

Cakrawala Pendidikan

Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan

Vol. 42 No. 1, February 2023, pp.189-197 https://journal.uny.ac.id/index.php/cp/issue/view/2422 DOI: http://doi.org/ 10.21831/cp.v42i1.53910

Effects of online learning on responsibility character of junior high school students in Yogyakarta

Saliman*, Agustina Tri Wijayanti, Yumi Hartati

Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Indonesia *Corresponding Author: salimanjaper@uny.ac.id

ABSTRACT

This study aims to confirm the results of online learning for junior high school students in Yogyakarta and to clarify the impact of online learning on the development of character values. This study uses a mixed method that combines qualitative and quantitative methods. The research data were obtained by distributing questionnaires to 44 students in 249 public schools. The data collected were tabulated and analyzed to determine the effects of online learning on the responsibility character of junior high school students in Yogyakarta. The results show that the R-squared value of 0.107 impacts liabilities of 10.7 so the remaining 89.3 liabilities are influenced by other variables not included in this survey model. Hypothesis test proves that t count 2,590 > t-table 1,6725 counts and significance 0.012 < 0 > F-table 4.01 and significance 4.012 < 0 > F-table 4.012 < 0 > F-table

Keywords: characteristics of online learning; a sense of responsibility; junior high school

Article history

Received:Revised:Accepted:Published:4 August 202228 October 202214 January 20234 February 2023

Citation (APA Style): Saliman. S., Wijayanti, A.T., & Hartati, Y. (2023). Effects of online learning on responsibility character of junior high school students in Yogyakarta. *Cakrawala Pendidikan: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan, 42*(1), 189-197. DOI: http://doi.org/ 10.21831/cp.v42i1.53910

INTRODUCTION

The Covid-19 pandemic that has occurred around the world has caused governments to set different policies. One of the guidelines used is physical distancing or maintaining a body distance between individuals. Learning activities in schools have also shifted to face-to-face learning and online learning according to the joint decision of the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology (2020) regarding guidelines for implementing learning during the spread of the new virus. This means that all learning activities are carried out online (in the network). This principle is understood as an effort to achieve learning outcomes at all levels of education so that the learning process continues. Online learning is an option because of its flexible nature, which allows participants to access information and research resources anywhere and anytime (Haryati & Sukarno, 2021). Online learning is a learning system that uses a platform that can support the teaching and learning process that takes place regardless of distance, not face to face. This is an option because of its flexible nature which allows students to access information and learning resources without the limitations of space and time (Garad et al., 2021). The purpose of online learning is to provide quality learning services in a wide and open network and attract more interest in learning spaces (Sofyana & Abdul, 2019).

For example, useful applications for educational and learning activities include WhatsApp, google meet, quiz, zoom, web blog, Edmodo, and more (Putri et al., 2022). The government also has a role to play in overcoming inequality in learning activities during the COVID-19 pandemic. According to the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia (Ministry of Education and Culture, 2020), there are 11 platforms or applications that students can access to study at home (1) Ikand, (2) our table (3) Google for Education. (4) Indonesian (5) Intellectual

Class (6) Microsoft Office 365 (7) Kipper School (8) staff room (9) your school (10) Zenius, and (11) Cisco Webex.

Online learning is one of the adaptive ways of implementing learning in schools. The future of online learning will be one of the breakthroughs in the world of education. This is proven by interactive, interesting, and fun learning and will soon replace books in the form of touchscreen tablets (Koranteng et al., 2019). When learning takes place online, students are responsible for managing content, managing learning, setting the pace of learning, increasing their time, selecting media to achieve their learning goals, and controlling access to learning methods and materials. So, even though learning takes place online, high school students can process the information presented to them appropriately (Kusaeri et al., 2018).

Learning that takes place online through various learning platforms, including WhatsApp groups, Google Classroom, Google Meet, etc (Mustofa et al., 2019) cannot be directly supervised by the teacher during learning, so discipline, integrity, and social relations are very important. the formation of students' personalities such as instilling character values takes place in face-to-face classes at schools (Fahrannisa et al., 2022; Haryati et al., 2021; Tratnik et al., 2019). Meanwhile, during the pandemic, the learning process shifted to virtual learning (Sangsawang, 2020).

