

“... I asked the students at the first meeting. Most of whom were silent. Then at the next meeting, they were quite able to respond to the lesson I taught and were willing to interact with me. It means that I have improved my pedagogical competence.” (PST8, Focus Group Interview)

As the above excerpts revealed, PSTs' PC has improved in managing the class effectively. They greatly selected and utilized teaching materials taken from internet resources and textbooks by combining them with technology. Like the findings, PSTs' PC improvement was indicated by their skills performance in taking benefits from internet resources for class management (Li & Lin, 2022). Their PC has also increased in applying teaching techniques. However, by applying the teaching techniques, PSTs have engaged in the teaching mode for practical pedagogy experience in a certain school setting (Cho & Johnson, 2020; Qin et al., 2022). The competence of using technology-mediated teaching methods was another PC improvement. PSTs selected suitable apps and taught materials for students' needs. In terms of the contribution, this finding supports the research of Jiang et al. (2021), Kusuma (2021), and Ma and Lee (2021) on the value of preparing online-offline activities and materials integrated with face-to-face teaching into technology to provide learning services with distance learning instructions as confessed in the following data.

“My pedagogical competence had improved when I practised teaching in the classroom, [that is] my ability to manage online and offline classes. Another improvement is to select materials from several sources, such as handbooks, learning resource websites, and YouTube. I also made PPT of the teaching materials obtained from the sources.” (PST5, Focus Group Interview)

“Yes, my pedagogical competence has improved. As proof, I practised my online learning using Google Classroom (GC) in the first few meetings. It allows me to develop various media to be accessed online. I started developing PPT through

canvas and some videos to be accessed online. My ability to present materials has also improved. I can carefully operate GC and things related to tools in online classes. Due to limited internet access, I cannot access some other software/hardware.” (PST6, Reflective Journal)

Additionally, PSTs revealed that their PC improvement benefited from the teaching materials and was adjusted based on the students’ needs. They integrated all the teaching materials into technology.

“What I improved regarding pedagogical competence from my reflection on my teaching practice is the ability to take advantage of available teaching materials to present in the class. I presented the materials by adjusting them according to the student's needs.” (PST9, Focus Group Interview)

“I have increased my ability to use technology as a teaching medium. I create material and explain it in online learning, but it cannot be separated from its existing technology, such as Zoom, Google Classroom, PPT, etc. I reflect on my teaching practice using technology-based media, so I understand well how and what I should use for them [what application is suitable for them] makes them easier to learn in the two learning modes, online and offline.” (PST10, Reflective Journal)

By integrating teaching materials into technology, PSTs also developed tech-based media. They created and integrated the teaching materials into existing technology and presented them by selecting suitable apps. We found that the dual online-offline teaching practicum provided PSTs with a new teaching experience in a certain teaching mode. This is to increase the quality of the learning experience and facilitate students’ learning engagement. This finding resonates with Wang (2021) and Wong et al. (2020), who noted that the dual online-offline teaching practicum as a blended learning mode could enhance the quality of the learning experience, enable students to enjoy learning and facilitate learning engagement. Indeed, the current teaching mode, the so-called blended learning, has become a basic element for distance teaching instruction for the quality of dual online-offline teaching practicum in the new normal (Jiang et al., 2021; Mumford & Dikilitaş, 2020).

PSTs also voiced that they increased their PC capability for student management. They could manage students by understanding learners’ characteristics. One of the participants stated as follows.

“... my pedagogical competence has increased in understanding the students’ characteristics with different abilities in learning. I can help the students develop their abilities by helping each other. [However], I did not address their mistakes before the class to make them more confident. I also made lesson plans mastered the materials, and applied teaching methods according to the class conditions [in online-offline teaching mode]. I always motivate them to learn English.” (PST4, Focus Group Interview)

The excerpt indicated that PSTs enhanced their capability of student management by understanding students’ characteristics and abilities. This study highlighted PSTs’ engagement in reflective practices on the dual online-offline teaching practicum. Their professional identity has strengthened through their abilities of critical reflection on the teaching practicum in PC development. PSTs’ PC enhancement can be observed through classroom management capabilities in utilizing tech-mediated teaching methods and benefiting resources from the internet. In this respect, PSTs have engaged in the practical pedagogy experience in the teaching practicum for new teaching experiences. The capability of student management has also been effectively enhanced, supported by PSTs’ mentoring, and understanding of students’ characteristics. By strengthening teacher professional identity, PSTs intend to have a new transition to their future teaching profession of the post-pandemic time.