This shift from face-to-face learning to online learning creates many obstacles in the implementation of character values. Character values conveyed through teacher examples are difficult to realize in virtual learning because there are no face-to-face meetings (Khadijah et al., 2021). The internalization of character values in virtual learning needs serious attention because it has an impact on the development of character values (Bugarso et al., 2021; Jerome & Kisby, 2022) cannot be effective without the three aspects of action and must be implemented systematically and continuously.

Daniel (2007) learns online because we know that 80% of a person's success in society is determined by their emotional intelligence (EQ) and only 20% by their brain intelligence. In terms, the essence of a character is not only to understand and inform students. But you have to obey. Gunarto (2004) explains that character is the value of human behavior related to God Almighty, oneself, fellow human beings, environment, and nationality, which is expressed in thoughts, attitudes, feelings, words, and normative actions. Religion, culture, and national values which are renewed in daily life become an inherent habit, so when learning is done online, we see the development of character values.

The purpose of this study was to obtain results about the application of online learning methods in junior high schools and the effect of online learning on the introduction of the value of the character of responsibility in schools. This study used a mixed method of distributing questionnaires to teachers in 249 schools in Yogyakarta. There is something new in this research. namely the process of implementing online learning and its impact on the cultivation of responsible character values. This novelty can be very useful as a guide for applying character statistics in an online learning environment.

METHOD

This research combines qualitative and quantitative methods. Primary data for this study were obtained by distributing questionnaires to 249 secondary school teachers in Yogyakarta. The type of applied research is the research method. The researcher took a sample of the population and used a questionnaire as a tool to collect data on the impact of online learning on the naming of responsible personality values. The total population of 249 public school subjects was calculated using the Slovin formula. The formula is (1).

$$n = N / (1 + N(e)2)$$
(1)

n = total sample, N = total population, e = error bar.

The survey sample was determined from 44 schools using a cluster sample. The number of samples is determined as follows. Up to 10 in Bantul, 12 in Gunung Kidul, 7 in Kulon Progo, 11 in Sleman and 3 in Yogyakarta City.

FINDING AND DISCUSSION

Findings

This study there are two variables, namely social studies learning (X1) and character responsibility (Y). Researchers obtained data by distributing social studies learning questionnaires and planting the value of the character of responsibility with a total of 20 statements for each variable distributed to 44 social studies teachers for class VIII.

IPS Learning Variables

Based on the results of research through a questionnaire consisting of 20 statements with the number of respondents as many as 44 people. Each question is measured using four alternative answers where the highest score is 4 and the lowest score is 1 so that the expected score is obtained minimum $20 \, (1x20)$ and maximum expected score of $80 \, (4x20)$.

Based on the analyzed data, teachers have different opinions about the process of implementing online learning. These results summarize our findings about the process of implementing online learning. Regarding the implementation of online learning in secondary schools, the teacher said: with everyday life. From the teacher's explanation about the implementation of online learning in secondary schools, the online learning process does not only use learning methods, but the learning methods used are by the material presented and how students do it at school. time. The information provided by the teacher about the implementation of online learning in SMP Yogyakarta is a general description of online learning activities in schools. The researcher's findings show that online learning at SMP Yogyakarta is 13.79% bad, 36.2% good, and 50% very good.

As a result of a 20-sentence questionnaire survey targeting 44 grade 8 teachers, each question is evaluated on a 4-point scale with a maximum score of 4 and a minimum score of 1. The minimum expected score is 20 (1x20), and the maximum score is 80 (4x20). Therefore, the computational length = 15. If the significance value of the Kolmogorov-Smirnov test is 0.05, then it is declared to be normally distributed and vice versa. If the Kolmogorov-Smirnov test result is 0.05, it is declared abnormal. The results of the data above, the Kolmogorov-Smirnov z-score for the social studies learning variable and the responsibility variable is 0.597 > 0.05. This value proves that the assumption of normality is met in this study so that the data entered in the study is normally distributed.

Table 1. Test Result of normality Kolmogorov-Smirnov

		Unstandardized Residual	
N		44	
Normal Parameters ^a	mean	.0000000	
	Std. Deviation	5.82227515	
Most Extreme	Absolute	.101	
Differences	Positive	.058	
	negative	101	
Kolmogorov-Smirnov Z		.768	
asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)		.597	
a. Test distribution is Normal.			

From the results of the data above (Table 1), the Kolmogorov-Smirnov Z value of the learning variable is obtained IPS and responsibility variable of 0.597 > 0.05. This value proves the assumption normality in this study has been fulfilled so that the data contained in the research have a normal distribution.

This multicollinearity test is intended to test whether a regression model detects a correlation (independent) between independent variables. The correlation between the independent variables should be small. The smaller the correlation between the independent variables, the better the

regression model used. If the tolerance is <0>10, multicollinearity occurs. Tolerance > 0.10 and VIF < recommended 10, there is no multicollinearity.

Table 2. Test result multicollinearity

Variable	Tolerance	VIF	Information
Social Studies Learning against responsibility answer	1.000	1.000	Non-Multicollinearity

From the results of the analysis presented in Table 2 it can be seen that for social studies learning tolerance value and responsibility of 1.0 > 0.1 with a value VIF of 1.0 < 10 means that there are no symptoms of multicollinearity.

The purpose of the heteroscedasticity test is to test whether there is an inequality of variance from the residuals of one observation to another in a regression model. The decision criterion is that there is no heteroscedasticity if the significance value is > 0.05, but when the significance value is < 0.05. A value of 0.05 produces heteroscedasticity.

From the formula above, it can be concluded that the online learning and responsibility variables have a positive value. This means that there is a one-way effect. That is, when variable online learning increases, the results tend to increase variable responsibility. Increase. The value of the regression equation has the following meanings: a) The constant of 54.044 indicates that the constant of the responsibility variable is predicted by changes in the online learning variable, so that better social studies learning leads to a better responsibility variable; b) The regression coefficient b1 of 0.194 points means that the Y variable increases by 54.044 points for every 1-point increase in the online learning variable.

Table 3. Test result of Partial X to Y

t count	t table	Significance	Note:
2.590	1.6725	0.012 0.03	5 Significant

^{*}Source: Data processed, 2021

From Table 3, it can be seen that t count 2.590 > t table 1.6725 with a significance value of 0.012 < 0.050. Therefore, it can be concluded that Ho is rejected and Ha is accepted, thus partial online learning has a large effect on poor responses.

Table 4. Test result of simultaneous X to Y

F count	F table	Significance	Note
6.709	4.01	0.012	0.050 Significant

^{*}Source: Data processed, 2021

From Table 4, it can be seen that the calculated F is 6.709 > F table is 4.01 and the significance value is 0.012 < 0.012. 0.050. From this, we can conclude that Ho is rejected, and Ha is accepted, and social studies affect the answers poorly with concurrent learning.

Regression Analysis Simple linear regression test analysis was performed using SPSS version 16.0 whose aim is to measure the effect of social studies learning variables on responsibility. The results of the simple linear regression analysis of this study can be seen in the Table 5 below.

From the equation above, it can be concluded that the value of social studies and responsibility learning variables has a positive value, meaning that there is a unidirectional effect, that is, if the social studies learning variable increases, the results can increase the responsibility variable. The values of the regression equation have the following meanings: a) A constant of 54.404 shows that the constant variable of responsibility is predicted by changes in the social studies learning variable so that responsibility will be good if social studies learning is done better; b) The regression coefficient b1 of 0.194 points means that every time there is an increase in the

IPS learning variable by 1 point, it will increase the Y variable by 54.404 points; c) " μ " is another factor outside the research design.

Table 5. The results of the regression test on the effect of social studies learning on

responsibility

	e o i i si	Coefficier	nts ^a			
		Unstandar Coefficien		Standardized Coefficients		
Mo	odel	В	Std. Error	Beta	T	Sig.
1	(Constant)	54.404	4.569		11.907	.000
	IPS learning	.194	.075	.327	2.590	.012

Analysis of the coefficient of determination

The coefficient of determination aims to find out what percentage of influence is given by the independent variable, namely social studies learning (X) on the dependent variable, namely responsibility (Y).

Table 6. Test results for the coefficient of determination

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.327ª	.107	.091	5.87403

Based on the output presented in table 6, it is known that the R Square value is 0.107, meaning that the effect of social studies learning on responsibility is 10.7 so that the remaining 89.3 responsibilities are influenced by other variables that are not included in this research model.