PSTs’ TL performance through the field experience

Regarding the research findings about PSTs’ TL performance through the field experience of the dual online-offline teaching practicum, the two emerging themes were derived from the data analysis. The codes and emerging themes are presented in Table 3.

Table 3. Codes and emerging themes for RQ2

Codes	Themes
Guiding in learning to build English skills, motivating and mentoring, relating materials to everyday life, grasping students' learning interest through tech-based media, recalling background knowledge to begin lessons, encouraging students by elaborating the materials, searching, and using internet resources	Boosting to make changes to mindsets and thinking habits in learning
Mentoring self-directed learning, asking for more practical activities, taking benefits from tutorial videos, guidance for tasking independently, mentoring for practical responsibility, elaborating lessons effectively, growing awareness	Making aware of learning and becoming better learners

Boosting students to make changes to their mindset and thinking habits in learning

Within the teaching practicum, PSTs undergo strong guidance to encourage students. They motivated students to develop English skills. PSTs began to motivate students to love English. Motivation for changing students' mindsets and thinking habits in learning becomes essential in TL (Nolan & Molla, 2021). They are experienced in motivating students to learn English.

"I motivated them [students] to prefer English lessons. I also encouraged them to use additional classes [out of class] in the afternoon and evening to increase their learning interests." (PST1, Focus Group Interview)

"I conveyed to them the importance of learning English in my class. It prepares them for a future time facing higher English learning. To improve their learning mindsets, I related the materials to everyday life in my presentation while encouraging them to question what they don't understand." (PST2, Focus Group Interview)

The data indicated that PSTs motivated students to keep on English learning by providing English lessons with extra classes. In addition, PSTs presented learning materials about daily life through questioning the change of learning mindset and thinking habits. This finding is in line with Jacobs and Haberlin's (2022) study, which revealed the ways such as questioning within learning activities can change students' mindset and thinking habits in TL. This also confirms the statement by Mezirow (2000) and Mezirow and Taylor (2009) that PSTs transformed their learning mindset and thinking habits to enable them to re-evaluate their beliefs and past experiences for change or to improve their teaching practices.

Another way to boost the students in changing mindset and thinking habits is through practices of mentoring, as evidenced below.

"... in my teaching practice, I found it difficult to control or change my students' mindsets in learning English. They had difficulties in speaking and writing skills. Therefore, I tried to direct them in learning to speak rather than in writing. Generally, I developed both their English skills." (PST3, Focus Group Interview)

"When starting the lesson, I asked the students to read a text. I previously introduced them to the issue. They learned to understand reading and improved reading skills. Next, I immediately asked them whether they understood the contents or not. Some students answered, but some did not. I emphasized assisting students who were less active and did not give any responses, so they did not miss out." (PST4, Reflective Journal)

The participants expressed their attempts to change the previous learning situation to the new mindset of learning with critical thinking. PSTs boosted the changes by mentoring students to enhance their English skills, while others are focused on directing to comprehend the texts. PSTs also assisted students in thinking habits of the arising issues by questioning. This result confirms the statement by Perumal & Maistry (2021) and Nolan & Molla (2021) that PSTs experience the process of TL through mentoring, which aims to make changes in the student's mindset and thinking habits for better and more effective learning. PSTs also realized that they demonstrated TL by boosting students to change their mindset and thinking habits in learning. They grasped students' learning interests through tech-based media. This result is supported by

Kusuma (2021) and Shah et al.'s (2020) studies indicating the effective attempt to change learning interests using technology-based media integration. Some of the participants shared that:

"To change students' mindsets and thinking habits in learning, I started learning by motivating them to learn English. I encouraged them by elaborating my lessons [materials] using technology-based media such as PPT with clear and practical examples to grasp their learning interests." (PST5, Focus Group Interview)

"...I always associated the materials with the surroundings when presenting materials during classes. So, I could not tell them [the topic] right away. For example, learning about exposition text. At first, they didn't understand what the text was. So, I asked them, "Do you know the news or the newspapers? They could be in the form of printouts or website." Then I gave them the text examples taken from the internet or websites whose topics are happening around us." (PST9, Reflective Journal)