Hypothesis testing

Partial test (t test)

Partial hypothesis testing the t test aims to find out whether or not there is a partial (self) effect given by the independent variable, namely social studies learning (X) on the dependent variable, namely responsibility (Y), with the following criteria, 1) If the sig value < 0.05 or t count > t table then the null hypothesis (Ho) is rejected and the alternative hypothesis (Ha) is accepted; 2) If the sig value > 0.05 or t count <t table then the null hypothesis (Ho) is accepted and the alternative hypothesis (Ha) is rejected

Table 7. Partial Test Results X against Y

tcount	ttable	Significance	Note
2,590	1,6725	0,012 0,05	Significant

^{*}Source: processed data, 2021

From table 7 can be seen that toount is 2.590 > ttable 1.6725 and a significance value of 0.012 < 0.050. So, it can be concluded that Ho is rejected and Ha is accepted, so that partially social studies learning has a significant effect on responsibility.

Simultaneous Test (Test F)

The F test aims to determine whether or not there is a simultaneous or joint effect given the independent variable, namely social studies learning (X) on the dependent variable, namely responsibility (Y), with the provisions

Ho: There is no significant effect of social studies learning on responsibility

Ha: There is a significant effect of social studies learning on responsibility

F Test Criteria

If the sig value <0.05 or F count > F table, then the null hypothesis (Ho) is rejected and the alternative hypothesis (Ha) is accepted

If the sig value > 0.05 or F count <F table then the null hypothesis (Ho) is accepted and the alternative hypothesis (Ha) is rejected.

Table 8. Simultaneous Test Results X against Y

Fcount	Ftable	Significance		Note
6.709	4.01	0.012	0.050	Significant

From table 8, it can be seen that Fcount is 6.709 > Ftable 4.01 and a significance value of 0.012 < 0.050. So it can be concluded that Ho is rejected and Ha is accepted, so that social studies learning simultaneously influences responsibility.

Discussion

The concept of learning according to Corey is a process in which a person's environment is deliberately managed in such a way as to enable him to participate in a certain behavior under certain conditions or produce a response to a situation63. Learning theory that emphasizes a change in student behavior is behavioristic. Behavioristic learning theory is a psychological theory that focuses on real behavior (Koranteng et al., 2019). This theory sees learning as a change in behavior. A person is considered to be learning when he is able to show changes in his behavior for the better. The behavioristic view recognizes the importance of input or input in the form of a stimulus and output or output in the form of a response (Balakrishnan & Thambu, 2017).

In this regard, regarding the implementation of social studies learning in junior high school, the social studies teacher for class VIII said that: "For subjects that are social case solving in nature, I usually use contextual teaching and learning, which I describe and then we equate it with their daily activities or how they deal with situations in their daily life. Sometimes I point them out, sometimes if they are excited, I also tell them to tell stories". Based on the information submitted by the social studies teacher for grade VIII regarding the implementation of social studies learning in junior high schools, it can be understood that the social studies learning process does not just use learning methods, but the learning methods used are in accordance with the material to be delivered and what was the state of the students at that time. The information conveyed by the social studies teacher for class VIII about the implementation of social studies learning at junior high schools in Yogyakarta, is a general description of social studies learning activities at that school. According to the results of research conducted by researchers, social studies learning in junior high schools in Yogyakarta is included in the bad category at 13.79%, good at 36.2% and very good at 50%.

Character responsibilities owned by students in class VIII

Kohut (Ehrlich, 2000) argues that responsibility is a process in which a person thinks about the condition of another person as if he were in that other person's condition. Then, Kohut strengthened this definition by saying that responsibility is the ability to think objectively about the deepest life of other people. According to Daniel (2007) responsibility is meant by understanding the feelings and problems of other people and thinking from their point of view, respecting the differences in people's feelings about various things, cultivating relationships with mutual trust and also aligning oneself with various kinds of people. In this regard, the social studies teacher for grade VIII at a junior high school in Yogyakarta said that "Students come from different regions. There are also some from outside Java. So, indirectly it also affects how they upload, their character, the way they interact. Based on this statement, it can be understood that students come from different regions. With different customs, cultures, families and characters, it is very important for students to have a responsible attitude within themselves. The results of research conducted by researchers stated that 25.86% of students had good responsibility and 74.13% had very good responsibility.