The data above expressed PSTs encouraging students by elaborating the materials to grasp learning interests using tech-based media. PSTs conveyed the materials from internet resources by relating to the students' surroundings for recall background knowledge. This study revealed that all the attempts changed students' mindsets to learning engagement so that they could change their thinking habits. This is as Wyant & Lockwood (2018) contend that TL conceptualizes learners' learning process to form fundamental changes in their mindsets and the frame of reference and thinking habits. However, the learning process must involve expressing learners' knowledge and critically reflecting to evaluate their perceptions and thoughts (Qin et al., 2022; Wyant & Lockwood, 2018). Indeed, the learning situation in TL becomes meaningful if learners are directly engaged in the learning experience (Nolan & Molla, 2021).

The present study emphasized PSTs' TL performance through the field experience of the dual online-offline teaching practicum. PSTs encouraged students to change their mindset and thinking habits in learning through motivating and questioning within learning activities since these ways are essential in TL. Mentoring and grasping learning interests through tech-based media are the PSTs' attempts to form the essential changes in their mindsets, frame of reference, and thinking habits as the TL concepts. As such, PSTs' knowledge expression and their engagement in critical reflection need to be made meaningful in TL learning situations.

Making students aware of learning and become better learners

Within the field experience of the teaching practicum, PSTs performed TL to make students aware of learning and becoming better learners. They transformed learning by asking students to practice self-directed learning. By asking learners to be independent through transformation, PSTs undertake TL to make learners aware of learning and becoming better learners individually (Qin et al., 2022).

"To make students aware [of learning] to be better learners, I usually put tutorial videos of learning into the classroom. They can re-learn it [through the videos] anytime and anywhere. They can practice it more easily. They understand [the lessons] better than I have explained when questioning and answering sessions. They gained understanding by learning from the videos." (PST5, Focus Group Interview)

In this case, PSTs directed students to do self-directed learning. The study indicated that PSTs benefited from tutorial videos for learning to carry out more practical activities within TL during the teaching practicum. The students were aware and became better learners through self-directed learning. This finding resonates with Madhavaram (2021) and Perumal and Maistry (2021), who found that PSTs required knowledge of technology-mediated teaching methods to make better decisions about how to use and adapt the methods for classes to direct students to do self-directed learning. In this respect, PSTs engaged in a certain teaching mode to experience more practical activities of utilizing tech-mediated teaching methods within TL, leading them to be competent and transformational teachers (Cho & Johnson, 2020; Qin et al., 2022). However, students must be aware and become better learners individually in understanding and resolving the raising issues (Jacobs & Haberland, 2022). PSTs benefited from the tutorial videos as a tech-mediated teaching method, so they can better decide how to adapt it for effective learning

(Madhavaram & Laverie, 2010) and lead students to be independent learners. One participant acknowledged that:

"I asked my students to continue studying at home [independently]. An online learning session forced them to study at home. I gave them a guide for learning by doing assignments. In the offline learning session, they came to school, most of whom usually played along with school activities ... Gradually, it seemed they were aware of learning and becoming better learners." (PST10, Reflective Journal)

The excerpt above indicated that PSTs performed TL by asking students to do self-directed learning. They guided students to take on a task independently. This result is like research findings showing the students' self-directed learning progress, which was guided by competent PSTs with adequate performing TL during teaching practicum (Farhadiba & Wulyani, 2020). Moreover, PSTs' reflections support the development of growth competencies so they can evolve professionally and individually when guiding students to self-directed learning in learning practices (Korkko et al., 2016). While the students engaged in the tasks, PSTs controlled and assessed their work. Indeed, the attempts were employed by monitoring and evaluating learners' work to make them aware of learning to become better learners (Shah et al., 2020).

Another way to make students aware of learning and become better learners was through mentoring. This is for practical responsibility throughout the teaching practicum. PSTs guided students by elaborating the lesson, giving detailed explanations, and tasking with the deadline. One participant, PST9, confessed that:

"I tried to explain the material in detail, so all students with different abilities could follow my lesson [material]. Then, I often gave assignments at the end with a deadline [for each work] ... They could accomplish their work by the due date. They kept being responsible and were not careless in doing the tasks. Most of them finally became more aware of their learning duties." (PST9, Focus Group Interview)

As reported above, PSTs mentored students and elaborated the lessons briefly and appropriately to grasp their learning. The students were targeted to accomplish work within the due date for responsibility and be more aware of their learning tasks. The finding is consistent with previous research on TL that mentoring students for responsible practices during teaching practicum can be effective (Jacobs & Haberin, 2022). However, for more effective practices dealing with student management by mentoring students to grasp learning, PSTs require a focus on learning treatment to form desired students' behavior when mentoring them to build a good relationship with the students (Perumal & Maistry, 2021; Shah et al., 2020). This process makes students to be aware of learning and become better learners.