Results study show that there is which influence positive which the significance of social studies learning on responsibility, research regression analysis proves the score of R Square as big as 0.107 which means the influence of learning online the value of the character of responsibility

is 10.7 so the rest is 89.3 responsibility influenced by variable other which no enter in the model study this. Based on the results of this study, it can be seen the effect of online learning on great responsibility for the responsibilities of students is expected process of learning online can always be held with maximum.

The information shared by the social studies teacher for class VIII about the implementation of online learning in junior high schools understands that the online learning process does not only use learning methods but also the theory conveyed and the learning used according to the student's situation. To do at that time. The information provided by Teacher VIII about the implementation of online learning in secondary schools in Yogyakarta is an overview of social studies learning activities in schools. Based on a survey conducted by researchers, online learning in junior high schools in Yogyakarta is in the pretty good category of 13.79%, good 36.2%, and very good 50%.

The influence of social studies learning on the formation of character

Responsibilities of Grade VIII Students of Middle Schools in Yogyakarta. The results showed that there was a significant positive influence on social studies learning on responsibility. included in this research model. Based on the results of this study, it can be seen that the effect of social studies learning on great responsibility towards students' responsibilities is that it is hoped that the social studies learning process can always be carried out optimally.

The same result was stated by Alifha Nurfida in the International Journal of Pedagogy of Social Studies entitled "Cultivating an Attitude of Student Responsibility Using the Role Model Method in Social Studies Learning (Classroom Action Research at SMP 44 Bandung in Class VII A) Social Science Education study program, Faculty of Education Indonesian University of Education Social Sciences, vol 1, no 1. The results of his research showed that the average percentage of students' responsible attitudes in the first cycle of the study reached 48.8. In the second cycle it reached 72.5%, and in the third cycle it reached 85%.

Paul Suparno (Kesäläinen et al., 2022), in social studies learning there are three intelligences that have a close attachment to social studies learning at school, one of which is interpersonal intelligence. This intelligence is the ability to understand the intentions, and motivations, and feelings of others. sensitive to other people's facial expressions, voices and body movements, and he is able to respond effectively in communication. This interpersonal intelligence is also able to enter into other people, understand the world of other people, understand the views, attitudes of other people, and generally can lead groups. In addition, interpersonal intelligence is an individual's ability to establish relationships with other people. Individuals who have this intelligence have the ability to perceive differences in the moods, goals, motivations, and feelings of other people. It can be said that responsibility is a form of interpersonal intelligence. Someone has the ability to be responsible for others.

CONCLUSION

Through the implementation of online learning in junior high schools in Yogyakarta, it is explained that the online learning process is not only an explanation of the material in lectures but also the use of interactive methods and media by teachers through quizzes, google forms, etc. I can do it. Thus, the application develops the material to be delivered and what is the condition of the students at that time. Based on the survey results, online learning in junior high schools in Yogyakarta is classified as good at 13.79%, good at 36.2%, and very good at 50%.

Junior high school students in Yogyakarta have different characteristics and personalities. According to the teacher, this is due to differences in regional and family backgrounds. The survey results show that half of Yogyakarta's secondary school students are at a good level, with 25.86% and 74.13% at a very good level.

Based on the results of the statistical regression analysis, it is known that the R-squared value of 0.107 means the effect of online learning on responsibility is 10.7, so the remaining 89.3 responsibilities are subject to other variables that are not included in the research model. The hypothesis test proves that the t count is 2.590 > the t table value is 1.6725 and 0.012 < 0 > the

significance value of the F table is 4.01 and the significance score is 0.012 < 0.012. 0.050. From this, we can conclude that Ho is rejected, and Ha is accepted.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Awards are given to those who have provided guidance, support, and convenience.

REFERENCES

- Balakrishnan, V., & Thambu, N. (2017). Using moral and ethical stories to inculcate values among preschoolers. *International Journal for Studies on Children, Women, Elderly And Disabled*, 2(1978), 8–15. https://umexpert.um.edu.my/file/publication/00007397_151297_62669.pdf
- Bugarso, J. M. S., Cabantugan, R. E., Tapiculin, Q. D., & Malaco, A. C. (2021). Students' learning experiences and preference in performing science experiments using hands-on and virtual laboratory. *Indonesian Journal of Teaching in Science*, 1(2), 147–152. https://doi.org/10.17509/ijotis.v1i2.41122
- Daniel, N. (2007). Implementation education character. Salemba Jaya.
- Ehrlich, T. (2000). Civic responsibility and higher education (American council on education oryx press series on higher Ed) (The ACE series on higher education). Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Fahrannisa, A. L., Muktiarni, M., & Jonah Mupita. (2022). The use of short stories as learning media for character education for elementary school students during the Covid-19 pandemic. *Indonesian Journal of Multidiciplinary Research*, 2(2). https://doi.org/https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.17509/ijomr.v2i2.38678
- Garad, A., Al-Ansi, A. M., & Qamari, I. N. (2021). The role of e-learning infrastructure and cognitive competence in distance learning effectiveness during the covid-19 pandemic. *Jurnal Cakrawala Pendidikan*, 40(1), 81–91. https://doi.org/10.21831/cp.v40i1.33474
- Gunarto. (2004). Curriculum concept in Indonesian. Rosda Creation Bandung.
- Haryati, S., & Sukarno, S. (2021). Inovasi pembelajaran daring di era pandemi Covid-19. *Indonesian Journal of Education and Learning*, 4(2), 479. https://doi.org/10.31002/ijel.v4i2.3717
- Haryati, S., Sukarno, S., & Purwanto, S. (2021). Implementation of online education during the global Covid-19 pandemic: Prospects and challenges. *Jurnal Cakrawala Pendidikan*, 40(3), 604–612. https://doi.org/10.21831/cp.v40i3.42646
- Jerome, L., & Kisby, B. (2022). Lessons in character education: incorporating neoliberal learning in classroom resources. *Critical Studies in Education*, 63(2), 245–260. https://doi.org/10.1080/17508487.2020.1733037
- Kesäläinen, J., Suhonen, E., Alijoki, A., & Sajaniemi, N. (2022). Children's play behaviour, cognitive skills and vocabulary in integrated early childhood special education groups. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 26(3), 284–300. https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2019.1651410
- Khadijah, K., Suciati, I., Khaerani, K., Manaf, A., & Sutamrin, S. (2021). Schools' character education values and students' mathematics learning achievement: A meta-analysis. *Jurnal Cakrawala Pendidikan*, 40(3), 670–683. https://doi.org/10.21831/cp.v40i3.39924
- Koranteng, F. N., Wiafe, I., & Kuada, E. (2019). An empirical study of the relationship between social networking sites and students' engagement in higher education. *Journal of Educational Computing Research*, 57(5), 1131–1159. https://doi.org/10.1177/0735633118787528
- Kusaeri, K., Aditomo, A., Ridho, A., & Fuad, A. Z. (2018). Socioeconomic status, parental involvement in learning and student' mathematics achievement in Indonesian senior high school. *Jurnal Cakrawala Pendidikan*, 37(3), 333–344. https://doi.org/10.21831/cp.v38i3.21100
- Ministry of Education and Culture. (2020). Freedom of learning policy in determining student graduation and implementation of PPDB 2020/2021 no. 1 the year 2020.
- Mustofa, M. I., Chodzirin, M., Sayekti, L., & Fauzan, R. (2019). Formulasi model perkuliahan daring sebagai upaya menekan disparitas kualitas perguruan tinggi. *Walisongo Journal of*

- Information Technology, 1(2), 151. https://doi.org/10.21580/wjit.2019.1.2.4067
- Putri, A., Setiawati, Y., Shieh, Y.-T., & Lin, S.-H. (2022). High-risk internet addiction in adolescents during pandemic Covid-19 and parents' role. *Jurnal Berkala Epidemiologi*, 10(1), 11. https://doi.org/10.20473/jbe.V10I12022.11-20
- Sangsawang, T. (2020). An instructional design for online learning in vocational education according to a self-regulated learning framework for problem solving during the Covid-19 crisis. *Indonesian Journal of Science and Technology*, 5(2), 283–198. https://doi.org/10.17509/ijost.v5i2.24702
- Sofyana, & Abdul. (2019). Learning online combination based Whatsapp on class employees of the informatics engineering study program, PGRI Madiun university. *National Journal of* 2014.
- Tratnik, A., Urh, M., & Jereb, E. (2019). Student satisfaction with an online and a face-to-face Business English course in a higher education context. *Innovations in Education and Teaching International*, 56(1), 36–45. https://doi.org/10.1080/14703297.2017.1374875