On top of all of these, this study pointed to PSTs' TL performance through the field experience of the dual online-offline teaching practicum to make students aware of learning and becoming better learners. PSTs undertook TL by tasking for self-directed learning practice and mentoring students. PSTs' growth competencies have developed through critical reflection on the teaching practicum. Therefore, the transformative process happens in this situation. For future teaching professions, PSTs are guided to be competent teachers since they demonstrated TL through the experience to keep students responsible for growing self-awareness. By engaging in more practical activities and learning treatment to form desired students' behavior within TL, PSTs are led to be transformational teachers.

Discussion

The data showed that PSTs manifested their critical reflection within the teaching practicum, which may improve their PC for the future teaching profession (Barahona & Ibaceta-Quijanés, 2022). They experienced instructional practices to develop course management capability, including well-prepared materials, resource exploration, lesson planning, and assessing students' work. This finding aligns with the study indicating the need for PSTs' instructional practices to develop PC, particularly concerning the capability of course management (Shah et al., 2019). In developing course management capability, PSTs should be engaged in instructional practices for course plan and preparation, lesson planning, resource exploration, syllabus development, meeting preparation, monitoring and evaluating learners'

works, and assessing student work and the course action (Amalia et al., 2020; Shah et al., 2019). However, to escalate PSTs' PC to be competent teachers towards quality foreign language teaching, possessing course management capability is insufficient. PSTs are required to acquire more elements of PC (Perumal & Maistry, 2021; Nganga, 2020). PSTs are prepared to master subject matter prior to the teaching practicum. Initially, PSTs fully taught the classes by recalling students' background knowledge and helping them understand the materials by simplifying them. This finding confirms the study results by Nganga (2020), showing that PSTs began teaching practice in a well-prepared planned teaching session to improve PC and preparedness in future teaching (Nganga, 2020). However, PSTs require controlling activities more on a professional reflective learning process with well-preparation and readiness to face the challenges ahead (Arslan, 2019; Hayati et al., 2018).

As manifested in the written reflection, PSTs learned a lesson from the practice of teaching time management throughout the teaching practicum. They faced problems concerning the school environment. From their critical reflection on the arising issues, they could encounter the problem by managing the class successfully. This finding is consistent with a previous study undertaken regarding EFL PSTs' reflections through the teaching practicum experience phase in schools, which resulted in some of the competencies and behaviors that occurred in the school environment (Arslan, 2019). PSTs may develop their PC by technically managing their class well, like teaching time management (Widiati et al., 2018). In this respect, it attempts to educate PSTs about the diverse school teaching environment (Wong et al., 2020) to engage them in instructional practices in such a dual online-offline teaching mode for PC development.

PSTs clearly expressed their instructional practices to manage students effectively. To do so, they attempted to understand students' characteristics. This result resonates with Auliya et al. (2020), who found PSTs' reflections affected the teaching strategies enactment and student management practices to meet the students' necessities and characteristics in classes. Critical reflection also facilitated PSTs' reflective competence and stimulated PC development (Miftah et al., 2023), which led them to build teacher professional development (Hendriwanto, 2021; Qin et al., 2022; Rafique, 2024; Wulyani, 2017). However, managing students effectively requires capabilities including assessing students' learning achievement and reactions, motivating, advising, and mentoring students to build a good relationship with them (Perumal & Maistry, 2021; Shah et al., 2020). Due to students' characteristics and diverse abilities, PSTs decided to replan the lesson and apply appropriate teaching strategies for effective teaching. They also give students the same chances of learning opportunities to engage and get well-motivated in English.

The present study underscored the necessity of well-prepared instructional practices to develop PSTs' PC within the dual online-offline teaching practicum. The instructional practices they applied in classes were centered on the course management capability for successful class management. It was successfully taken by handling the teaching practicum mode with lesson plan replanning and appropriate teaching strategies. By understanding students' characteristics, PSTs managed to handle the course effectively, and they were engaged with the instructional practices of the teaching practicum in the post-pandemic with self-confidence development for their future teaching practices.

Many participants reported that their PC enhanced in practicing tech-mediated teaching methods through internet-based apps. The rising problem dealt with the schools' limited internet access. This finding is consistent with previous research undertaken concerning blended learning as a learning system in the teaching practicum which prepared online-offline learning activities and materials by integrating face-to-face teaching with technology (Jiang et al., 2021; Kusuma, 2021), and it escalated the teaching practice quality to enable students for more enjoyable and active learning and facilitate their learning engagement (Wang, 2021; Wong et al., 2020). Indeed, PSTs' critical reflection on the teaching practicum has practically changed behaviors and abilities in developing their PC (Nganga, 2020; Mata & Suci, 2011). In this respect, PSTs developed personal abilities by combining tangible and intangible resources (Madhavaram & Laverie, 2010).

This finding aligns with Nganga's (2020) study that managing students effectively along with the instructional process will result in students' successful learning and improve their learning achievement, also confirming that by mentoring learners and understanding their

characteristics, PSTs focused on improving student management capabilities (Madhavaram & Laverie, 2010) to be competent teachers (Perumal & Maistry, 2021). PSTs realized that they intended to transition to the future teaching profession, and the capability to reflect on the field experience of the teaching practicum is through organizing students. It was valuable PC enhancement for preparing PSTs' professional identity to be competent teachers due to their critical reflection during the teaching practicum. This result is like the previous research indicating that reflective practice by engaging in professional tasks such as self or collaborative reflection on the teaching practices such as student management could stimulate PSTs' professional and PC development and strengthen their professional identity to be reflective teachers (Ardi et al., 2023a, 2023b; Hendriwanto, 2021).

CONCLUSION

The present study suggests pedagogical implications. The portrait of PSTs' PC and TL through the lens of critical reflection on the teaching practicum in the dual online-offline teaching practicum in the new normal from the case of Indonesian EFL PSTs provides empirical evidence. In addition, the study contributes to PSTs' PC development in a certain teaching mode to the transformative process. It gives insight into PSTs' PC development so that they will be more confident in the teaching profession. Furthermore, PSTs' field experience in the current teaching practicum creates what we consider TL, in which the assumptions, past experiences, and personal perspectives on the past field experience in the teaching practicum can be addressed critically. Through the lens of critical reflection on the teaching practicum, the perspectives from past experiences will be open and make changes for more effective and efficient learning in the TL framework. Finally, the findings can be a catalyst for better changes in the PSTs' teaching practicum for professional development.

The present study is limited to small-scale research in the local context of Indonesian EFL with ten PSTs. Two data collection instruments for the critical reflection investigation were used in a particular teaching mode of the teaching practicum. Future research might include more participants from bigger-scale research, and this can be expanded to international teacher education programs. Investigation on the same issue of teaching practicum with the diverse teaching practicum modes may also be applied. Moreover, it may apply multiple data collection tools for comprehensive research with quality findings to the research contribution of the same issue in different contexts. Finally, it is recommended that the English teacher preparation program of teacher education programs in the ESL/EFL context requires emphasis on redesigning the curriculum of Teaching Practicum, such as in the *Teaching Practice 2 Course* regarding the present study context, by taking into account the study's results of the lessons learned from PSTs' critical reflection on the dual online-offline teaching practicum for developing PC and their TL performance through the field experience of the teaching practicum. Policymakers could also use the study results to facilitate PSTs in reflective teaching during practicum in diverse teaching modes, such as in the dual online-offline teaching or blended learning setting, which might be applied in post-pandemic. In this respect, reflective teaching itself in diverse settings becomes an alternative approach to escalate PSTs' PC in professional development for a better future teaching career, and it is an innovation in the field experience within the TL framework.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This study was financially supported by the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, Technology and Higher Education of the Republic of Indonesia through the Management of Research of Universitas Negeri Malang – Lembaga Penelitian dan Pengabdian kepada Masyarakat (LPPM) – Grant No.: 18.5.60/UN32/KP/2022.

REFERENCES

- Amalia, L. L., Widiati, U., Basthomi, Y., & Cahyono, B. Y. (2020). Reflective practice on lesson planning among EFL teacher educators. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 10(1), 153-160. <https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v10i1.25025>.

- Ardi, P., Widyaningsih, T. L., & Widiati, U. (2023a). Appreciative collaborative reflection to catalyze Indonesian EFL teachers' identity configuration in a teacher professional education program. *Education and Self Development*, 18(2), 10-26. <https://doi.org/10.26907/esd.18.2.02>.
- Ardi, P., Mukti, T. W. P., Basthomi, Y., & Widiati, U. (2023b). Delving into Indonesian EFL pre-service teachers' professional identity configuration in teaching practicum. *rEFLECTIONS*, 30(2), 223-246. <https://so05.tci-thaijo.org/index.php/reflections/article/view/266762>.
- Arslan, F. Y. (2019). Reflection in pre-service teacher education: Exploring the nature of four EFL pre-service teachers' reflections. *Reflective Practice*, 20(1), 111-124. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14623943.2018.1564652>.
- Auliya, A. G., Marlina, N., & Dewi, N. S. N. (2020). Reflective practice in international teaching practicum: A case study of an Indonesian pre-service teacher in Thailand. *Journal of Teaching & Learning English in Multicultural Contexts (TLEMC)*, 4(2), 75-86. <http://dx.doi.org/10.37058/tlemc.v4i2.2164>.
- Badiozaman, I. F. A., Ng, A., & Ling, V. M. (2023). "Here we go again": Unfolding HE students' hybrid experience and resilience during post-covid times. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 43(4), 1-22. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2023.2238324>.
- Barahona, M., & Ibaceta-Quijanes, X. (2022). Chilean EFL student teachers and social justice: Ambiguity and uncertainties in understanding their professional pedagogical responsibility. *Teachers and Teaching*, 28(4), 1-15. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540602.2022.2062726>.
- Bhatt, V., Gupta, D. B., & Sharma, A. (2024). Technical courses and virtual teaching learning practice: A post pandemic study. *Measurement: Interdisciplinary Research and Perspectives*, 22(3), 1-22. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15366367.2023.2297452>.
- Carter, P. W., & Kurtts, S. A. (2019). Dialogic reflective e-journaling: Providing extra field-based support to special education preservice teachers by enhancing their critical reflection skills and transformative learning. *Reflective Practice*, 20(3), 383-395. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14623943.2019.1617125>.
- Cho, H., & Johnson, P. (2020). Preservice teachers' transformative learning through field experience with emergent bilinguals in a dual language school. *Reflective Practice*, 21(6), 1-15. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14623943.2020.1821625>.
- Cirocki, A., & Widodo, H. P. (2019). Reflective practice in English language teaching in Indonesia: Shared practices from two teacher educators. *Iranian Journal of Language Teaching Research*, 7(3), 15-35. <https://dx.doi.org/10.30466/ijltr.2019.120734>.
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research* (4th ed.). Pearson Education.
- DeJonckheere, M., & Vaughn L. M. (2019). Semistructured interviewing in primary care research: A balance of relationship and rigour. *Family Medicine Community Health*, 7(e000057), 1-8. <https://doi.org/10.1136/fmch-2018-000057>.
- Farhadiba, D., & Wulyani, A. N. (2020). Investigating preservice teachers' efficacy level and factors influencing it. *KnE Social Science*, 4(4), 40-49. <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v4i4.6464>.
- Farrell, T. S. C. (2009). Critical reflection in a TESL course: Mapping conceptual change. *ELT Journal*, 63(3), 221-229. <https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/ccn058>.
- Finlay, L. (2008). A dance between the reduction and reflexivity: Explicating the phenomenological psychological attitude. *Journal of Phenomenological Psychology*, 39(1), 1-32. <https://doi.org/10.1163/156916208X311601>.

- Gil, E., Mor, Y., Dimitriadis, Y., & Köppe, C. (Eds.). (2022). *Hybrid learning spaces*. Springer.
- Hayati, N., Widiati, U., & Furaidah. (2018). Understanding reasons behind student teachers' pedagogical decisions. *Electronic Journal of Foreign Language Teaching*, 15(2), 256-270. <https://e-flt.nus.edu.sg/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/hayati.pdf>.
- Hendriwanto. (2021). A reflective teaching practicum as a platform for stimulating pre-service teachers' professional development. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 47(4), 624-626. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02607476.2021.1941812>.
- Irmawati, D. K., Widiati, U., & Cahyono, B. Y. (2017). How do Indonesian professional English teachers develop their pedagogical competence in teaching implementation? *Arab World English Journal (AWEJ)*, 8(2), 293-307. <https://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awej/vol8no2.21>.
- Jacobs, J. & Haberman, S. (2022). Transformative learning within an international teaching experience: Developing as emerging culturally responsive teachers. *Action in Teacher Education*, 44(1), 1-18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01626620.2021.1955774>.
- Jamshed, S. (2014). Qualitative research method-interviewing and observation. *Journal of Basic and Clinical Pharmacy*, 5(4), 87-88. <https://doi.org/10.4103/0976-0105.141942>.
- Jiang, Y., Chen, Y., Lu, J., & Wang, Y. (2021). The effect of the online and offline blended teaching mode on English as a foreign language learners' listening performance in a Chinese context. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 12, 1-16. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2021.742742>.
- Korkko, M., Kyro-Ammala, O., & Turunen, T. (2016). Professional development through reflection in teacher education. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 55, 198-206. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2016.01.014>.
- Kusuma, I. P. I. (2021). TPACK-related programs for pre-service English teachers: An in-depth analysis on efforts and issues of ICT integration. *Cakrawala Pendidikan: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan*, 40(1), 183-195. <http://dx.doi.org/10.21831/cp.v40i1.28820>.
- Li, G., & Lin, Z. (2022). Chinese-Canadian parents supporting dual online-offline learning and early biliteracy during COVID-19 school closures: "Two schools, two languages". In K. Fox, & L. Szech (Eds.), *Handbook of Research on Family Literacy Practices and Home-School Connections* (pp. 159-175). IGI Global. <https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-6684-4569-3.ch010>.
- Ma, L., & Lee, C. S. (2021). Evaluating the effectiveness of blended learning using the ARCS model. *Journal of Computer Assisted Learning*, 37, 1-12. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jcal.12579>.
- Madhavaram, S. (2021). Shelby D. Hunt's contributions to the marketing discipline: Research programs, impact, and compelling opportunities. *Journal of Global Scholars of Marketing Science*, 31(2), 125-129. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21639159.2020.1785921>.
- Madhavaram, S., & Laverie, D. A. (2010). Developing pedagogical competence: Issues and implications for marketing education. *Journal of Marketing Education*, 32(2), 197-213. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0273475309360162>.
- Mata, L., & Suci, A. I. (2011). Curricular innovative model focused on developing pedagogical competences of teachers of language and communication. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 12, 274-282. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2011.02.036>.
- Mezirow, J. (2000). *Learning as transformation: Critical perspectives on a theory in progress*. Jossey-Bass.
- Mezirow, J., & Taylor, E. W. (Eds.), (2009). *Transformative learning in practice: Insights from community, workplace, and higher education*. Jossey-Bass.

- Miftah, M. Z., Basthomi, Y., & Syahid, A. (2022). Preservice teachers' reflections on English teaching practicum for professional development: A bibliometric analysis. *Pedagogika, 147*(3), 198-226. <https://doi.org/10.15823/p.2022.147.10>.
- Miftah, M. Z., Widiati, U., & Wulyani, A. N. (2023). Critical reflection on ELT practicum: Stimulating preservice teachers' pedagogical competence for transformative learning. In M. F. Ubaidillah et al. (Eds.), *Proceedings of the 4th International Conference on English Language Teaching (ICON-ELT 2023), Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research 780* (pp. 43-55). Atlantis Press. https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-38476-120-3_6.
- Mumford, S., & Dikilitaş, K. (2020). Pre-service language teachers' reflection development through online interaction in a hybrid learning course. *Computers & Education, 144*, 103706. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2019.103706>.
- Nganga, L. (2020). Analyzing children's literature for hidden bias helps preservice teachers gain pedagogical practices in critical multicultural education. *Journal of Research in Childhood Education, 34*(1), 93-107. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02568543.2019.1692109>.
- Nolan, A., & Molla, T. (2021). Building teacher professional capabilities through transformative learning. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education, 49*(1), 1-16. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1359866X.2020.1828823>.
- Nurfaidah, S., Lengkanawati, S., N., & Sukyadi, D. (2017). Levels of reflection in EFL pre-service teachers' teaching journal. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics, 7*(1), 80- 92. <http://dx.doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v7i1.6861>.
- Patton, M. Q. (2015). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods* (4th ed.). SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Perumal, K., & Maistry, S., (2021). Pedagogical competencies of South African marketing educators. *Africa Education Review, 17*(5), 56-75. <https://doi.org/10.1080/18146627.2021.1878377>.
- Pham, Q. H., & Vu, K. P. (2024). Leveraging lecturers' intelligence for student engagement enrichment in blended learning courses. *Cogent Education, 11*(1), 2334930. <https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2024.2334930>.
- Qin, B., Zhu, G., Cheng, C., Membiela, P., Mena, J., & Zhu, J. (2022). Leveraging third space amid Chinese and Spanish student teachers' teaching practicums: A transformative learning perspective. *Professional Development in Education, 48*(1), 1-23. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19415257.2021.1939101>.
- Rachmawati, D. (2022). Self-concept of EFL preservice teachers as reflected in their teaching performance. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics, 12*(1), 40-55. <https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v12i1.46533>.
- Rafique, R. (2024). Supporting teachers through online professional development: A small-scale qualitative study with teachers in Bangladesh. *Open Learning: The Journal of Open, Distance and e-Learning, 39*(2), 112-131. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02680513.2024.2316629>.
- Saukah, A. (2009). English language teacher education in Indonesia. In Y. H. Choi & B. Spolsky (Eds.), *English language teacher education in Asia* (pp. 1-28). Asia TEFL.
- Seidman, I. (2006). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences*. Teachers College Press.
- Shah, P., Laverie, D. A., & Madhavaram, S. (2020). Summative and formative evaluation of marketing teaching portfolios: A pedagogical competence-based rubric. *Marketing Education Review, 30*(4), 208-224. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10528008.2020.1823235>.

- Silverman, D. (2015). *Interpreting qualitative data*. SAGE Publication Ltd.
- Stake, R. E. (1995). *The art of case study research*. SAGE Publication Ltd.
- Supkhonovna, H. N. (2021). Technology for the development of the qualities of pedagogical competence in future teachers. *Asian Journal of Multidimensional Research*, 10(5), 372-382. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5958/2278-4853.2021.00416.X>.
- Wang, C. (2021). Employing blended learning to enhance learners', English conversation: A preliminary study of teaching with HiTutor. *Education and Information Technologies*, 26, 2407-2425. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-020-10363-5>.
- Widiati, U., & Hayati, N. (2015). Teacher professional education in Indonesia and ASEAN 2015: Lessons learned from English language teacher education programs. In *ASEAN integration and the role of English language teaching* (pp. 121-148). IDP Education. http://dx.doi.org/10.5746/LEiA/ASEAN_Integ_ELt.
- Widiati, U., Suryati, N., & Hayati, N. (2018). Unraveling the challenges of Indonesian novice teachers of English. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 7(3), 621-629. <https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v7i3.9824>.
- Widodo, H. P. (2014). Methodological considerations in interview data transcription. *International Journal of Innovation in English Language Teaching and Research*, 3(1), 101-107.
- Widodo, H. P., & Ferdiansyah, S. (2018). Engaging student teachers in video-mediated self-reflection in teaching practica. In K. J. Kennedy, & J. C-K. Lee (Eds.), *Routledge International Handbook of Schools and Schooling in Asia* (pp. 922-934). Routledge. <https://www.routledgehandbooks.com/doi/10.4324/9781315694382-89>.
- Wong, K. T., Hwang, G. J., Goh, P. S. C., & Arrif, S. K. M. (2020). Effects of blended learning pedagogical practices on students' motivation and autonomy for the teaching of short stories in upper secondary English. *Interactive Learning Environments*, 28(4), 512-525. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2018.1542318>.
- Wulyani, A. N. (2017). *Professional development of English language teachers in Malang, Indonesia: Institutional and individual perspectives* [Unpublished PhD thesis, Victoria University of Wellington].
- Wyant, B. R., & Lockwood, B. (2018). Transformative learning, higher order thinking, and the inside-out prison exchange program. *Journal of Correctional Education*, 69(3), 49-67. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.2307/26864112>.
- Yin, R. K. (2015). *Case study research: Design and methods* (5th ed.). SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Zein, S. (2022). English language teacher education in Indonesia: Providers, policies, innovations, and future directions. In Khine, M. S., & Liu, Y. (Eds.), *Handbook of Research on Teacher Education* (pp. 465-488). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-9785-2_23.